

**United Nations
Department of Economic and Social Affairs**

**Division for Public Administration and
Development Management**

**Human Resources for Effective Public
Administration in a Globalized World**



United Nations, 2005

Notes

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Secretariat of the United Nations concerning the legal status of any country , territory, city or area, or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

The designations 'developed' and 'developing' economies are intended for statistical convenience and do not necessarily imply a judgement about the stage reached by a particular country or area in the development process.

The term "country" as used in the text of this publication also refers, as appropriate, to territories or areas.

The term "dollar" normally refers to the United States dollar (\$)

The views expressed are those of the individual authors and do not imply any expression of opinion on the part of the United Nations.

Enquiries concerning this publication may be directed to:

Mr. Guido Bertucci
Director
Division for Public administration and
Development Management
Department of Economic and Social Affairs
United Nations, New York, NY 10017, USA
Fax: (212) 963-9681

MISSION STATEMENT

The Department of Economic and Social Affairs of the United Nations Secretariat is a vital interface between global policies in the economic, social and environmental spheres and national action. The Department works in three main interlinked areas: (i) it compiles, generates and analyses a wide range of economic, social and environmental data and information on which Member States of the United Nations draw to review common problems and to take stock of policy options; (ii) it facilitates the negotiations of Member States in many intergovernmental bodies on joint courses of action to address ongoing or emerging global challenges; and (iii) it advises interested Governments on the ways and means of translating policy frameworks developed in United Nations conferences and summits into programmes at the country level and, through technical assistance, helps build national capacities.

FOREWORD

Developing an effective, competent and forward looking public service as well as strong but lean State institutions is one of the greatest challenges nations around the world face today. It is particularly crucial in developing countries as good governance is one of the most important factors, if not the most important factor, for the success of any development effort. The Millennium Declaration and other United Nations conferences have highlighted the central role of effective governance in increasing the access of services to all citizens, enforcing human rights legislation, enhancing the participation of women in the development process, protecting the quality of the environment and facilitating economic growth. How the public sector is structured, how it operates and the role it performs within a country plays an important part in economic and social progress. In particular, the quality of government leadership has a great impact on the quality of governance, which in turn affects the level of development of a region.

Reforming public sector in both developed and developing countries is not an easy task and many are the difficulties to be overcome. In the past twenty years a number of national and international forces have contributed to significantly changing the role of the state, which has resulted in the need for new skills, attitudes and behaviours among public officials at all levels. In fact, the core competencies for the public sector of the 21st century differ in many ways from the past, especially as the demands placed on public servants, in terms of skills, knowledge and competency, are rapidly increasing and becoming more complex. Top government leaders in developing countries are still facing old challenges, while at the same time they also have to address new ones, which have resulted from the many social, economic and political changes sweeping throughout the world.

The increasing complexity of both policy-making and administrative processes, as well as the erosion of human resources capacity to carry out those functions, is making it difficult for many Member States to implement national goals and strategies to reduce poverty and to promote sustainable human development, as emphasized in the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). In view of the above, the United Nations Committee of Experts in Public Administration (UNCEPA) stressed at its First Meeting in 2002 that the challenge of good governance involves capacity-building through people and institutions. Through their knowledge, know-how and skills, people are at the heart of the performance of the state since it is people who provide services, promote innovations and carry out reforms. At its Second Meeting in April 2003, the Committee emphasized that human resources capacity is critical to the quality of public administration and at its Third Meeting in April 2004 it recommended that Member States should adopt a holistic national strategy to strengthen the management of human capital in the public sector. In doing so, they should revisit core values and principles as outlined in national civil service legislation and charters, examine the coherence of their human resources management institutional framework, review recruitment and promotion strategies and incentives, institutionalize workforce planning, and ensure the representation of marginalized social groups.

In light of the above, and with a view to exploring some of the mentioned challenges, an Ad Hoc Expert Group Meeting on “Unlocking the Human Potential for Public Sector Performance” was organized in May 2004 by the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA) in collaboration with the European University Institute located in Florence, Italy. The Meeting greatly benefited from synergies drawn from cooperation with the International Personnel Management Association IPMA-HR which organized its 29th International Symposium on Public Personnel Management in Florence, Italy from 9 to 13 May 2004.

The overall objective of the Expert Group Meeting was to provide a platform for senior government officials and experts to present and discuss the role of human capital in revitalizing public administration at the national level, with particular focus on developing countries and transition economies. About 25 world-wide experts took part in this event and participated in constructive knowledge sharing.

The purpose of this publication is to provide a concise overview of the main themes and challenges addressed during the meeting and to outline some of the messages which have resulted from two days of intense discussions. Thus, this publication explores and analyzes key emerging issues concerning human resources in the public sector with a particular emphasis on developing countries. Each of the authors, writing in their personal capacity, outlines the critical role that effective human resources in the public sector plays in enhancing the quality of a democracy. Ultimately, the ability of government to provide services effectively and efficiently depends upon a competent cadre of civil servants. Good government requires good people.

In view of the above, the report is divided into three parts. Part One is devoted to the changing role of the state and the need for more open, participatory and effective governments whereas Part Two looks at leadership capacity development strategies in the public service. Part Three highlights key challenges and trends in human resources management, including recruitment and selection of public workers; diversity and public sector performance, as well as the impact of HIV/AIDS on public sector human resources in Africa.

While we will not be able to cover in-depth all of the contributions that were made, I hope that this publication may raise new important questions on how human resources competencies, skills and practices in the public sector can be improved to better serve the needs of citizens in the XXI century.

Guido Bertucci, Director

Division for Public Administration and Development Management
Department of Economic and Social Affairs
United Nations

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This publication is the result of the Ad Hoc Expert Group Meeting on “Unlocking the Human Potential for Public Sector Performance”, which was held in Florence from 6 to 8 May 2004 and of the contributions made by the various authors of this report. The Meeting was attended by 25 world-wide known experts in human resources and elicited intense discussions and exchange of ideas on a very timely and relevant topic. The Meeting, which was organized under the leadership of Mr. Guido Bertucci, Director of the Division for Public Administration and Development Management, was hosted by the European University Institute (EUI) to which we wish to extend our gratitude for its support and collaboration. In particular, we wish to thank the President of the EUI, Mr. Yves Meny, for his highly instructive opening remarks. The Meeting also benefited from the partnership with the International Public Management Association – Human Resources. Special mention goes to its President Bob Lavigna; to its Executive Director Neil Reichenberg, and to Lynda Von Bargaen, President Elect.

This publication was prepared by the Division for Public Administration and Development Management of the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs. Adriana Alberti is editor of the entire report and contributor. All the participants and speakers at the Meeting provided invaluable information, knowledge and ideas that are incorporated in this publication.

We wish to thank the experts that took part in the Ad Hoc Expert Group Meeting, including: Dr. Luis F. Aguilar, General Director, Gerencia Pública s.c., Mexico; Mr. Ahmed Abdullatif Al-Bahar, Assistant Under-Secretary for Civil Service Affairs, Bahrain; Ms. Randhir Auluck, Research Fellow, Centre for Management and Policy Studies (Cabinet Office); Ms. Lynda von Bargaen, IPMA-HR President Elect, Director of Personnel Management, Montgomery College; H.E. Jocelyne Bourgon, Ambassador of Canada to the OECD; Ms. Karina Constantino-David, Chairperson, Philippine Civil Service Commission, Manila, the Philippines; Mr. Jim Ewanovich, Ex-Assistant Commissioner, Chief Human Resource Officer, Royal Canadian Mounted Police, Ottawa, Canada; Mr. Robert Lavigna, President, IPMA-HR, Senior Manager for Client Services, CPS Human Resource Services; Mr. Steve Nelson, Director, Office of Policy and Evaluation Merit Systems and Protection Board- OPM; United States; Mr. Joao Paulo Peixoto, former Chief Technical Adviser, Reforpa Project, UNDESA, Angola; Flávio Marcílio Rabelo, Escola de Administração de Empresas de São Paulo, Fundação Getúlio Vargas, Brazil; Ms. Odette Ramsingh, Deputy Director of Labour Relations and General Management, Public Service Commission, Pretoria, South Africa; Mr. Neil Reichenberg, Executive Director, International Public Management Association for Human Resources (IPMA-HR); Ms. Margaret Richardson, Director, Corporate Services Personnel Department, Office of the Chief Personnel Officer, Trinidad and Tobago; Ms. Rafiah Salim, Executive Director, International Centre for Leadership in Finance, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia; Mr. Mohamed Sall-Sao, Adviser, UNDP, Dakar, Senegal; Ms. Margaret Saner, Acting Director Centre for Management and Policy Studies, Berkshire, United Kingdom; Ms. Eve Thompson, Director a.i., United Nations University, Leadership Academy, Amman, Jordan; Mr. Rostyslav Tronenko, Director, Personnel Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Kiev, Ukraine. Feroza Ahsan Razzaq, Faculty Member at Pakistan Administrative Staff College, Lahore, Pakistan, could not attend the Meeting, but provided a substantive paper which is included in

this publication. The United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA) was represented by Mr. Guido Bertucci, Director, Division for Public Administration and Development Management (DPADM), Mr. John-Mary Kauzya, Chief, Governance and Public Administration Branch (GPAB), DPADM; Mr. Kristinn Helgason, Adviser, GPAB, DPADM, and Adriana Alberti, Chief Technical Adviser, Programme for Innovation in Public Administration in the Mediterranean Region, DPADM.

The views expressed in this report are not necessarily those of the United Nations. No part of this publication may be reproduced without prior permission from the United Nations.

CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i>	<i>iv</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>vi</i>
<i>Introduction</i>	1

PART ONE: THE CHANGING ROLE OF THE STATE AND PUBLIC SECTOR PERFORMANCE 8

1. The changing role of the State in a globalizing world and the need for a more open, participatory, and effective government by Adriana Alberti and Guido Bertucci.....	9
1.1. Introduction	9
1.2. Worldwide trends in public administration transformation.....	9
1.3. The growing demand for a more open, participatory and efficient government.....	11
2. Challenges and trends in human capital management by Jocelyne Bourgon	13
2.1. Introduction	13
2.2. A search for balance	14
2.3. "Physician Heal Thyself"	15
2.4. The knowledge and innovation imperatives	17
3. Public policy and human resource development by Luis F. Aguilar, Cristina Galíndez, Ernesto Velasco	20
3.1. Introduction	20
3.2. Capacity building and policy capacity.....	20
3.3. Human resource development for building policy capacity	23
3.4. Facing the challenges.....	27
3.5. Concluding remarks.....	34

PART TWO: LEADERSHIP CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIES IN THE PUBLIC SERVICE 37

4. Strengthening the human capacity and leadership in the public sector for achieving the Millennium Development Goals by John-Mary Kauzya	38
4.1. Introduction	38
4.2. Human resources capacity-building in the public sector.....	40
4.3. Effective leadership and good governance.....	41

5.	Promoting efficiency and accountability of senior officials by Faraq Razzaq	43
5.1.	Introduction	43
5.2.	Concepts of efficiency, accountability and senior officials.....	45
5.3.	Other conceptual issues	49
5.4.	Improving efficiency, enhancing effectiveness, achieving better performance, equity, ethics and accountability	50
5.5.	Human resources development and senior officials.....	52
5.6.	State of governance and accountability in Pakistan.....	53
5.7.	Recommendations on improving accountability and performance....	54
5.8.	Concluding remarks	60

**PART THREE: CHALLENGES AND TRENDS IN HUMAN RESOURCES
MANAGEMENT.....66**

6.	Recruitment and selection of public workers: An international compendium of modern trends and practices by Bob Lavigna and Steven W. Hays.....	67
6.1.	Introduction	67
6.2.	Precursors to successful recruitment and selection	68
6.3.	Emerging approaches to recruitment and selection	71
6.4.	The future?	77
7.	Diversity and public sector performance by Randhir Auluck	81
7.1.	Introduction	81
7.2.	Assumptions and General Comments	81
7.3.	The concept of Diversity Management	82
7.4.	Diversity, Human Resource Potential and the Civil Service.....	83
7.5.	Other Diversity and Equality Initiatives	88
7.6.	Diversity and Service Delivery	89
7.7.	Diversity Management: essential ingredients	91
8.	The impact of HIV/AIDS on public sector human resources in Africa by Odette Ramsingh and Ogochukwu I. Nzewi.....	96
8.1.	Introduction	96
8.2.	The HIV/AIDS challenge	98
8.3.	Good governance and political imperatives.....	99
8.3.	The human resource challenge	102
8.5.	Response strategies.....	109
8.6.	Employee assistance programmes (EAPs)	112
8.7.	Lessons learned from the African Experience	115
8.8.	Concluding Remarks	112

Introduction

Good government requires good people. This has always been true, but its importance to the international community has probably never been more critical than it is today. Seldom, if ever, have the world's governments confronted a more daunting set of challenges that affect every nation, regardless of geographic location, political system, social structure or level of development. Powerful forces -- globalization, economic competition that cuts across national borders, social and political upheavals, technological change, threats of terrorism, and a rapidly-changing labor market -- place enormous burdens on governments. The success of any government to respond effectively to these challenges is dictated largely by its ability to recruit and retain a talented workforce. Nations that fail to compete successfully in the global quest for talent are likely to suffer dire consequences, while those that excel will be well positioned to succeed (see Chapter VI). This challenge is coupled with the need for new skills, attitudes and behaviors among public officials at all levels in order to respond effectively to the increasing complexity and number of demands placed on governments. It is not surprising then that the core competencies for the public sector of the 21st century differ in many ways from the past.

In light of the above, Part One of this publication looks at critical issues related to the changing role of the state and public sector performance. In order to better understand the scope and nature of the changes that are affecting the way public servants operate, Chapter I examines the major transformations the State and public administration are undergoing in different parts of the world. Within a framework of extreme diversity in local conditions and situations leading to administrative change, Alberti and Bertucci identify four major worldwide trends. These include: (1) construction or re-construction of a State that operates according to the rule of law; (2) modernization of the State; (3) reconfiguration of the role of the State and (4) revitalization of democracy. Some of these trends are very specific to certain regions of the world, whereas other trends affect simultaneously a number of countries. The authors argue that strengthening democratic governance is one of the greatest challenges of our times and it is the best way to ensure that the values of freedom, equality, solidarity, environmental protection, and shared responsibility are respected. Having in place a democratic system, however, is not sufficient. Government institutions need to be based on clear and widely accepted rules; to have committed leaders and qualified people to undertake appropriate reforms in the economic and social spheres; to be able to mobilize resources and manage expenditure; and to operate in the most cost-effective way possible by making use of new information technologies. In other words, the legitimacy of a democratic regime is based in great part on the capacity of the State to deliver services that are relevant and of high quality to all sectors of the population in a society. In turn, the performance of the public sector depends on well functioning institutional structures as much as on the quality of the people who work in them. Skilled, dedicated and highly motivated public servants are essential for carrying out reforms that are effective and sustainable in the long term, as well as responsive to the changes that are occurring both at the local and global levels.

Chapter II starts by looking at the failures and successes at reforming the public service. It goes on to ask a number of critical questions: in order to "Unleash the Human Potential for Public Sector Performance" we should first ask ourselves for what purpose? What will be the role of the State in the future? How can we unleash

the potential of the State and of Public Sector Institutions to ensure a high standard of living and quality of life, to promote social justice and to provide for the peaceful enjoyment of life? Bourgon highlights and analyzes three key challenges: finding the right balance between the market and the State in a global context; the need for leadership within the civil service, and the impact of the knowledge imperative. In focusing on the issue of leadership within the public service, she examines three core principles, i.e. Rule of Law, the Merit Principle and Due Process and advocates for a revision of their definition in order to ensure that they are responding to the current needs of an effective and citizen-oriented public service. With reference to the knowledge and innovation imperatives in the public sector, Bourgon underlines that when the assets of an organization become intellectual, the old management model starts to break down. The structures of authority are changing. The power of the office must now co-exist with the power of ideas, the power to innovate, and the power to discover new and better ways to fulfil the mission of the State. The critical question is whether the Public Service will be able to adapt to the “knowledge imperative” and to encourage innovation. Failure to transform bureaucratic organizations into “intelligent” and “learning” organizations, able to explore and find new and better ways of achieving their mission, might signal their declining relevance in the future. As Razzaq strongly emphasizes in Chapter IV, in these challenging times the development of human capital is not a luxury or a fancy term, but it is indeed a prerequisite for a functioning government.

Chapter III examines a critical issue related to one of the most important functions of governments, i.e. policy-making. Aguilar, Galíndez and Velasco focus on the *development* of human resources to increase *policy capacity* in the public sector. In doing so, they advance three arguments: first, that developing policy capacity demands focusing on the individual’s competencies and that such *people-oriented* approach is a crucial factor for achieving successful reforms. Second, that conventional means for developing competencies, i.e. traditional training and development methods, are not enough to adapt present policy capacities to the demands of ever changing environments. Thirdly, that human resource development for building policy capacity requires action in at least three interrelated areas: the internal practices regarding the management of the human and intellectual capital of public organizations, the institutional frameworks under which the different activities of the policy cycle are performed, and the responsibilities that national institutes or schools of public administrations have in supporting an adequate relationship between demand and supply of competencies in the public sector. This Chapter is divided into four main parts. First, it analyzes the meaning of policy capacity and the main stages of the policy cycle. Second, it examines the relationship between human resource development and policy competencies. Third, it makes suggestions on how to respond to the challenges of human resource development for capacity building whereas the fourth section wraps up the main findings of the paper and provides some concluding remarks on the subject-matter. The authors maintain that in many countries around the world policy weakness can be attributed to “knowledge gaps and information problems” in the public service. In fact, they argue that policy-making is a knowledge intensive business. Therefore, even the most competent personnel cannot develop well-informed policies if they do not have access to sufficient data, methods and analytical tools. From this perspective, knowledge is a resource that has to be preserved and developed in order to ensure that the public sector becomes a “learning organization”. HRD has to ensure that public officials are “intelligent” consumers of data and expert advice, that is, being able to understand, criticize and use scientific evidence and benchmarking studies. They point out that senior officials should have the following competencies (defined as overall knowledge

and skills necessary throughout the entire policy process): forward-looking and outward looking; expert thinking; awareness of resource scarcity; strategic vision; innovation; transversal coherence; inclusive; monitoring; knowledge-based; lesson drawing; ethical robustness; transparency and accountability. In this respect, the main challenges for HRD in building policy capacity are three folded: first, how to ensure that, once a person has developed certain policy competencies by means of training and experience, this individual is going to reach the position where he can make the most of the referred competencies. Two, how to ensure that along the policy cycle the responsibilities, functions and activities are assigned in a way that takes advantage of each individual's best developed competencies. Finally, how to ensure that while learning and competencies are developed for the benefit of the individual, such development contributes to the achievement of the organization's public goals. An effective strategy of policy capacity building through HRD has to be based on a strategic, holistic and pluralistic (regarding the tools and methods it will recur to) approach. Aguilar, Galíndez and Velasco also argue that to be effective, HRD strategies must be accompanied by institutional arrangements that allow, encourage and reinforce policy competencies and results. In the end, such an institutional setting has to reinforce policy-makers' accountability for the decisions they take in a way that, however, does not deter them from innovating and experimenting. A very important point that they make is that there is a strong need to change the current system within many public organizations, i.e. a system that punishes errors and innovation and rewards risk-aversion and "hiding" behind the rulebook.

Part Two of this publication focuses on key issues related to leadership capacity development strategies in the public service, with a particular focus on developing countries. Accordingly, Chapter IV examines how to strengthen the human capacity and leadership in the public sector for achieving the Millennium Development Goals. As outlined by Kauzya, achieving the Millennium Development Goals requires public administration to be more engaging and receptive; more skilled and visionary; more open and transparent; more facilitating and guiding; and more just. At the national level, the quality of public sector human resources is crucial in enabling the State to provide leadership in defining a home-grown governance framework and national appropriation of the Millennium Development Goals. The State needs to provide leadership in this process through law-making, regulatory and security-related functions, as it is the ultimate guarantor of life, liberty and property. Moreover, developing strong leadership and adequate human resources in the public sector is a crucial task in order for any country to prosper and undertake programmes that are aimed at attaining socio-economic progress. The reform of the public sector in developing countries has been greatly affected by constraints in recruiting high-quality personnel. The main factors that may describe this phenomenon are as follows: a loss of pride within and credibility outside the public service; brain drain or brain trade to the private sector and to more economically advanced countries due to better salaries and career opportunities; and a gradual decay of national governance structures in stagnating countries. This Chapter examines the key issues that need to be addressed in order to promote adequate capacities among public servants and provides also an overview of the main competencies that need to be developed for effective leadership in a democratic system. One of the main messages emerging from this chapter is that given the diversity of administrative cultures and based on a variety of societal environments, each country leadership has to be open-minded and look at all the potential solutions to their own problems: the key element is to develop a sense of direction for the public service of a given country which takes into

account its history, its environment and its position in the global world in a realistic manner.

Chapter V focuses on the concept of efficiency and accountability of senior officials drawing insights from the Pakistani case and provides recommendations on how to improve the performance and accountability of public servants. Razzaq argues that Efficiency and Effectiveness are to be valued as to how these affect performance of senior officials in terms of inputs (i.e. resources expended to produce a public service), outputs (i.e. the service itself), and/or outcomes (i.e. the purpose achieved through the service). Promoting efficiency, enhancing effectiveness and improving performance of senior officers cannot be a one time exercise. The process requires unremitting efforts on a variety of fronts over a long continuous period of time. Moreover, performance cannot be improved meaningfully in isolation. Much has to be also done in changing the environment in which bureaucracy operates. It is important to recognize synergy and mutual reinforcement between efforts to improve efficiency and strengthening accountability. Better accountability enforcement can lead to greater efficiency. Likewise, greater efficiency will make compliance with the accountability process easier. Razzaq points out that there is a need to bring about changes in senior officials' behaviors and attitudes by promoting a positive relationship with citizens (enhancing practices of fairness, transparency, even handed treatment, efficiency and economy). A change in behavior would have a positive effect on the public, which in turn would improve efficiency and accountability, trust in government, as well as change the public image of public sector officials. Finally, she reminds us that senior officials do not operate in isolation. Administrative structures need to be rationalized, procedures simplified, greater delegation of powers should be encouraged, and a more service-oriented mentality should be developed within the public service.

Part Three of this publication highlights some of the key trends and challenges in human resources management, including recruitment and selection of public workers; diversity management, and the impact of HIV/AIDS on human resources management in the public sector. In Chapter VI, Lavigna and Hays argue that most of the international community is faced with a common set of human resource management (HRM) dilemmas. In the developed world, common problems are:

- The aging of the indigenous civil service, posing the immediate threat of high turnover and a lack of qualified replacements;
- A growing vacuum among "the leadership bench" – the next generation of policymakers and top civil servants who will assume critical roles in directing their governments' efforts to negotiate the troubled waters of the 21st Century;
- The changing definition of *career*, which means that employee loyalty to the organization is tenuous at best, and which discourages workers from joining government service for the long haul;
- Rapid change (e.g., in technology and economic conditions) that requires a highly fluid *skill mix* in the workforce;
- Strong competition from the private sector for the best and the brightest;
- Budget limitations that reduce compensation and financial incentives, thereby placing government at a disadvantage vis-à-vis business and industry; and
- A negative public image ("government bashing"), which translates into the widespread perception that government is no longer the employer of choice (if it ever was).

Compounding these problems are such recent developments as privatization and the outsourcing of many government jobs (a trend that reduces job security and blurs the line between public service and private enterprise), and an erosion of the benefit packages and job security that once were the most effective recruitment tools for government. In view of the above, the authors examine the precursors to successful selection and recruitment of public workers and examine the following key elements: (1) Reversing the Erosion of the Public Service Ethic; (2) HRM as Partner to Line Management; (3) Civic Culture and Tradition; (4) Managerial Systems. In relation to the image of the public sector, the authors emphasize that there is a need for *civic education* in the public schools. Each generation needs to be taught (and reminded of) the legitimate and critical role that public workers play in their lives, and the obligations and responsibilities that go with the title "civil servant."

Lavigna and Hayes look at some of the emerging approaches to recruitment and selection. They claim that since no one organization has developed a "perfect" staffing program there is no specific model that can meet all needs. Instead, every public agency can benefit from incremental changes in how it identifies and recruits, screens and hires civil servants. Public organizations can choose from among a rich list of recruitment techniques that might strengthen their competitiveness in the labor market. Governments have a wide array of options ranging from the basic to highly sophisticated. The authors describe some of the main techniques and group those under three broad (and overlapping) categories: procedural changes, process innovations, and technological applications. They look at: procedural changes; adopting flexible and appealing hiring procedures; screening applicants quickly; validating entry requirements and examinations; instituting worker-friendly personnel policies; creating more flexible job descriptions; improvements to the recruitment and selection process; human resources decentralization; aggressive outreach efforts; current employees as recruiters; and use of Technology. In their conclusions, they claim that ultimately, public organizations *must* adopt at least some of the recruitment and selection strategies described simply because to do otherwise would be self-defeating. The crises that plague public services in almost all nations are too daunting to permit complacency. The primary challenge for HR professionals is to select the reforms most suitable to their own settings, and to adapt them to local needs. There is no shortage of good ideas, and we hope there will be no shortage of will and creativity in the further implementation of HRM reform. The stakes are far too high for government not to change.

As argued by Auluck, any discussion of public sector human resources management would be incomplete without consideration of the impact of diversity issues. 'Diversity' is a complex and emotive subject and covers a vast territory of issues. Creating conditions and practices that enable and encourage all employees to produce their best is a challenge for all organizations. Creating conditions and promoting practices that enable and encourage all employees to want to produce their best is a challenge for all managers. Advising, supporting and facilitating these conditions and practices (and communicating good practice) is a challenge for and the responsibility of all HR practitioners. There is widespread recognition that HR practice plays a vital role in bringing people in and bringing people on in organizations. There is widespread recognition of the part HR plays in ensuring that the right people are in the right place doing the right thing. Bringing out the best in all employees presumes the existence of certain organizational conditions: safety, motivation, shared vision, support, development, and scope for expression of identity (freedom/permission to be and work differently and in ways that play to your

strengths). 'Managing diversity' serves as an overarching label for this type of practice.

Chapter VIII aims to draw out the specific links between human resources practice and diversity management. It maps out the main issues and challenges of diversity for public sector organizations. It also provides an overview of the UK Government's approach to diversity management and describes some of the initiatives that have been put into place to support the implementation of the diversity agenda. The author points out that according to the prevailing literature on the subject matter, the organizational benefits in managing diversity include: improved recruitment and retention; reduced staff turnover and absence costs; greater creativity and flexibility; and enhanced customer service. In this chapter, Auluck examines specific diversity management initiatives within the UK Civil Service, which include the following: Diversity Surveys; Equality in Performance Review Research; Tackling Under-Representation; Departmental Diversity Action Plans; Diversity Advocates; Diversity Objective-Setting in Forward Job Plans; Diversity Training Support; Networks and Support Groups; Racial Equality Standard; Equal Pay. She also looks at diversity and public service. In her conclusions she argues that diversity management is good people management. Effective people management can lead to improved performance and better service delivery. Diversity management is not a single programme or a one-off intervention. If it is to be effectively implemented it needs to be developed as an integrated, ongoing set of management and organizational practices. This includes:

- A clear organizational diversity strategy
- Strong vision supported by a clear values statement
- Visible and consistent commitment from political leadership and senior managers
- Mainstreaming diversity into all policies and procedures
- A robust HR framework and practices
- Encouraging and facilitating a culture of learning

As mentioned earlier, another critical challenge for human resources management in a number of countries, particularly in Africa, but also in other regions of the world, is the HIV/AIDS challenge. In the last two decades the unleashing of the HIV/AIDS pandemic in Africa became yet another development challenge to a continent already plagued with a plethora of challenges going into the twenty first century. The peculiar political and socio-economic landscape of Africa with its tribal based wars, dictatorships and poverty makes this all the more challenging.

In light of the above, Chapter VIII analyzes the impact of HIV/AIDS on public sector performance. Ramsingh and Nzewi argue that the management of HIV/AIDS in the work place, whether in the public or private sectors, is essentially a human resource management activity. It affects human resource practitioners through their responsibilities of establishing and maintaining HIV/AIDS programmes / strategies and also impacts on the human resource management responsibilities of line function managers in the execution of their day to day managerial tasks. This Chapter addresses the challenges and the various ways to confront the loss of human resources in the public sector; provides an overview of the lessons learned from the African continent and identifies possible strategies which may help countries and the public sector to face such a daunting problem.

The authors point out that one of the main problems confronting many African countries affected by the scourge of HIV/AIDS is the fact that national responses to the pandemic still remain vague and ambiguous, especially in terms of legislation and policy. To elaborate further, the slow pace of national interventions especially in the area of legislation casts a shadow on the level of commitment of leadership and national governments to engage with the pandemic, when laws that should be a guide to policies and programmes are not in place. For instance UNAIDS reports that about 40% of countries including half the countries in sub Saharan Africa have not yet adopted anti-discriminatory legislation to protect people living with HIV/AIDS. They highlight that in a number of countries, the public service is perceived as the biggest employer of labor. Africa's peculiar political and economic landscape lends to this fact. With little foreign direct investment, weak infrastructural and capital base to support big and small businesses, the private sector remains the secondary employer of labor. South Africa's public service employs about 1,037 million public servants in approximately 140 government departments at national and provincial level. The authors look at the infection rates in the public service and examine some service delivery challenges, including in the areas of housing, health, education, criminal justice, and agriculture. They also analyze the human resources policy challenge, as well as the human resource management dilemma. They examine some of the challenges that HIV/AIDS poses to human resources management in the public sector. They include: morbidity and absenteeism; mortality or retirement; staff morale; costs; as well as providing services in remote areas. Among the response strategies advanced, they give special attention to the Employee assistance programmes (EAPs) since they are particularly attuned to the values and culture of African countries. A number of recommendations to face this challenge are outlined at the end of the chapter and they include: establishing a governing framework for a response to HIV/AIDS; establishing a workplace HIV/AIDS policy; conducting impact assessments; focusing on planning and budgeting; as well as HIV/AIDS monitoring and evaluation.

Part One

The changing role of the State and public sector performance

Chapter I

The changing role of the State in a globalizing world and the need for a more effective public service

Adriana Alberti and Guido Bertucci

1. 1. Introduction

In the last half of the twentieth century, and more even so at the beginning of the new millennium, Governments have been under pressure to respond to the demands from their citizens and to the increasing complexity and change in their global environments. The response to these demands has taken the form of programmes of administrative transformation, administrative reform or administrative development. Movements towards reform in the area of public administration and governance systems and institutions have emerged in all corners of the globe.

The changing role of the State as well as new international forces have resulted in the need for new skills, attitudes and behaviors among public officials at all levels. It is not surprising then that the core competencies for the public sector of the 21st century differ in many ways from the past, especially as the demands placed on public servants, in terms of skills, knowledge and capacities, are rapidly increasing and becoming more complex. What is more, top government leaders in developing countries are still facing old challenges, while at the same time, they also have to address new ones, which have resulted from the many social, economic and political changes sweeping throughout the world.

In order to better understand the scope and nature of the changes that are affecting the way public servants are to operate, we will look at the major transformations that the State and public administration are undergoing in different parts of the world. Within a framework of extreme diversity in local conditions and situations leading to administrative change, it is possible to identify four major trends worldwide.

1.2. Worldwide trends of public administration transformation

The first trend relates to the construction or re-construction of a State that operates according to the rule of law. There are a number of countries across the world undergoing a process of State construction or re-construction. Within this trend, we may distinguish two different movements. The first one that characterizes countries that need to build from scratch or re-build their government institutions, as is the case of some African countries, which have experienced war and internal conflict resulting in State collapse. The second one relates to countries that have embarked in a process of political and economic change. This is, for example, the case of the countries of Eastern Europe who had to cope with a difficult transition from centrally planned economies to market economies. The challenge in this case is to dismantle old State institutions (or de-institutionalize) and to bring them in line with new values of openness, participation, and transparency.

The second one relates to the modernization of the State. This is a challenge that affects all countries and is related to the adaptation and improvement of administrative structures, managerial capacities, financial management and technological adequacy to new needs and demands emerging from societies which are much more complex and heterogeneous than a few decades ago. In other words, it is a process of re-adjustment of State institutions and public management to the need for greater cost-effectiveness, quality, simplicity and participation in government. The need to enhance efficiency in the public sector and to cut public costs, which is at the heart of the New Public Management school of thought, has resulted in a series of measures, including privatization, deregulation, and the introduction of market-like mechanisms in the public sector. In a number of countries, debureaucratization and decentralization have been increasingly coupled with new approaches to management, exemplifying openness, adaptability, participation, flexibility, diversity and responsiveness.

The third trend has to do with the reconfiguration of the role of the State. With the spread of globalization and the changes occurring at both the domestic and international levels, the functions and role of the State have been transformed substantially. The worldwide trends of globalization and citizen participation have compelled Governments to debate "the role of the State", to explore various partnerships with private sector and civil society organizations and to consider re-engineering of government systems, retraining of public officials and rethinking of public policies. Given the rapid changes in technology and the global economy, Governments have also been motivated to learn to continuously re-evaluate government performance in relation to citizen demands and global pressures.

The general configuration of State responsibilities has changed and this has introduced important modifications both in the policy arena and in the State's requirements for high-level skills, qualitatively and quantitatively. Overall, the course of change points to a shift of focus away from hands-on management and the direct production of services and goods towards strategic planning with a view to the establishment and maintenance, refinement and reform of an enabling framework for private enterprise and individual initiative. A parallel shift has moved the State's centre of gravity and with it the locus of power. Decentralization, debureaucratization and deregulation are adding to the importance not only of local government, but also of non-state actors on whom significant functions are devolved or outsourced. At the same time, a range of tasks and policy decisions, traditionally handled by national bureaucracies in their respective capitals, is being increasingly transposed to an inter-governmental or supranational level as a result of increased flows between countries of goods, capital, labour and information. More and more, the State is called upon to act as "linking pin" of processes of planning, consultation, negotiation and decision-making involving diverse actors, State and non-state, at different levels of governance. The State is the hub of activities connecting multiple partners and stakeholders from very varied fields, regions, cultures, occupations, professions and interests.

A fourth trend, which has emerged in the past years, is related to a growing demand to make democracy more meaningful and to allow for more opportunities of participation in policy-making. In many advanced democracies, citizens and civil society organizations are showing increasing dissatisfaction towards how democracies are functioning. For example, the growing influence of money in the electoral process and the strong influence of special interests on public policy decision-making are being viewed in many democratic nations as undermining full citizens' participation. As a result, citizens are asking that government be reformed in order to enhance public

participation, to expand political opportunities, and to improve its operations as well as the quality of services provided. In some parts of the world, the difficulty of governments to deliver adequate services, especially in the social sphere, and promote better living conditions for all has also resulted in a widespread disappointment among the population for the current forms of governance.

1.3. The growing demand for a more open, participatory and efficient government

One of the greatest challenges of our times is therefore to have not only governments of the people and by the people, but also for the people. This means greater participation in key spheres of policy-making decisions, including how taxes should be spent and on what, and better and more effective services. Citizens are asking to be more actively involved in public affairs and to be engaged in many other ways than just at election day every four or five years.

As highlighted in the United Nations Millennium Declaration, the promotion of democracy and good governance, including an efficient and effective public administration, is among the best ways to ensure that the values of freedom, equality, solidarity, environmental protection, and shared responsibility are respected. Democracy and good governance are a goal in itself because of the values on which they rest, but at the same time, they are also the most critical means to achieve the United Nations Millennium Development Goals, which set very precise objectives, targets and indicators to achieve the broader goal set out in the Millennium Declaration related to development and poverty eradication. In fact, although many studies have not been able to show that democracy per se will lead to greater economic growth, there is evidence that democracy ensures greater redistribution of resources. As Amartya Sen has pointed out, one of the consequences of democracy is that it generates political incentives for decision makers to respond positively to the needs and demands of society. The stronger a democracy is the greater and more effective will be the pressure of these incentives on the decision makers.

Having in place a democratic system, however, is not sufficient. Government institutions need to be based on clear and widely accepted rules; to have committed leaders and qualified people to undertake appropriate reforms in the economic and social spheres; to be able to mobilize resources and manage expenditure; and to operate in the most cost-effective way possible by making use of new information technologies. In other words, the legitimacy of a democratic regime is based in great part on the capacity of the State to deliver services that are relevant and of high quality to all sectors of the population in a society. The performance of the public sector depends on well functioning institutional structures as much as on the quality of the people who work in them. Skilled, dedicated and highly motivated public servants are essential for carrying out reforms that are effective and sustainable in the long term, as well as responsive to the changes that are occurring both at the local and global levels.

The essence of what the public sector is and its guiding principles (rule of law, serving the citizens, etc.) will shape its choices of how to solve the many challenges it confronts. Connecting the mission of the public sector with empowered public officials and a system that supports innovation and excellence can make a big difference in the future performance of the public sector. Human resources development is also a critical factor in ensuring that the development goals outlined in the Road map towards the implementation of the United Nations Millennium

Declaration are effectively achieved. Building public sector human capacities in terms of knowledge, skills, motivation and commitment, networks and mastery of information technology is crucial in order to be able to translate the values, objectives, and goals of the Millennium Declaration into nationally owned policies, strategies and action.

Chapter II

Challenges and trends in human capital management

Jocelyne Bourgon

2.1. Introduction

The last 20 years have been difficult for the Public Service. We have seen too many reforms leading to too few results, too much rhetoric, too many keepers of single truth, and not enough wise leaders.

Over the last 20 years, new forces such as globalization, information technologies, and innovation have transformed the way we think about governance, the role of government and the work done by public sector institutions. Both developed and developing countries have undertaken wide-ranging reforms. Some have been remarkably successful; others not. We have seen progress on many fronts in different parts of the world, and we have also made enough mistakes that it should now be possible to look back and assess the lessons learned, as we turn our attention to the challenges ahead.

Some resounding reform successes are worth noting:

- The construction and expansion of the European Union is one of the greatest achievements of our time in building a governance system based on progressive economic integration, democratic principles and human solidarity;
- The transition from an apartheid regime to a democratic society that guarantees equal rights to all citizens in South Africa has given hope to many who are leading ambitious reforms; and
- The successful transition from centrally- planned economies to market economies in countries such as Slovakia, Hungary, Poland, etc. is showing the way to others.

We have also seen the consequences of the failure to provide for good governance. Many countries are still lacking:

- Political institutions to arbitrate conflicting views and to bring about peaceful resolutions of conflicts,
- Democratic accountability and transparency in the exercise of power and the use of public funds,
- Political oversight of public sector institutions;
- Independent judiciary, and
- Law making and law enforcement capacities.

Serious mistakes were also made in some of the most prosperous countries of the world. For a time, it seemed that parts of the world lost sight of the importance of the role of the State as many decided to put their faith in the market's unlimited ability to resolve problems. This view transformed the role of government in many countries, with policies advocating a lesser role for the state and a greater reliance on market forces.

As a consequence and I will come back to this later, a high price was paid in many countries. It damaged the sense of pride of the men and women who had dedicated their life to the Public Service and convinced a number of young people to make a different career choice.

Despite the diversity of governance experiences in the context of the rapid and deep societal changes of the last 20 years, we are facing many common challenges. We must all explore how the public sector can work best and bring value-added to society in the future.

It has become customary to talk of:

- The transformation brought about by the forces of globalization,
- The impact of information and communication technologies and
- The emergence of knowledge-based economies and societies.

I will not, except obliquely, address these issues as they all have been covered previously. For my part, I will try to provide a general context to this theme by looking at broad challenges and going back to the meanings of some core principles that we tend to take for granted.

In order to “Unleash the Human Potential for Public Sector Performance” we should first ask ourselves for what purpose? What will be the role of the State in the future? How can we unleash the potential of the State and of Public Sector Institutions to ensure a high standard of living and quality of life, to promote social justice and to provide for the peaceful enjoyment of life?

I will frame this overview by discussing three challenges: finding the right balance between the market and the State in a global context, the need for leadership within the civil service, and the impact of the knowledge imperative.

2.2. A Search for Balance

One of the great lessons learned over the last 20 years should be the need for balance between the role of the markets and the role of the State. Each one makes a unique contribution. Each one operates in accordance with its own set of values, and each one is deserving of respect in its own right.

The market is the most efficient way to allocate scarce resources and to ensure the pursuit of individual interests. The State (and in particular democratic State) is the most efficient way to ensure social cohesion and the pursuit of collective interests.

The first supports market choices, the latter collective values. One encourages individual choices and contractual arrangement, the other political consensus and covenant. One seeks to maximize individual benefits, whereas the other protects individual rights and the rule of law. One encourages competition, the other collaboration.

For a well-performing economy and society to flourish, it is not about the dominance of one over the other, it is about a search for balance. Both are fallible, both have inherent weaknesses, but by working together, they compensate for each other and achieve the best results.

The lack of balance between the role of markets and the role of the State is partly responsible for several significant failures in Public Sector reforms:

- The Asian crisis in 1997 was not caused by “excessive” regulations but rather by the absence of an adequate regulatory framework;
- Some countries like Korea, Thailand, Argentina and Indonesia were encouraged to cut their deficits by reducing the role of the State and cutting taxes at the worst possible time in their economic cycle, which in turn magnified the crisis;
- There is no direct evidence that tax cuts have helped to create wealth and employment but rather an indication that they led to higher deficits and increased economic disparities between the wealthiest and the poorest in the countries that followed this prescription prematurely; and finally
- Russia is the most compelling example of the need to build the State in order for the market economy to flourish. The call for “less government”, without the appropriate regulatory safeguards was, to say the least, ill-advised.

To unleash the human potential of the Public Sector, we must first articulate in modern and compelling terms the importance of the role of the State and of Public Service Institutions. This is the first, and perhaps the most difficult challenge.

Achieving balance will require political leadership to state the importance of the political processes and the role of Public Service Institutions in meeting new and emerging needs. It will require leadership within the professional public service to bring about the changes needed to serve the collective interest.

Reaffirming the need for balance, and restating the importance of Government in liberal market economies would do much to restore a sense of pride in a Public Service career and to rebuild a relationship of trust between citizens and Public Sector Institutions. Choices about the role of Government in society have a direct impact on the ability to attract and retain talents in the Public Service, and to provide for stimulating employment and career development opportunities.

2.3. “Physician Heal Thyself” (Luke 4: 23)

In my opinion, the primary responsibility for reform in the Public Service rests with the public servants. Obviously, public servants should be able to count on the support of elected officials to bring about legislative changes to marshal reforms that affect the whole of government. But by and large, the Public Service should take responsibility for on-going reforms and bring about the necessary improvements in order to fulfil its mission. Too often, the Public Service hides behind a so-called lack of “political will” without demonstrating its own willingness to bring about changes.

I am among those who believe that “New Public Management” (NPM) has done as much harm as good, because:

- It converts citizens into customers,
- It shifts the focus from the collective interest to user satisfaction,
- It borrows from private sector management practices without adapting them to public sector values and principles, and
- It erodes the professional public policy role by transferring it to the political level or to independent organizations.

That being said, the frustrations and the disenchantment of citizens with the Public Service, which led to NPM, are only too real. Citizens demand and deserve high quality service exempt from patronage or influence peddling. They expect access to information, and they expect services to be organized and delivered in accordance with their needs and circumstances, not at the convenience of Departments or civil servants. They demand to be treated with respect by Public Sector Institutions and public servants true to their mission of being the "servant" of the collective interest and the "keeper of a public trust".

The second challenge, therefore, is to accept the responsibility to bring about the changes within our power.

The Public Service model, as we know it today in most countries, was inherited from the Industrial Age. It is the result of the work by Adam Smith, F.W. Taylor, and Max Weber.

The Weberian concept of the Public Service in the 19th century:

- advocates a clear separation of roles between political and professional functions;
- is built around a hierarchical system of accountability to Ministers and Parliament;
- operates an administrative regime based on the rule of law, the protection of citizen's right and due process; and
- recognizes the need for a professional, competent and meritorious Public Service.

These basic principles remain valid today. However, I strongly believe that we need to modernize their definition and their application. To illustrate this point, I will refer to the rule of law, the merit principle and the need for due process. Our commitment to these principles should never be used as:

- A pretext to prevent needed reforms,
- A justification to oppose the reform agenda of a rightfully-elected government, or
- As a means to defend corporatist interests.

Unlocking the human potential of the Public Service starts with facing the truth, no matter how uncomfortable this may be at times. It means a firm commitment to leaving to future generations better institutions than the ones we inherited.

- The Rule of Law

The respect for the rule of law is one of the most fundamental principles of Public Sector Institutions. Unfortunately, incidents related to the inability to eradicate corruption and take forceful action to address proven incidents of wrongdoing continue to undermine the credibility of the Public Service and public servants. This is not a matter for Ministers alone. Much can be done in the Public Service by public servants at all levels.

- The Merit Principle

It is necessary to protect the Public Service from political interference in the recruitment and promotion processes, in order to build professional and highly competent institutions. The "merit principle" was never intended to grant immunity for poor performance. A commitment to the "merit principle" does not imply

guaranteed promotion or guaranteed employment for life. While we need to defend and protect the “principle of a meritorious Public Service”, we must also be prepared to review and change the “merit system” invented by the Public Service to give it effect.

There is evidence that the “merit system” put in place in some of our countries did not always advance the merit principle but contributed instead to encouraging a corporatist approach and prevented much-needed reforms.

- Due Process

The commitment to due process is no justification for red tape, or inefficient and disjointed operations in Government. The Public Sector is not inherently less efficient than the private sector; more complex, yes, but not less efficient. Many of the policies, controls and procedures are not required to fulfil the requirements of the rule of law. They serve instead to satisfy the appetite for control and power by some, at the expense of the commitment to serving citizens.

These three core principles are sound but we need to revisit their definition and their application in order to ensure the ongoing relevance of the Public Service to citizens’ needs and to remaining deserving of citizens’ trust.

2.4. The Knowledge and Innovation Imperatives

The last challenge I will mention pertains to the “knowledge and innovation imperatives” that are in so many ways characteristic of the era we live in. The bureaucratic organizational model in the public sector and the industrial management model in the private sector have characterized the organization of work for most of the last century. They were built around clearly defined and predictable tasks. Similar tasks were grouped into units, units into branches, and branches into departments. The organization relied on a strict division of labour. The authority was delegated top down.

A profound transformation took shape in the private sector during the 70's, 80's and 90's as the knowledge-based economy started to take shape. When the assets of an organization become intellectual, the old management model starts to break down.

The Public Service has been slower to adapt, but it must, in order to provide value-added, remain relevant to citizen’s needs, and continue to be an attractive workplace. This transformation will be critical to the ability of the Public Service to attract and retain its fair share of the best talent in the future.

Let’s look at this more carefully. The nature of work in the Public Service is shifting from tangible to intangible services (building a road vs. providing information), from mass production of the same service to citizen-centred services (issuing checks vs. assisting start-ups).

The organization of the work is also changing and is increasingly dependent on the use of networks reaching inside and outside, well beyond the traditional boundaries of the organization. This requires new ways of thinking as there is a need to implement a “whole of government” approach, supported by horizontal management and team work, in order to effectively promote and respond to the broad range of public interests in a cohesive and coherent manner.

The structures of authority are changing. The power of the office must now co-exist with the power of ideas, the power to innovate, and the power to discover new and better ways to fulfil the mission.

Training for a job, as it was done in the past, only works when the content of the work is predictable and repetitive. Learning, on the other hand, is central to the ability of an organization to innovate, and will be key to the future of the Public Service. At the practical level, this means preparing highly competent and qualified knowledge workers who will have the added characteristics of being learners, innovators and entrepreneurs.

It remains an open question whether, and to what extent, the Public Service will be able to adapt to the "knowledge imperative" and to encourage innovation. It is a complex undertaking and some countries will choose a more modest role for their Public Service. Innovation that fails in the private sector can damage a firm's reputation or affect shareholder's return. In the public sector, the consequences of failure are borne by citizens. A successful innovation in the Public Sector is largely invisible but a visible failure can put an end to a brilliant career. Securing innovation in the public sector represents a conundrum. On the one hand, creating a public and political constituency for innovation is a challenge: the tolerance for failure and even for reasonable risk-taking is low. The current public service management systems do not encourage innovation, favouring instead predictability in a given range of activities. On the other hand, failure to transform bureaucratic organizations into "intelligent" and "learning" organizations, able to explore and find new and better ways of achieving their mission, might signal their declining relevance in the future. There can be no innovation without some degree of tolerance for failure and reasonable risk taking.

The way the Public Service adapts to the "knowledge and innovation imperatives" will set the context for human resource management reforms in the future.

The competition for talent will be fierce among countries and between the private and public sectors. People will come to the Public Service if they are given the chance to make a difference, and the opportunity to use their skills and reach their full potential. A Public Service whose role is limited to repetitive and predictable tasks will attract a different kind of workforce.

The old "bargain" of lower compensation than the private sector, in return for greater job security, is no longer realistic. A reasonable pay, new skills and lifelong learning are key factors to a sense of personal security and employability. Today, one must learn a living to earn a living.

References

Bourgon, Jocelyne. Innovation and the Public Sector, 2nd Quality Conference for Public Administration in the Economic Union, Copenhagen, Denmark, October 3, 2002.

Bourgon, Jocelyne. Different circumstances... common challenges, common purpose. Public Sector Leadership Forum 2001, Singapore, August 28, 2001.

Bourgon, Jocelyne. Shared Governance: ---- Poverty and Exclusion, IIAS Conference, Yaounde, Cameroon, July 15, 2003.

Marsden, David. Perspectives on Performance Pay in Government Organizations Expert Meeting, OECD, Paris, October 7, 2003.

World Public Sector Report, Globalization and the State, United Nations, 2001.

Stiglitz Joseph. Quand le capitalisme perd la tête, Fayard, 2003.

Marivi Philippe. Services publics, réussir le changement, Editions Prélude et Fugue, 2004.

CHAPTER III

Public Policy and Human Resource Development

Luis F. Aguilar, Cristina Galíndez and Ernesto Velasco

3.1. Introduction

This chapter focuses on the *development* of human resources to increase *policy capacity* in the public sector. It is understood that the capacity of the State also includes other aspects such as the knowledge and skills necessary to deliver public services and manage financial and capital resources in government. Here, we focus our attention on the challenges and the alternatives for improving public sector staff competencies to undertake different phases and mental operations throughout the policy cycle.

Our discussion advances three arguments: first, that developing policy capacity demands focusing on the individual's competencies and that such *people-oriented* approach is a crucial factor for achieving successful reforms. Second, that conventional means for developing competencies, i.e. traditional training and development methods, are not enough to adapt present policy capacities to the demands of ever changing environments. Thirdly, that human resource development for building policy capacity requires action in at least three interrelated areas: the **internal practices** regarding the management of the human and intellectual capital of public organizations; the **institutional frameworks** under which the different activities of the policy cycle are performed; and the responsibilities that **national institutes or schools of public administration** have in meeting the demands for new competency in the public sector.

The first section of this chapter is devoted to reviewing the meaning of policy capacity and the main stages of the policy cycle. The second section focuses on the relationship between human resource development and policy competencies. The third section proposes some alternatives for facing the challenges of human resource development for capacity building. Finally, the fourth section contains some concluding remarks.

3.2. Capacity building and policy capacity

As previously argued, the role of the State was deeply redefined during the last years of the XX century. Although it is recognized that it still has a pre-eminent role in economic and social development, it is also assumed that governments capacity to deliver results is limited, and that civil society and the private sector play an important role in achieving development goals. Therefore, it has been extensively argued that the State should adopt the role of a partner, catalyst and facilitator of development (World Bank, 1997). Besides, the concept of "new governance" stresses that interdependence, partnership, networking between state, private sector and social organizations are necessary conditions to achieve socio-economic progress. Following the fiscal crisis of the social state, a number of reforms were introduced to reduce the size of government as well as downsize and privatize public enterprises

which resulted in the lay off of a large number of public servants. However, in recent years it has been recognised that rightsizing of the state, according to the different social context, rather than simple downsizing, produces better results and also that sustainable social / human development requires effective government performance.

In light of the above, there is a growing consensus among Latin American governments on the need to undertake a complex set of reforms. These ideas are reflected in the documents signed in Santiago (April, 1998), the so called "CLAD consensus" (October, 1998), and, more recently, by the "Santa Cruz Consensus" (resulting from the "V Latin American Conference of Ministers of Public Administration and State Reform", June, 2003). Among other issues, the Santa Cruz Consensus emphasized:

- The need to seek political and social consensus in the design and implementation of innovative administrative policies. Administrative reforms cannot be any longer a technical initiative of the elite or of a modernizing group, but must be articulated with the support of all groups in society.
- If governments wish to facilitate socio-economic progress in the XXI Century, administrative reform must be understood as a crucial component of the strategic vision of a country.
- The most relevant output of the V Latin American Conference of Ministers of Public Administration, resulting from a UNDESA initiative is the "Latin American Public Service Charter". The premise of the Charter is that the professionalization of the public service is critical to strengthening the capacity of the State to carry out its many functions. To achieve this end, a good relationship between government officials and citizens must be harnessed and structured around the principles of equal treatment, honesty, transparency and efficiency, as well as quality of performance and services.

Consequently, one of today's main challenges in development is enhancing State Capacity.¹ In this respect, "knowledge gaps and information problems", explain to a great extent policy weakness (World Bank, 1998). In developing and transitional countries such problems were worsened by the economic, social and political crisis that began in the 70s and by the presence of patrimonial governance systems (that stressed loyalty to the leader rather than rationality and merit in policy-making).

In order to enable the State to meet new demands and challenges, it is necessary to reshape and reinforce policy capacity. The policy capacity of the State refers to the ability of public sector's executives to make and implement policies. Policy makers face entirely new environments that cannot be properly managed with the kind of

¹ Capacity is understood as "the ability to perform appropriate tasks effectively, efficiently and sustainably" (Hilderbrand & Grindle 1997: 34). It has been argued by many commentators that capacity has many dimensions and that it depends on both, internal management (organizational models, processes, resources, management styles, human resources, etc.) and external factors (institutional context, policy networks, general economic, social and political trends, international pressures, etc.).

capacities on which they have traditionally relied.² The pressures for change demand new behaviors and skills from the people that work within government.³

The concept of public policy has been defined in several ways. Here we understand public policy as a process aimed at solving public problems, i.e., a public problem-solving process. Such process includes several interdependent stages that can be displayed chronologically but that presuppose different analytical and practical operations that every policy developer has to perform. These stages have been divided and named differently by different authors. However, there is agreement about the following stages of the policy cycle:

- i. Agenda setting: the process through which certain social events or situations emerge as public problems, that is, issues that deserve government's attention and action.
- ii. Problem definition: it relates to the identification of the components or attributes, the impact (span of actors affected, potential for propagation, severity of the damages provoked and others) and causes of a problem. It implies constructing a definition that makes the problem manageable.
- iii. Formulating options: it refers to the process by which policy options are constructed within government. This formulation is influenced by the accepted definition of the problem and the values of the political and administrative culture that are shared by society and government.
- iv. Adoption of a policy option: it refers to the process of appraising and choosing among options. It is related to the values and technical criteria that allow prioritizing and making the final choice.
- v. Policy implementation: it is understood as the process through which the policy objective is carried out, that is, reaching the desired or preferred situation that reasonably resolves the problem or, at least, reduces its damaging effects.
- vi. Evaluation: taking into account that the criteria, units and purposes of evaluation can be multiple and must be clarified and agreed upon, this stage is aimed at 1) performing a diagnosis of the development and execution of a policy in order to identify achievements, delays, deviations, models of operation, etc., with a view to implement the necessary adjustments; or 2) performing a final appraisal of the developed policy in a precise moment in time that stresses the policy results achieved (staff performance, quality attributes, social impact, etc.). Such results, processes and policy

² This chapter does not adopt the approach proposed by Barzelay (2000). Barzelay's approach is based on an ex-post identification of the determinants of public management reform policies in different countries. Here, we adopt a management perspective, focused on increasing the capacity of governments to develop policy and not a policy approach intending to explain the policies options adopted in the past. This paper also transcends the classic discussion about the creation of civil service systems: whatever the type of civil service implemented in a country (e.g. carrier based, post-based, etc.) the need to strengthen the policy competencies of civil servants is a common responsibility.

³ The uncertainty surrounding the public sector and the well-known "pathologies" of the bureaucratic model of organization and management (Merton, 1957) had the combined effect of reducing the job security, welfare and increasing the demoralization of the civil servants (ILO, 1995). These are challenges that building policy capacity has to face.

design are also reviewed in order to decide whether to continue reform or terminate the policy being evaluated.

Government's performance in each of the mentioned phases greatly depends on the knowledge, skills and personal attributes of the people that are actually involved in performing each one of them. Therefore, policies that increase the potential of the human capital in the public sector are crucial. These policies must be explicit and directed at recognizing the personnel's role in the public domain and at developing their knowledge and skills (competencies). Many efforts of reform in the past sometimes referred to as New Public Management, have been of dubious success because of their excessive concern with structures, procedures, systems and with the administrative value of efficiency. Today, there is a growing consensus around the idea that public sector capacity-building must be "people-centered". This means that reforms should focus on how to revitalize and unlock the intellectual, moral and civic capital of the people working in the public sector who are devoted to the fulfillment of public goals.

3.3. Human Resource Development for building policy capacity

Human Resource Development (HRD) is concerned with the provision of learning, development and training opportunities in order to improve individual, team and organizational performance.⁴ Therefore, the HRD function within the public sector is crucial to develop sustainable policy capacity.

Closely related to HRD is the idea of competency, which has become popular in countries such as the UK, Canada and, more recently, in some developing countries such as South Africa and Mexico. Nowadays, what is asked from the policy process is not just to be legal, rational and respectful of the citizen's rights, but also that it creates valuable results. Therefore, policy making is not just about deciding among multiple options but it is also about achieving desirable social impacts. That is why the concept of competency becomes relevant to the public sector. It is attractive because it links the staff's knowledge, skills and personal attributes with organizational *performance*.⁵

Boyatzis defines competency as a capacity that exists in a person which leads to a behaviour that meets job demands within the parameters of the organizational environment and that, in turn, brings about desired results (Boyatzis, 1982)⁶.

⁴ The key elements according to several authors are: a) *learning*: defined as a sustained change in behaviour that occurs as a result of practice or experience; b) *education*: the development of knowledge, values and understanding required in all aspects of life rather than the knowledge and skills relating to particular activity; c) *development*: improvement of a person's ability and potential through the provision of learning and educational experiences, and e) *training*: the planned and systematic modification of behaviour through courses and programmes which enable individuals to achieve the levels of knowledge, skill and competence needed to carry out their work effectively.

⁵ "The major difference between competency and traditional approaches to people management is that the former stresses inputs, including behavioural characteristics of staff, and the later outputs and performance on the job. [...] [Competency Based Management] CBM also represents a cultural change towards greater employee self-direction and responsibility and the search of excellence rather than standard performance. The claim advantage of the competency approach is that there is a consistency in identifying and measuring people quality at all stages in the employment cycle. It also identifies skills, motives, personality characteristics and other attributes which give rise to performance and differentiated poor, average, and superior performance" (Horton, 2000: 3-4).

⁶Some sources make a distinction between the concept of competency and competence.

Competency: is a person-related concept that refers to the dimensions of behaviour lying behind competent performance;

Therefore, the policy process requires that public officials exercise different and specialised competencies in order to achieve policy results.

3.3.1. Policy Competencies

It is difficult to determine what “good” policymaking is, in other words, what a “well performed” policy agenda setting, designing, implementing and evaluation is. This problem derives from the fact that in many circumstances the success in solving social problems does not depend only on the efforts of a single organisation but of a multitude of them. Very often the results are influenced by factors outside the control of policy makers. Therefore, it is even more difficult to establish a straightforward set of competencies necessary to deliver good policies. Taking into account these limitations, there are certain accepted characteristics of a good policy: a) it is rational, in the sense that the chosen means have a high probability of delivering the desired and declared goals and objectives; b) legal, that is, it does not contradict the existing legal provisions and respects the basic entitlements of citizens; c) feasible, that is, the instruments selected are not so costly (in terms of money, time, and human costs) as to make them impossible to recur to, and d) politically viable, in the sense that policies are not irremediably blocked by citizens or interested stakeholders. There are certain competencies that are linked with these features⁷:

- i. **Forward looking:** Set clear objectives and take into account long term social, economical and political trends.
- ii. **Outward looking:** extensive knowledge of the policy environment (institutions, actors, networks and their dynamics) and capacity to develop a local, regional and international policy perspective.
- iii. **Expert thinking:** knowledgeable use of policy-making principles, tools and legal frameworks, numeracy, historical policy perspective and higher analytical skills.
- iv. **Awareness of resource scarcity:** a realistic account of the available resources (financial, human, of legitimacy, etc.) based on feasibility analysis and budgetary responsibility.
- v. **Strategic vision:** Policy makers develop a vision of the desired future that assures achieving excellence by creating public value. It also refers to the ability to focus attention on critical issues and choices, that is, on those phenomena that have “high probability of potent impact on collective futures” (Dror, 1997: 12).
- vi. **Innovation:** Policy makers are flexible and innovative, questioning established ways of dealing with things; encouraging new and creative ideas; and, where appropriate, making established ways work better.
- vii. **Transversal coherence:** Policy makers take a holistic view, looking beyond institutional boundaries to the government’s strategic objectives.

Competence: is a work-related concept that refers to areas of work at which the person is competent (Armstrong, 2001: 302).

In this paper, we will use competency as encompassing both meanings.

⁷ Some of these competencies are taken from Cabinet Office (1999).

- viii. **Inclusive:** Policy makers take into account the impact on and/or meet the needs of all people directly or indirectly affected by the policy; and involve key stakeholders directly in the policy process.
- ix. **Monitoring:** Existing policies are constantly reviewed to ensure they are really dealing with problems they were designed to solve, taking into account the associated effects elsewhere.
- x. **Knowledge-based:** Policy makers' advice / decisions are based upon the best available evidence from a wide range of sources.
- xi. **Lesson drawing:** Policy makers take advantage of past, national and international experience (taking the form of best practices, benchmarking, negative lessons, etc.)
- xii. **Ethical robustness:** An evaluation of the possible trade-off among values that different policy alternatives imply is undertaken. Commitment to act on behalf of the public interest.
- xiii. **Transparency:** Clear and public criteria to assess policy alternatives and evaluate policy outcomes.
- xiv. **Accountability:** Open to public scrutiny and prepared to face consequences of misbehaviour.

These competencies are defined as overall knowledge and skills necessary throughout the entire policy process. However, some of them are more important in certain stages of the policy cycle than in others, as is shown in Table 1. Given the normal difficulties for replacing staff and the lack of sufficient financial resources to recruit new personnel, HRD is an effective tool for changing behaviours, promoting the acquisition of new skills and renewing the relations of reciprocity between the organisation and the people who work in it.

TABLE 1: COMPETENCIES AND THEIR RELEVANCE IN THE POLICY CYCLE

		Policy Cycle					
		Agenda setting	Problem definition	Formulating options	Adoption of a policy option	Implementation	Evaluation
Competencies	Forward looking	✓	✓	✓	✓		
	Outward looking	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	Expert thinking	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	Awareness of scarcity of resources			✓	✓		
	Strategic vision	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓

Innovative and creative		✓	✓		✓	
Transversal coherence				✓	✓	
Inclusive	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Monitoring					✓	✓
Knowledge-Based			✓	✓		✓
Learning		✓	✓		✓	✓
Awareness of ethical implications		✓	✓	✓	✓	
Transparency	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Accountability	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓

In this respect, the main challenges for HRD in building policy capacity are three folded: first, how to ensure that, once a person has developed certain policy competencies by means of training and experience, this individual is going to reach the position where he can make the most of the referred competencies. Two, how to ensure that along the policy cycle the responsibilities, functions and activities are assigned in a way that takes advantage of each individual's best developed competencies. Finally, how to ensure that while learning and competencies are developed for the benefit of the individual, such development contributes to the achievement of the organization's public goals.

Two extreme management models of HRD could be very harmful in the public sector: on the one hand, an over centralized and top-down model, although it may set very clear organizational goals, it might be too insensitive to the environmental pressures exerted upon the organization and to the individual needs and expectations of the staff. On the other hand, an approach exclusively centred on the individual. Although it might generate higher levels of personal satisfaction, it may also displace the collective goals and disperse the HRD efforts resulting in the impossibility to conduct a coherent policy. In the worst case, this may trigger unhealthy competition between public officials and diminish the public sector *ethos* and values.

Additionally, training and education by themselves may not be enough: first, frequently the training function is an isolated function and the first to suffer from budget cuts when scarcity strikes public organizations. Second, the link between training and organizational performance is an elusive one. Third, a common complaint of public officers is that training programmes and courses are poorly linked with day-to-day activities and of little relevance with the organization's long-term effectiveness. Therefore, an effective strategy of policy capacity building through HRD should be based on a strategic, holistic and pluralistic (regarding the tools and methods it will recur to) approach.

3.4. Facing the challenges

Achieving stronger policy capacity requires, paradoxically, improving the ability of public sector executives to manage in a coherent and sustainable way the intellectual capital of the organization. This, in turn, demands action on three interrelated fronts: managerial, institutional and upgrading the role of central training and development organizations (national public administration schools and/or institutes). These three aspects are treated throughout this section.

3.4.1. Managerial practices

Improving policy capacity requires that the people with the adequate policy competencies are available at the time and place where they are needed. This obviously involves changes in all the main human resources management functions (attract and recruit, reward, retain and develop, etc.). It also entails managing not only internal factors, like change resistance or self-complacency of the public personnel, but also external ones affecting the incentives and motivation for developing staff's competencies, such as differentiated pay scales between the public and the private sector, potential public sector "brain-drain", gender education inequality, deficits of national educational system, etc. Therefore, a strategic vision of the HRD function is much needed.⁸ The Strategic Human Resource Development is mainly concerned with aligning personnel policies with the core strategies of the public organization.

It is a common error of many HRD policies to focus only on the present needs of the organization, failing to establish management practices designated to meet also future skills requirements. A Vision of the future of the public service, operating, acting and performing in changing social environments, is the key element of a strategic approach. Therefore, strategic HRD presupposes that the investment in developing the staff's competencies is an integral part of the organizational strategy, not just an operational issue or a rhetoric devise of top officials regarding the staff as a strategic asset; resources must be allocated to these policies in each ministry's budget, and supportive actions need to be taken. Obviously, this demands strong political commitment, that is, the political elite has to be willing to invest in improving the competencies of the public sector's staff, although this investment may not produce electoral benefits in the short run.

Introducing Strategic HRD is not a simple task. First of all, it requires a careful analysis of the internal and external conditions affecting the achievement of public objectives of the organization. Second, it demands flexibility and support systems (besides analytical efforts for strategic planning and management) in contrast with traditional bureaucracy rigidity and isolation.

On the one hand, it requires greater freedom to manage human resources, that is, opting for broader job descriptions than it is usually the case in most civil service systems or, worse, in the case of public services controlled by union's collective contracts (where the definitions of each post's responsibilities is detailed and narrow).⁹ "Broad grades" and "broad careers" have been introduced in some public

⁸ For the options available to the design of a national human resource development strategy, see Rao, 1996, especially chapter 3 "Strategic interventions: an overview".

⁹ Civil service systems are usually based on detailed formal descriptions of each position's duties, responsibilities and authority, rigid and homogeneous pay scales and strict procedures and rules to govern the recruitment, appointment, retention and dismissal of public servants.

organizations all around the world, as means to provide more challenging and meaningful work assignments for public servants.

On the other, it demands behavioral changes on the part of both managers and staff who must be committed to embracing the human development strategies. In most career civil services, the advancement of public servants is considered to be the responsibility of the organization they belong to and, therefore, it is expected that the superior or HRM units within each ministry would provide all the necessary opportunities for learning and specialization. However, a strategic approach to HRD demands an active involvement of each public servant in defining their needs and in involving themselves in different learning experiences. In this respect, it is important that public organizations commit themselves to a new "contract" with their employees by which the increased job insecurity introduced by more flexible HR policies is matched with a clear commitment to staff development through the creation of support mechanisms, such as career advancement centres, counseling and mentoring.

Finally, Strategic HRD also requires the creation of complex information systems that allow the organization to identify the competencies its staff possesses at the present, the projected competencies demands (based on the environmental trends and pressures) and the perceived needs of the public personnel. Information plus political commitment are crucial ingredients of any successful attempt to make strategic decisions.

Governments also need to construct partnerships with professional firms and associations, and higher education institutions, in order to ensure the adequacy of the education for public servants. Historically, the attempts to link the demand side of human capital with the supply side has been of limited success: a mutual suspicion between public organizations and higher education institutions have resulted in sporadic and limited schemes of collaboration, based, in most cases, on the allocation of public resources to fund such agreements.

Another important aspect to consider is a radical change in the ways training and development programmes are conceived, managed and delivered in the public sector.¹⁰ Given the fact that a regulatory State requires policy competencies that were not necessarily covered during the education of middle-aged public servants, re-training and professional skill's update are central to enhance policy capacity.

In the last decade, important changes in training have occurred in the public sector: more attention has been given to the staff's expectations, and organizations have been more careful to specify the attributes of the activities' outputs and outcomes. However, the classic one-way, lecture-based training seems inadequate to develop the sophisticated competencies reviewed before. There is growing agreement on the need to use new methods, techniques and learning environments.

¹⁰ A distinction should be made between education and training. Reilly (1979) defines education as to the "basic development of a person's mind and personality without necessarily any reference to a specific job". In institutional terms, education is generally provided by the nation's education system. In secondary or tertiary education, there may be some relevant degrees for public administration, but they are usually designed independently from the human resources policies of the public sector. Education is generally a pre-recruitment instruction in a university or higher education institution. On the other hand, training has a clear vocational purpose, that is, is related to a specific job or task that is being performed or will be in the future by an individual. Therefore, training is a function that affects the individual after it is recruited by the civil service (Reichard, 1998). There are in generic two different objectives of training: one is technical specialization for increasing performance of an on going task (this is what is commonly understood by training) and the other is to prepare the person to be promoted to perform "higher" managerial tasks (this is commonly referred as management development).

Relevant to the case of policy competencies is the use of "*action-learning*", a method that is based on training and the development of interventions focused on solving "real-life" policy problems. Action-learning is "a continuous process of learning and reflection, supported by colleagues, with an intention of getting things done. Through action-learning, individuals learn, with and from each other, by working on real problems and reflecting on their own experiences" (McGill and Beaty 1992). In this case, the boundaries between every-day work experience and purposeful training and development interventions are blurred: learning is not the result of discrete and time-bound classes, but the result of the entire personal (past and present) experience and knowledge and social dialogue between experts and colleagues. It implies a close link between "learning" and "doing", and between real organizational and individual needs. In the future, development of policy competencies will look less like a traditional university course and more like consultancy-type projects.

In this respect, the use of information and communication technologies (ICT) is known to be a useful means to increase the learning opportunities of public servants, as it facilitates the access to a wide range of information sources, decentralizes the information flows, makes geographic remoteness irrelevant to access data and knowledge, reduces the costs of sharing information and provides effective means to strengthen the institutional memory of public organizations. As we will see below, the possibilities of using ICT to improve policy capacity go beyond on-line-training programmes or distance learning schemes.

In light of the above, training and development in policy competencies cannot be a function performed by a separate unit within the organization or the civil service, but it has to be an integral part of the organizational life. However, such an approach is not easy to handle, as it brings into questioning traditions and procedures. The experience of specialised units suggests that, because of their isolation from the rest of the organization, they usually become marginalised and their activities are relegated to a secondary role. Typically, departments of quality, planning, organization and methods, etc., are doomed to failure. Once again, a deep cultural change is needed, as action learning strategies are difficult to conduct in highly centralized and control-oriented public sector organizations, where status barriers and inflexible rules tend to separate the people that have to solve a problem rather than letting them come closer and exchange views and expertise.

Another theme that is crucial to policy capacity is the idea of Knowledge Management (KM). This concept was developed in the private sector as a reaction to the negative consequences of downsizing and lay-offs (i.e. brain drain and erosion of institutional memory). It also resulted from the recognition that intellectual capital is a crucial factor in shaping the competitive advantage of people, firms and nations within a globalized economy. KM refers to the process by which an organization creates value, that is, more efficient and effective processes and appropriate products tailored to the citizens' expectations.

Policymaking is a knowledge intensive business. Therefore, even the most competent personnel cannot develop well-informed policies if they do not have access to sufficient data, methods and analytical tools. From this perspective, knowledge is a resource that has to be preserved and developed in order to reach "learning organizations" in the public sector. This obviously goes beyond the HRD policies, as it involves partnerships with research institutions or the creation of units dedicated to

conducting policy and best practices studies (such as the Policy Research Secretariat in Canada or the Economic and Social Research Council's Centres for Evidence-Based Policy in different UK universities). However, in terms of internal management, the development of policy competencies has to be backed by robust systems of knowledge sharing and access to organizational experience. In the first place, HRD has to ensure that public officials are "intelligent" consumers of data and expert advice, that is, being able to understand, criticize and use scientific evidence and benchmarking studies. Therefore, knowledge management is related to the development of six core capacities: analytical, classificatory, explicative, calculation, forecasting (where possible) and design. Second, such competencies have to be accompanied by systems that improve access to relevant data, research and best practices. Even more:

The systematic gathering and sharing of information on policy making by policy makers should also help to create a common policy focus, encouraging participation and mutual understanding with benefits both in terms of building the corporate identity of the civil service and generating greater openness in policy making (Cabinet Office 1999: 42).

KM implies a range of tools such as decision-making support systems, databases, on-line collaboration, among others. A useful example of this kind of KM projects aimed at improving policy capacity is the development of Knowledge Pools by the British Government. Knowledge pools are data bases aimed to make knowledge, facts and figures available 24-hour day, between individual departments and from outside of government. In practice, knowledge pools include devices to ensure electronic connection among officers in different government bodies that allow accessing and sharing common and secure databases, discussion forums between civil servants and web based community sites. This has allowed a number of inter-departmental communities to work together and collaborate (http://www.cabinet-office.gov.uk/2001/news/011212_eenvoystrat.htm). In sum, HRD for policy capacity requires important changes in managerial practices such as implementing a strategic approach to competency development planning, redefining the role and methods of training and enhancing an effective and technologically-based knowledge management in the public sector.

3.4.2. Institutional arrangements

To be effective, HRD strategies must be accompanied by institutional arrangements that allow, encourage and reinforce policy competencies and results. Such arrangements require adapting the administrative culture, structures and processes to the new needs and work conditions of public sector professionals. In the end, such an institutional setting has to reinforce policy-makers' accountability for the decisions they take in a way that, however, does not deter them from innovating and experimenting. Therefore, the public sector should move away from a system that punishes errors and innovation, and rewards risk-aversion as well as "hiding" behind the rulebook.

This implies fighting against limitations imposed by administrative traditions and cultures and being able to manage resistance to change.¹¹ Of particular relevance for HRD for policy capacity is what is called "competence fear", that is, the concern of public servants about their ability to cope with new demands, to acquire new skills

¹¹ There is an extensive literature about resistance to change. In the public sector in particular, such resistance could be the result of past reform waves that may have been more cosmetic than real.

and new managerial technologies (like the so called “techno fear” in face of increasing use of e-government processes). Therefore, the development of competencies has to be seen by public servants as responding to their interests. This could be helped by creating a scheme of incentives and motivation that offers them clear benefits in terms of effectiveness, self-development, “employability”, *status* and of rewards and remuneration. Even more, as many policy competences can only be acquired by practical experience (“learning by doing”), the institutional arrangements need to be established along the public policy cycle to reinforce and encourage the continuous learning of policy-makers. Some examples are:

1. Agenda setting: there should be mechanisms that promote an institutionalized path to express, collect and include social demands and priorities that complement the traditional mechanisms of voting and political representation in defining the government’s agenda. Public servants must be encouraged to explore innovative forms of consultation and means to give “voice” to disadvantaged social sectors. This is of extreme importance in countries that have recently established democratic regimes since in the past the institutional frameworks for agenda setting were dominated by techno-bureaucratic elites.
2. Problem definition: it is important to include a diversity of perspectives in this stage; it is desirable to establish partnerships between public policy makers and “think tanks”, stakeholders and academic institutions to legitimize problem definition. In some countries, a major obstacle could be the absence of reliable institutions providing timely data about economic, demographic and social trends.
3. Formulating options: there is a need to make processes more flexible in order to allow for greater collaboration and information exchange between agencies, different levels of government and administrative grades. Tools for gathering and sharing information, such as the “knowledge pools” referred to before to promote knowledge-based policies, should be encouraged. In addition, collaboration with experts and scholars is needed in this stage.¹²
4. Adoption of a policy option: in this case, forward looking and strategic vision ought to be encouraged by establishing multi-annual budgets, participatory visioning, long-term policy frameworks, and collaboration mechanisms between agencies to privilege not only long-term but also transversal or cross-cutting policies.
5. Policy implementation: it may be helpful to separate strategic policy definition from policy implementation (or split between policy decisions and service delivery) along with clear product specification, monitoring and client satisfaction identification tools.
6. Evaluation: evaluation must reinforce feedback and learning through well-designed means to measuring performance and impact, and not just rule abidance. Performance audits oriented to allow policy management improvements rather than punishing “non-compliance” is a good example of this (see Pollit, et al., 1999). There is also the need to develop transparent rewards and sanction schemes to promote participatory evaluations. One has to be aware that evaluations are based on a wide spectrum of approaches and units that have

¹² An example is the creation of departmental schemes to bring experts to policy design, such as evaluation and appraisal, steering groups and advisory panels in the Department of Education of the British government. (Bullock, Mount Ford & Stanley, 2001).

different management requirements.¹³ For example, evaluations that rely on indicators that are impossible to measure are meaningless. Therefore, consensus over the objectives and methods of the evaluation process should be reached early in the policy process. It is also necessary to develop skilful officials that are able, not only of performing evaluations by themselves, but also that can manage and make the most of the evaluations conducted by external academic and professional centres.

This list, of course, is not extensive as there are many options available. Choosing among them depends on specific country conditions. However, there is a universal need to introduce inclusive processes of citizen participation and expert advice throughout the policy cycle in order to build social consensus and legitimize government actions.

In addition, transparency and accountability mechanisms must also be redesigned in order to ensure and encourage citizen participation to control public power. The availability of freedom of information acts and administrative ombudsmen among other tools might increase political and managerial responsibility.¹⁴

3.4.3. The Role of Central Public Administration Institutes

One final issue that a strategy of HRD for policy capacity building has to deal with is the role of central public administration institutes or schools, such as the *École Nationale D'Administration* in France, the *Civil Service College* in the UK and many other similar institutes around the world. These centres are responsible for the development of a professional public sector, but have been criticised in recent years for becoming too inflexible and obsolete to cope with the demands placed on contemporary public servants. Yet, these institutions have survived and are still playing a major role in the HRD systems. As it was stressed before, it is naïve to think that the complex network of actors involved in the Human Development strategy will agree on a coherent and coordinated policy (especially considering that those HR units are usually politically weak) only through the commitment of the central personnel office or the human resource units within ministries. Even more, it is not enough to transform internal practices to boost policy capacity, but it is also necessary to involve numerous academic and education institutions, non-governmental organizations and even the private sector in the area of competency development.

As the development of the public sector staff ought to be guided by the values of equal opportunity, professionalism, the rule of law, merit and defense of the public

¹³ Examples of different evaluation concerns are economic efficiency, quality of service, legality of behaviours, technical correctness, among others. Relating the units of evaluation, these can be performance, inputs, outputs, user's satisfactions, etc. In an environment where evaluation, audits and inspection are becoming ever present realities, one should be careful not to displace the substantive policy activities by evaluative activities.

¹⁴ The traditional model of accountability emphasized political accountability, that is, the mechanism to make those with delegated authority answerable to the citizens (Day & Klein 1987). These mechanisms were based on the existence of a line or chain of accountability that links public servants with the elected representatives of the citizens. The main assumption of this model is that the public would hold accountable those with delegated authority by means of voting in regular elections (DeLeon 1998: 541). Citizens are becoming increasingly concern with the fact, that in this traditional system, accountability is placed too far away from the day-to-day interactions with the State, that occur mainly in the delivery of public services (see OECD 1995: 47). Managerial accountability is defined here as "making those with delegated authority answerable for carrying out agreed tasks according to agreed criteria of performance" (Day & Klein, 1987: 27).

interest, the definition, training and certification of policy competencies demands transparency and an independent evaluation and review. At the same time, the involvement of a wider set of actors poses the problem that, from now on, HRD strategies may cease to depend on the internal planning capacities of the different ministries. In turn, this could result in the dispersion of actions, lack of communication and the establishment of a system based on isolated training interventions. The challenge is how to ensure standards and compatibility of different development methods (training, education, promotion, etc.) either with civil service entry requirements or with the skills governments need today, across different departments and ministries. In this respect, each civil service must define the appropriate role of existing central training institutions in sustaining a coherent overall HRD policy and, at the same time, one that is flexible enough to accommodate competition and a plurality of approaches to public servant's training.

National education and training institutes can play a pivotal role, especially in the *certification* of policy competencies. On the one hand, one of the common mistakes of centralised HRD strategies in the public sector is their isolation from other aspects of human resource management, especially remuneration and career paths, with the consequence that public officers lack the incentives to actively involve themselves in different learning experiences. On the other, the defence of an integrated *esprit de corps* across the public sector and the enhancement of the public *ethos* demand a coherent approach to competency development, in agreement with higher political authorities. In order to bridge these gaps, national public administration institutes could establish a system of competency certification for the public sector that provides a unified definition of the competencies to be developed and of the methods and standards of certification, while at the same time providing decentralized and flexible methods for the provision of guidance, training and development to each ministry or unit.

A certification of competencies system serves the following goals: to promote the continuous learning of staff; to guarantee the transferability of such competencies between different organizational environments and to establish a standardized and professional way to evaluate people's competency development. Such a system could function according to the following criteria:

- The definition of the policy competencies to be certified is made by the central personnel office or an analogous unit, in agreement with the political leadership, and with the technical support of the national public administration institution (NPAI), eventually helped by consultants.
- The definition of the different certification grades to be awarded and the procedures to be followed must be defined by the NPAI, in collaboration with independent experts, professional associations and academic institutions.
- The different levels or grades of certification to which public servants can apply may be based on competencies linked to different stages in the public policy cycle, as this has proven an effective way to facilitate the understanding and learning of the people to be certified.¹⁵

¹⁵ See Olowu, 2001.

- The NPAI will grant the certificates and provide the necessary procedures to assess the candidate's evidence of achievement, independently from the line managers or the political authorities.
- The necessary support and training conducive to the certification can be delivered centrally by the NAPI or by providers that compete freely for contracts with different ministries and units.
- This system could be linked to career development and pay scales by introducing a ranking scale parallel to the grading of a person's post: a public servant would be ranked by two criteria, the level of responsibility of its post and by the level of certification that has been granted to him. This "matrix" arrangement (similar to the one that exists in the German civil service) could then be used to assign higher pay to those officers that have achieved higher levels of certification, even though they may occupy positions with the same hierarchical grade than other officers. This could be a strong incentive for continuous learning. Even more, the job descriptions of different posts could demand certain level of certification to candidates competing to be appointed, therefore linking the certification system with career paths.

In this way, the problems of ensuring that the right people are available at the right time and place are reduced and the integrity and professionalism of the policymaking process is protected and promoted.

3.5. Concluding Remarks

Human Resource Development for policy capacity requires complex strategies and collaboration among a wide network of actors in and outside of government that cannot be restricted to the education of economists in the Ministry of Finance or the Central Bank or the creation of pockets of efficiency.

HRD for policy capacity presupposes a holistic approach that will necessarily involve reforming internal management practices, institutional frameworks of relationships between the State and society, and the redefinition of the roles of schools and institutes of Public Administration.

Bureaucrats have been frequently a useful scapegoat for governments' lack of policy capacity. In many cases, elected politicians have criticized civil servants but have not shown interest in investing time to develop the capacity of the public sector's personnel. Therefore, a key factor of success is deep political commitment and ownership by local politicians and public officers of the proposed HRD strategies. Otherwise, all efforts will be lost in the waves of everyday practical problems and emergencies.

References

- Aguilar L.F. (ed.) (1992) *El estudio de las política públicas* [*The Study of Public Policies*]. Mexico: Miguel Ángel Porrúa Editor.
- Aguilar L.F. (ed.) (1992) *La Hechura de las Políticas* [*Policy Making*]. Mexico: Miguel Ángel Porrúa Editor.
- Aguilar L.F. (ed.) (1992) *La Implementación de las políticas* [*The Implementation of Policies*]. Mexico: Miguel Ángel Porrúa Editor.
- Aguilar L.F. (ed.) (1992) *Problemas Públicos y Agenda de Gobierno* [*Public Problems and Government Agenda*]. Mexico: Miguel Ángel Porrúa Editor.
- Armstrong, M. (2001). *A Handbook of Human Resource Management Practice*, London: Kogan Page, 18th ed.
- Barzelay, M. (2000), *The New Public Management. Improving Research and Policy Dialogue*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Borins, S. (1999), "Trends in training public managers" in *International Public Management Journal*, vol. 2: 299-314.
- Boyatzis, R. (1982). *The Competent Manager*. New York: Wiley.
- Bullock, Mountford and Stanley (2001). *Better Policy-making*. London: Centre for Management and Policy Studies.
- Cabinet Office (1999). *Professional Policy Making for the Twenty First Century*. London: The Cabinet Office.
- Day, P. and R. Klein (1987) *Accountabilities. Five Public Services*, London: Tavistock Publications.
- DeLeon, L. (1998) "Accountability in a 'Reinvented' government" in *Public Administration*, vol 76, pp. 539-558.
- Dror, Y. (1997) "Delta-type senior civil service for the 21st century" in *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, vol. 63: 7-23.
- Farham, D. and S. Horton (2002), "HRM Competency Framework in the British Civil Service" in S. Horton, A. Hondeghm and D. Farham (eds.), *Competency Management in the Public Sector. European variations on a theme*. Amsterdam: IOS Press-International Institute of Administrative Sciences.
- Healy, O. (2001), "Training and public sector reform: an integrated approach" in *Public Administration and Development*, vol. 21: 309-319.
- Hilderbrand, M.E. and M.S. Grindle (1997) "Building sustainable capacity in the public sector" in Grindle, M.S. (ed.) *Getting good government*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- Maor, M. (2000), "A Comparative Perspective on Executive Development: Trends in 11 European Countries" in *Public Administration*, vol. 78: 135-152.
- McGill, I. and L. Beaty (1992). *Action learning. A practitioner's Guide*. London: Kogan Page.
- Merton, R. K. (1957). *Social theory and social structure*. Revised and enlarged ed. New York; London: Free Press of Glencoe-Collier-Macmillan.
- Pollit, C. et. Al. (1999). *Performance or Compliance. Performance Audit and Public Management in Five Countries*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- OECD (1995) *Governance in transition. Public Management Reforms in OECD Countries*. Paris: OECD.
- Olowu, D. (2001). "Capacity building for policy management: lessons of an African case", in *Teaching Public Administration*, vol. 21, pp. 36-54.
- Rao, T.V. (1996). *Human Resources Development. Experiences, interventions, strategies*. London: SAGE.
- Reichard, C. (1998), "Education and training for New Public Management" in *International Public Management Journal*, 1(1998), pp. 177-194.
- Reichard, C. (2002), "Experiments with new teaching models and methods" in *International Public Management Review*, vol. 3(2).
- Reilly, W. (1979) *Training administrators for development. An introduction for public servants and government training officers*. London: Heinemann Educational.
- Solesbury, W. (2001) *Evidence Bases Policy: Whence it Came and Where it's Going*. London: ESRC UK Centre for Evidence Bases Policy and Practice [Working paper 1].
- World Bank (1997), *World Development Report. The State in a Changing World*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- World Bank (1998), *World Development Report. Knowledge and Information for Development*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Internet sites:

http://www.cabinet-office.gov.uk/2001/news/011212_eenvoystrat.htm

<http://policyhub.gov.uk/servlet/DocViewer/docnoredirect=1472/>

<http://www.clad.org.ve/consensosantacruz.html>

<http://www.clad.org.ve/congreso/congreso3.html>

<http://www.summit-americas.org/chileplan-spanish.htm>

Part Two

Leadership Capacity Development Strategies in the Public Service

Chapter IV

Strengthening the human capacity and leadership in the public sector for achieving the Millennium Development Goals

John-Mary Kauzya

4.1. Introduction

Eradicating poverty is one of the greatest challenges our world faces today. Despite the best intentions of the United Nations and its Member States, over the last few decades, the reduction of poverty has not been as significant as we had wished. There is virtually no country without a single pocket of poverty. Unfortunately, however, there are many countries in which poverty is less the exception than the common plight of a large number of citizens. In particular, developing countries face a number of challenges. At the United Nations Millennium Summit in the year 2000 heads of Government and State gathered together and resolved to commit their energy and efforts to achieving a number of broad goals. These are contained in the United Nations Millennium Declaration, and they include:

- Upholding human rights, and fostering democracy and good governance;
- Ensuring peace, security and disarmament;
- Promoting development and poverty eradication;
- Fostering environmental protection;
- Protecting the vulnerable; and
- Meeting the special needs of Africa.

The Millennium Development Goals, which are to be met by 2015, foresee to:

- Halve the proportion of extreme poverty and hunger
- Achieve universal primary education
- Promote gender equality and empower women
- Reduce child mortality
- Improve maternal health
- Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria, etc.
- Ensure Environmental Sustainability
- Develop global partnership for resource mobilization

What are the demands imposed on public administration by the tasks related to following up and implementing the Millennium development goals? It has been pointed out that Governments of developing countries have overwhelming responsibilities and chronic resource constraints, not only in terms of the national political and management responsibilities, but also in terms of responsibilities vis-à-vis the international community. As clearly stated in paragraph 2 of the Millennium

Declaration, heads of States recognize that, "in addition to our separate responsibilities to our individual societies, we have a collective responsibility to uphold the principles of human dignity, equality and equity at the global level. As leaders we have a duty therefore to all the world's people, especially the most vulnerable and, in particular, the children of the world, to whom the future belongs".

In general terms, mainstreaming the goal of poverty reduction within the Millennium Development Goals will require public administration to be more engaging and receptive; more skilled and visionary; more open and transparent; more facilitating and guiding; and more just.

The overall imperatives of MDGs and the implications for public administration are thus multiple. First, it must be said that the MDGs are a complex package of goals and targets requiring a great deal of harmonization, re-organization and re-orientation in the public sector. Second, in terms of goals and targets, a clear focus on social development is at the basis of both the UN Millennium Declaration and the Road Map towards the implementation of the MDGs, stressing the need for a social or "pro-poor" orientation to all aspects of development management – the strategies, tools and techniques. Third, there is an increased need to gather data, conduct analyses, policy advice, integrated implementation, followed by results-oriented monitoring of the achievement of the MDGs.

Fourth, new options, strategies and tools are needed on the one hand, to generate more resources internally and on the other, to use existing resources in a more efficient way (Making the \$ go further concept). In particular, new means, options and technologies are needed to harness more the resources at the national level, e.g. improved taxation; to maximize returns on invested resources/public programmes; and to engage people into the monitoring process to ensure quality in service delivery – the "score-card" system, etc. Furthermore, continuous dialoguing at the international level for enhanced resource mobilization, debt relief, improved deals and FDIs will also be necessary.

Fifth, in order to achieve the MDGs, governments should promote a value or culture shift from sector-oriented planning to socially-oriented goal-based planning; and from over-emphasis of macro-economic stabilization to pro-poor policies. For this purpose, it is critical to promote the internal re-alignment of institutions for better connectivity in order for public officials to work as a whole, and not in a fragmented way. Moreover, it is of great importance to foster more engaging governance arrangements to allow civil society organizations, the private sector and the community to participate more fully in the policy processes of the Government.

Last but not least, building capacity of the public sector staff in analytical and policy advising work; creating an incentive structure that can attract the best talents to the public sector; and protecting civil service from the process of politicization/political interferences are also among the most important imperatives in order for countries to be able to meet the MDGs. As the United Nations Committee of Experts on Public Administration noted in its first and second report, strengthening good governance is about capacity-building through institutions and people. The knowledge, skills, networks and attitudes of people in the public sector are at the heart of the performance of States, for it is through people and by people that services are planned and delivered, critical innovations conceived and realized, and needed reforms carried out.

4.2. Human resources capacity-building in the public sector

Governments all over the world need to face the challenge of having in place adequate human resources in the public sector in order to plan, implement, monitor and evaluate policies and strategies for achieving the Millennium Development Goals, including poverty eradication. There is a general tendency to believe that the problem of inadequacy of human capacity in the public sector only affects developing countries. True, developing countries are being confronted with these serious problems; however, since in the context of globalization eradicating poverty in one corner of the world is equally a responsibility of all countries, developed countries also need to have the appropriate human capacity to understand, dialogue and negotiate with developing countries. If this capacity is lacking, then the job of poverty eradication becomes harder. In brief, a visionary and committed leadership as well as adequate human resources at the global, regional, national, and community levels are required to meet effectively the MDGs.

At the national level, the quality of public sector human resources is crucial in enabling the State to provide leadership in defining a home-grown governance framework and national appropriation of the Millennium Development Goals. The State needs to provide leadership in this process through law-making, regulatory and security-related functions, as it is the ultimate guarantor of life, liberty and property. Moreover, developing strong leadership and adequate human resources in the public sector is a crucial task in order for any country to prosper and undertake programmes that are aimed at reducing poverty. Finally, an effective public sector is essential in creating an enabling environment for private sector development and economic competitiveness.

Strengthening public sector human resources capacities is, however, not an easy task and many are the difficulties that need to be overcome. Although all countries around the world are facing a number of challenges in modernizing their public sector, developing countries are facing even greater difficulties due to a number of factors, which include:

- The changing role of the State due to national and international factors;
- The erosion of public sector human resources capacity, and especially scarcity of effective public managers;
- The constraints in recruiting highly qualified personnel.

The reform of the public sector in developing countries has been greatly affected by constraints in recruiting high-quality personnel. The main factors that may describe this phenomenon are as follows: a loss of pride within and credibility outside the public service; brain drain to the private sector and to more economically advanced countries due to better salaries and career opportunities; and a gradual decay of national governance structures in stagnating countries. Human resources public sector reform has also been particularly difficult as the core competencies needed in the public sector have evolved and changed in a number of ways as a result of the changes taking place at the national and international levels.

Given this extremely complex situation, what the public sector needs more than ever is its fair share of the best talent in any given country to respond effectively to evolving traditional functions of the State, as well as the challenges of globalization and other social changes. Moreover, it is important to underline that improving human capacity in the public sector also requires sound public institutions and good governance. In other words, strengthening public sector capacity requires a holistic approach, which should begin by rebuilding trust in the public sector and promoting high-quality leadership. There are key issues that need to be addressed in order to promote adequate capacities among public servants, including:

- Reinforcing human resources planning and management systems and units;
- Reinforcing core public service values, such as:
 - Revaluation of learning, integrity and competence;
 - Low tolerance for corruption and crime;
 - Stress on meritocracy;
 - Growing sensitivity towards and respect for citizens' needs;
- Fostering a political culture that places emphasis on the respect for institutions and norms over personal interest;
- Promoting professionalism in the public service;
- Creating a culture of learning organization;
- Introducing incentive structures, such as:
 - Fair remuneration system; and
 - Increasing recognition of the need to acknowledge and to reward industry, loyalty, accomplishment and merit;
- Increasing recognition of the value of cross-cultural and international links as means towards the improvement of the professional image and performance of the public service;
- Tapping the best talent from underrepresented groups, including women; and
- Promoting the knowledge and use of ICT tools.

4.3. Effective leadership and good governance

Fostering effective leadership is perhaps one of the most important and first steps to take in the reform of the public sector human resources. Effective leadership is critical to the future of governance, of democracy and of people's well-being. In particular, leadership enhancement programmes must be conceived and implemented with the aim of making leaders capable of effectively addressing the key issues facing the world today and the immense tasks required to meet the Millennium Development Goals. Leadership training needs to be interdisciplinary, international and inter-sectoral (involving public and non-profit organizations). Leaders have to develop a cross-sectoral approach to solving problems and this is particularly critical to reducing poverty.

Taking into account the present political environment in an increasing globalizing world, new areas of leadership competency also need to be strengthened, in particular diversity management; knowledge management; horizontal management; resource and information management; partnerships and negotiation skills; communication and ICT skills. Leaders need to be able to deal with more ambiguity and in the face of difficulties and contradictions, including economic liberalism and

social welfare; people getting poorer although they have more voice; and managing change while ensuring stability and security.

Given the diversity of administrative cultures and based on a variety of societal environments, each country leadership has to be open-minded and look at all the potential solutions to their own problems: the key element is to develop a sense of direction for the public service of a given country which takes into account its history, its environment and its position in the global world in a realistic manner.

In the process of public sector leadership capacity development, Management Development Institutes have a critical role to play. They constitute the infrastructure in their respective countries for management development; they have human resources capable of doing management research training and providing technical advisory and consultancy services in different aspects of management. In particular, they can play a leading role in training needs assessment, human resource policy design, personnel development programmes formulation, implementation, as well as monitoring and evaluation. On the one hand, they can assist governments in addressing the capacity needs of high-level government officials by focusing on strengthening expertise in strategic thinking and policy analysis, technical knowledge, and awareness of complex emerging issues. On the other hand, they can assist governments in reinforcing the capacities of civil servants who have to implement public policies by focusing on developing new skills, operational modalities, and techniques.

It is understood that some of these institutes, in fact most of them, will require to have their capacities reinforced, but this does not in any way minimize the role they are supposed to play. In particular, they can greatly contribute to the efforts being undertaken by many Governments in reaching the MDGs. In this respect, they should ensure that they have the appropriate capacity to assist Governments in this task by continuously upgrading their skills and techniques. These institutes may also play a very important role in promoting cooperation and sharing of information since they have networks at the national and regional levels through which they can pool expertise, facilitate exchange of successful practices and share innovative practices. In sum, building leadership capacities is one of the most challenging and urgent tasks that all countries face, and this in turn requires both good policies and institutions.

Chapter V

Promoting Efficiency and Accountability of Senior Officials

Feroza A. Razzaq

5.1. Introduction

A few decades ago an influential group of economists, political scientists, management experts and political leaders all over the world came to believe that the institution of government would have a much diminished and less important role in the days to comeⁱ. However, events have proved them wrong. The role of government, no doubt, has undergone a change but it is no less important today than in the past. Governments everywhere have relinquished or are in the process of relinquishing the management of commercial and industrial enterprises as well as a wide variety of other functions which were added, particularly in developing countries, due to the prevalent ideological trends of the 70's of the last centuryⁱⁱ. Governments are now increasingly becoming enablers, facilitators and regulators. All these functions are incontestably of great importance. Hence, quality of senior government officials, their efficiency and effectiveness have assumed added importance. Similarly, with the adoption of democratic systems of government, it has become very important to strengthen the system of accountability of public officials particularly those who are occupying senior positions.

Undoubtedly, institutions, procedures, techniques, legal and regulatory frameworks play their part in promoting efficiency, effectiveness and accountability, however, it is the civil servants that play the most important role in government. It is therefore of paramount importance to pay constant attention to human resources development. This encompasses, among other things, change in attitudes and behaviours, skill development, capacity for team building and preparation for leadership. In these challenging times, the development of human capital is not a luxury or a fancy term but it is indeed a prerequisite for a functioning government. This paper, though it does not mention human resource development explicitly, it makes reference to it implicitly, as this theme forms the basis for the discussion, analysis and recommendations that follow.

In a developing country the most important task of a government is to alleviate poverty and improve continuously social indicators, as well as provide efficient and effective delivery of services to both poor and non-poor sections of societyⁱⁱⁱ. This requires the formulation of economic and fiscal policies that support pro-poor economic growth, as well as setting up sound institutions which can implement such policies. Policies are laid down by the political executives, i.e. non-bureaucratic people exercising ultimate authority in the government. Institutions are brought into existence with their approval. The process of the policy formulation, however, predominantly draws upon inputs supplied by senior officials. Likewise, designing institutions and implementing policies also depend on the competence, knowledge, commitment and efficiency of senior public officials. Further adoption and

implementation of policies and establishment of institutions depend on a "sound framework of law and public policy, created through efforts of an honest and effective public service and good governance arrangements^{iv}".

Globalization i.e. "the growing integration of economies and societies around the world" is indeed the defining attribute of our turbulent times^v. The present day world has been described as "A Smaller Planet, Spinning Faster^{vi}". Globalization is impacting on all facets of life including public administration. Today we are in a global market place, which is putting huge pressure on our economic and social institutions. We are living in an information society, in which every person can access information as fast as the policy makers. We are living in a knowledge based economy which is rapidly moving from closed systems to flexible boundaries; from fat to lean staffing principles; from traditional bureaucratic hierarchies to the power competencies of ideas and relationships; from experience-based actions to knowledge-based contributions; from compliance to commitment to vulnerability and accountability^{vii}.

The phenomenon of globalization has thus added greatly to the importance of quality decision making in the public sector. In particular, senior officials must be increasingly aware of national and international environment and be able to respond to new challenges and opportunities. If these elements are in short supply in a country, its prospects of success in a global market place are dim and its ability to achieve a reasonable rate of economic growth, critically important for poverty alleviation, would be adversely affected^{viii}. This would turn such a country into a poor globalizer which would be increasingly marginalized and sink more and more in isolation and poverty.

There are a number of operational challenges faced by senior officials, especially in developing countries, emanating from globalization. It is therefore imperative to improve and strengthen public management processes by:

- Slowing down the external transmission of destructive developments in any one country;
- Preventing overreaction; and
- Protecting vulnerable groups and countries from carrying the brunt of the adjustment and being left farther and farther behind^{ix}.

This chapter attempts to provide a critical approach of the concept of efficiency and accountability taking Pakistani senior officials as a case. While isolating issues of efficiency and accountability, the author felt that she may run the risk of understating several virtues of bureaucracy of Pakistan. But in this age of globalization, sharing knowledge and learning from each other is very important. Therefore, a critical appraisal is required in order to avoid the risk of falling into the framework highlighted by Barber and Roger Stacy, "I would hide the frailties and deformities of my political mother and place her virtues and beauties in the most advantageous light." In order to analyse how to improve efficiency and accountability of senior officials, this chapter will look at key concepts of "efficiency", "accountability" and "senior officials". This is followed by a theoretical framework clarifying some conceptual issues, and by exploring key critical areas in the Pakistani senior bureaucracy, identifying the causes of poor efficiency and accountability, and suggesting some practical recommendations.

In this chapter, the author has mainly drawn upon her experience, research and observation of the bureaucracy in Pakistan which is a developing country with a population of 150 million and per capital income of US\$ four hundred fifty^x. Poverty, after a substantial reduction, has increased during the last 5-6 years and nearly 35% of the population^{xi}.

At present, Pakistan's civil bureaucracy is unable to effectively discharge its duties due to several reasons, which *inter alia* include multi-tiered unwieldy bureaucratic structures, stifling rules and regulations, inefficiency, incompetence, ineffectiveness, red tape, inadequate controls, politicization, corruption, apathy, narrow vision, lack of commitment and experience in operating within a democratic system of government. The need to change the prevalent state of affairs is clearly evident, even without taking into account the new demands on the bureaucracy. The need to bring about a fundamental transformation of Pakistan's public administration is indeed critical for the country's future. As a matter of fact, the achievement of all of its key development objectives depends on a responsive, performing, professional and accountable civil service.

Today, delivery of basic social services is indeed one of the most important challenges confronting the public sector. Better performance in this area has become all the more important in view of Pakistan's exceedingly low social indicators. Improvements in government's provision of basic and better quality social services will require greater efficiency, enhanced effectiveness, meaningful accountability as well as a genuine service orientation among both service providers and managers. It will also require adequate technical and management capacity and appropriate incentives. Improving service orientation and accountability, in turn, call for devolution or delegation of responsibility for the provision of local public services to local authorities and overhauling the centralized organizational structure of the civil service^{xii}.

5.2. Concept of Efficiency, Accountability and Senior Official

Before proceeding further, it would be useful to provide a definition of the terms "efficiency", "accountability" and "senior officials".

5.2.1. Efficiency

In the science of administration, whether public or private, the basic 'good' is efficiency. The fundamental objective of the science of administration "is least expenditure of manpower and materials". Efficiency is thus axiom number one in the value scale of administration^{xiii}. Efficiency in the public sector mostly refers to the minimization of costs and, in private enterprise, the maximization of profit.

Efficiency means achieving the same results with lesser amount of inputs or achieving better results of the same kind but without outlay of additional resources. Efficiency is thus a ratio indicating "how much output is achieved for a given level of input at a specified level of volume and quality^{xiv}". Thus efficiency according to economists is "Doing better what is already being done". In the context of the public sector, the goals are more complex and include, for example, the concept of "public service", public accountability and social responsibility.

5.2.2. Accountability

Accountability means that those who hold office in government act responsibly, render account of and are answerable for their acts of commission and omission. Accountability involves the existence of mechanisms to ensure that public officials and political leaders are answerable for their actions and use of public resources, and requires transparent government and a free media^{xv}. Government officials, including senior officials, are there to provide services to citizens who have a right to know that public servants are performing well, "cost effectively, honestly and ethically". This, among other things, requires that public sector performance be measured, which includes effective mechanisms of accountability. (**See Table – 1**) A strong internal chain of accountability implies that officials at each level of the chain regard themselves as answerable to their administrative superiors and are "accountable directly to the public". This stems from the core assumption of a democracy, i.e., it is the public who, through taxes, is paying for the public service.

Accountability without enforcement cannot work. Enforcing external accountability means the capacity of institutions external to bureaucracy, such as individuals exercising political authority, legislators, quasi judicial and judicial authorities, to call public officials to respond for their actions and omissions.

Accountability is one of the four interconnected pillars of good governance. Schiavo points out that accountability, transparency, predictability and participation are of pivotal importance for the functioning of a democracy and they can be grouped into two main components, namely Answerability and Consequences.

First, answerability (the original meaning of the word "responsibility") implies that public officials respond periodically to questions concerning how they used their authority, where the resources went, and what was achieved with them. (The dialogue itself matters more than any bean counting or mechanistic recitation of outputs.) Second, there is a need for predictable and meaningful consequences (not necessarily punitive; not necessarily monetary; not necessarily individual)^{xvi}.

It is all the more essential to fortify external accountability in the context of greater decentralization or the devolution of authority. Checks and balances are necessary to ensure that access to and quality of public services is not compromised especially for the poorer areas or poorest segments of the population.

Table 1 ACCOUNTABILITY IN GOVERNMENT AND SOCIETY Separation of Powers Patterns of Accountability	
ACCOUNTABILITY Defined	
The requirement to act responsibly and to report ; to act and give account	
ACCOUNTABILITY In Central Government	
Institution	Accountable to:
Ministers – decide policies • Parliament/Legislature – check on policies – check on Ministers • Civil/Public Service – service to people enforce regulations implement policies formulate policies The Judiciary – justice • The Army – defence – law and order	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Parliament – (Prime Minister) • People, electorate – voice – votes • Ministers, and – Customers clients (“users”) the public Parliament – but secure tenure • Minister – the Government • Local Authority, or Parliament – or citizens
ACCOUNTABILITY in Civil Society	
Institution, functions	Accountability
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Political parties • Private business – production, service • NGOs, CSOs – (e.g. Trade Unions, Religious bodies) welfare, development special interests • Press and media – inform, criticize build consensus? • Families – Welfare social knowledge 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Members – Supporters, public • Shareholders – workers, customers • Members – contributors supporters public • Owners & public – (transparency?) the public, the courts • Each other – society

Source: <http://www.undp-paragon.org/rqp/data/accountability.pdf> last visited June 02, 2004.

5.2.3. Senior Officials

The term Senior Officials refers to those supervisory officials who are strategically placed in the hierarchy and are mainly responsible for providing inputs to policy making and advising of political superiors, such as Ministers. They also supervise the implementation of policies at headquarters, i.e. Secretariat as well as public

management in the field. The secretariat is divided into divisions, departments sections, bureaus etc. A division is the policy making structure of the bureaucracy headed by a Secretary of the Government and other officials subordinate to him. The Secretary is the official head of the division and is responsible for its efficient administration and discipline, as well as for the proper conduct of business and implementation of policies. He/she also ensures that funds are spent in accordance with the rules. He reports to the Minister in charge of his division. The Minister is either a member of the National Assembly or the Senate. Every important policy decision is taken with the approval of the Prime Minister, but the Rules of Business assign to the Secretary the role of principal advisor to the Minister in the policy making process^{xvii}. Although most of the senior officials are drawn from career service, their appointment is totally at the discretion of the Prime Minister. The Secretaries of government in Pakistan thus form a group of very senior officials. They are on the whole experienced, intelligent and competent individuals and their advice is not easily ignored by the Ministers. They exercise a great deal of power and influence. The Additional Secretaries and Joint Secretary are also senior officials. Thus Secretaries, Additional, Joint Secretary or equivalent are regarded as Senior Officials. The word "senior officials" is used interchangeably for head of Provincial government, departments' head of public enterprises, head of autonomous bodies and other officials at the level of policy making and implementation.

5.2.4. State of Governance and Efficiency in Pakistan

Since independence (1947), constant efforts have been made till date to improve efficiency, performance and accountability of Senior Officials. The concept of good governance has assumed significance in the last decade as a system wedded to the ethos, needs and aspirations of the people. Good governance, as UNDP highlights, amongst other things, participatory, transparent, accountable, effective, and equitable and promotes the rule of Law. Briefly, governance is concerned with the use of political authority and exercise of control over society and the management of its resources for equitable, social and economic development. Hence, democratic governance contemplates the achievement of a certain level of economic and political stability, the management of social conflict and arrangements by which various social groups can cooperate with each other in the political and economic life of the country.

Good governance in Pakistan has eluded the masses since its independence. At several occasions, governance has been based on personal whims, influential connections and vested interests of civil and military bureaucracy which is riddled with inefficiency and low performance. There are several causes for the above scenario some of these *inter alia* include, prolonged political instability, weak political structures, corruption of public enterprise senior officials, mismanaged financial institutions, misused media freedom, increased public sector unproductive costs, lower productivity, unmanageable inequality undermining safety nets and security systems; erosion of the legitimacy of the government, bloated, inefficient and arrogant bureaucracy and other causes which we will be discussing below. As the scope of the study is limited to efficiency and accountability of senior officials, an effort is made to clarify the conceptual issues in the following pages.

5.3. Some conceptual issues

5.3.1. Issue of Efficiency and Effectiveness (4 Es)

While discussing efficiency of senior officials, it would be relevant to address, in the first instance, the following issues:

- (a) Whether discussing how to improve efficiency alone is meaningful;
- (b) Whether it would be appropriate to focus on the remaining two E's of public management, i.e. economy and effectiveness;
- (c) Whether the three E's make sense only with reference to performance;
- (d) Whether it would be also appropriate to bring the fourth 'E', i.e. ethics to fully cover the operational spectrum of public management.

No one would deny the importance of efficiency, particularly in the context of developing countries, which suffer from a chronic shortage of resources both financial and human. Economy alludes to the process of "acquiring goods and services of a given quality at the lowest cost". Efficiency subsumes economy because, among other things, it seeks production at the lowest possible unit cost.

However, efficiency by itself really does not result in optimizing outputs and results. In order to ensure that efficiency is beneficial, it is necessary to add a dimension of effectiveness which focuses on opportunities and outcomes. Effectiveness, as Drucker says, "does not ask 'Do this or better', instead it is concerned if efforts are really leading to extraordinary results. One should then ask: "To what results should the resources and efforts be allocated so as to produce extraordinary results rather than the ordinary ones which is all efficiency can possibly produce^{xviii}". This does not mean that efficiency is not important. Yet the most efficient organization cannot survive, not to speak of thriving, if it is efficient in doing the wrong things i.e. if it lacks effectiveness. Effectiveness, as Drucker further explains, is the foundation of success – efficiency is a minimum condition for survival after success has been achieved. Efficiency is concerned with doing things right. Effectiveness is doing the right things^{xix}. Let me illustrate with an example, covering E's in the context of a vaccination programme. The criterion of economy calls for procurement of quality vaccine at the lowest cost as mentioned earlier, and in good time; efficiency calls for maximum number of vaccinations given the resources available; effectiveness entails the highest reduction of disease.

In view of the foregoing discussion, I would like to accord equal importance to enhancing both efficiency and effectiveness of senior officers. (It would be pertinent to point out that all the three E's make sense only with reference to the enhancement of the quality of performance. Public management experts, policy makers and implementers of policy and Senior Officials should really focus on the improvement of performance. Efficiency and Effectiveness are to be valued as to how these affect performance of senior officials). Hence performance improvement subsumes improvement in 2 E's or rather 3 E's of public management^{xx}.

5.3.2. Issues relating to performance

Introducing a stronger performance orientation should be therefore of paramount importance. Yet this task is neither simple nor self evident^{xxi}. Performance has to be measured through the yardstick of results. This means that "results" should be carefully defined. These can be specified, according to experts in terms of input (i.e.

resources expended to produce a public service) or outputs (i.e. the service itself), or outcomes (i.e. the purpose achieved through the service). Thus the criteria for performance are “economy, efficiency and effectiveness” (3Es) respectively. It would be, however, appropriate to apply the relevant indicators that are applicable to each case. Each of these has its own advantages and disadvantages.

Exclusive focus on good procurement and utilization of inputs leads to a “mean mentality”, which neglects the purposes for which the resources are obtained. Output indicators are more appropriate for activities close to the ultimate user but not for upstream public activities such as policy analysis. Outcome indicators are generally more relevant, but also less useful for allocating responsibility. And attention to due process, which is essential for the long term, becomes sterile formalism if it is viewed as an end in itself. Because outputs are more quantifiable but more narrow, while outcomes are broader but also influenced by factors outside the control of the civil servant or organization in charge, there is an accountability trade-off – by which accountability can be either tight but narrow (through output indicators) or broad but loose (through outcome indicators). Consequently, it is important to use a combination of indicators of performance and never to rely exclusively on any single indicator^{xxii}.

Before proceeding further, it would be in order to assess whether efforts to improve public management through the application of 3Es should be supplemented by an ethical dimension.

Thus, a fourth “E” must be added to the mix: Equity. Unless a government takes into fair consideration the circumstances and needs of the poorer and disadvantaged groups in society, the most “efficient” system will not be sustainable, owing to the cumulative internal tensions and to the withdrawal of that voluntary cooperation, which is the cement of good governance. In the short run, there may be a conflict between efficiency objectives and equity objectives; in the long run, there is none^{xxiii}.

5.4. Improving Efficiency, enhancing Effectiveness, achieving better Performance, Equity, Ethics and Accountability.

I will start with the assumption that the most successful, efficient and effective public officials generally work at a low coefficient of performance as measured against their potential. One basic approach to enhance efficiency, effectiveness and accountability is to ask what minor and major changes are required of senior officials in terms of competencies, skills, behaviour, attitude, organizational structure, strategy, rules, regulations, processes, technology and other factors in order to improve or alter existing situations of low efficiency and effectiveness, poor performance, as well as ethics lapses leading to management deficit. Promoting efficiency, enhancing effectiveness and improving performance of senior officers cannot be a one time exercise. The process requires unremitting efforts on a variety of fronts over a long continuous period of time.

5.4.1. Causes of Inefficiency/Poor Performance

In the context of Pakistan, the following are the main causes of inefficiency and poor performance.

- 1) Lack of clarity as to the mission and goals of governmental organizations. Gap between national and international demands of the 21st Century and outmoded capacity of senior officers to meet them.
- 2) An over-centralized organizational structure, as well as rigid, often irrelevant, and unevenly enforced rules which result in delays in responding to clients, and distract senior officials from strategy formulation and policy-making.
- 3) Faulty organizational structures and management processes.
- 4) Decision making is centralized and there is a general failure to delegate. Hierarchical management structures and failure to delegate authority are pervasive practices within the bureaucracy which hampers efficiency.
- 5) The system suffers from deteriorated professionalism and lacks professional orientation, thereby contributing to inefficiency and incompetent public image.
- 6) Poor personnel management is particularly relevant when flawed practices lead to low morale, giving rise to discontent, frustration, low wages and poor public image.
- 7) Low level of skills and shortages in the delivery of public services is due to a variety of reasons such as progressively deteriorating educational standards, inadequate training and human resource development.
- 8) Weak accountability mechanisms. While accountability to external institutions has been all along unsatisfactory in Pakistan, even the internal systems of accountability within the public services relying on instruments such as objective performance evaluation, merit based promotion processes and amenability to official discipline have been greatly weakened.
- 9) Poor incentives and compensation leading to low wages and frustration.
- 10) An inappropriate skills mix, reflecting: (i) the past role of the state as employer of first resort and the associated expansion of employment at low skill levels and (ii) the closed nature of the civil service, which imposes constraints on the government to introduce needed skills at higher grade levels from the market.
- 11) Lack of proper output oriented job descriptions.
- 12) In many cases, the general level of efficiency is deliberately kept low by the concerned officials because of corrupt motives. If there is lack of efficiency, papers do not move quickly enough thereby affording opportunities to public officers to indulge in corrupt practices. In fact, the phenomenon of "speed money" is becoming more and more common. This malpractice was generally found earlier among lower officials. However, the malaise has been spreading upwards to senior echelons.

The causes responsible for the unsatisfactory performance of the public sector can be tackled in the short term or in a medium term time horizon. Others would, e.g. improvement in education system, require efforts extending over a very long period of time.

5.4.2. The Pakistan scenario – efforts to improve Efficiency and Accountability

In this section, an attempt will be made to selectively focus on efficiency and accountability of senior officials in Pakistan as reforms to address these issues have been initiated from time to time. Since 1947 one might even say that Pakistani bureaucracy has been perpetually in a reform mode. There have been a number of commissions and committee assigned with the task of implementing reforms in order to improve the performance of public administration^{xxiv}. However, none of the reports

of these Commission and Committees could be fully implemented, essentially, due to lack of political will and entrenched vested interests. Few recommendations, have been implemented, resulting in some improvement but far less than what is needed in a developing country facing the challenges of the 21st Century.

I would take the above argument a step forward by arguing that different governments, politicians, army and senior public officials implemented those parts of reforms they liked and failed to implement the recommendation not suitable to their vested interests.

5.5. Human Resource Development and Senior Officials

A clear paradigm shift is taking place as senior officials are increasingly committed to good governance and public management. The concept of governance is reshaping due to drivers of change – global interdependence, communication and information revolution and the rising expectations of the masses to be involved in the decisions of the government. Access to information, transparency of decisions can dramatically strengthen accountability, improve efficiency and effectiveness. Human Resource rejuvenation is the key to the renewal of public management. The civil Service in general and senior officials, in particular, require a different set of skills to manage these turbulent times. Capacity building of senior public officials must become the top priority of governments that wish to achieve sound policy objectives in general and delivery of services in particular.

There is an overall shortage of training opportunities at all levels of hierarchy. The shortage is due to several reasons including the fact that training is often treated as a discrete event rather than part of an overall human resource development strategy. Competent trainers are in short supply and trainers get few opportunities to enhance their skills in “Training and updating knowledge”. A big portion of the training curricula and material is based on borrowed and often outdated models. The classroom based lecture style training/teaching dominates most training programs. Most of the training material is theoretical whereas inter-linkages with the actual work environment are less than desired. Training evaluation, impact assessment and monitoring of job performance are rarely measured. However for training of senior officials, Pakistan has made significant progress. Some institutions which are performing well in terms of capacity-building include National Institutes of Public Administration, (NIPA, in all the four provinces) the Pakistan Administrative Staff College (PASC) in Lahore and the National Defence College (NDC) in Islamabad. A very effective measure taken in this connection is the requirement that all government officials complete courses at NIPA and the Administrative Staff College before being eligible for a promotion at the senior level. This step is adding great value to the capacity of civil servants and helping them to bridge the gap between their capacities and competencies and requirements of the present times. In order to further strengthen training programmes so that they provide public officials with the necessary skills to meet the many challenges of contemporary democracies, Pakistan is taking a lead by creating the “National School of Public Policy” (NSPP) at Lahore^{xxv}. The proposed school collaborates with John F. Kennedy School of government, Harvard University. It will comprise of a qualified faculty, conduct continuous research in public policy and management, serve as a think tank and impart required training to senior public officials.

5.6. State of Governance and Accountability in Pakistan

The present governance and accountability systems are widely believed not to be adequate for Pakistani socio-economic needs. Minor adjustments and patchy solutions adopted from time to time did not bring about any significant change. All the changing governments in Pakistan have been conscious of the need to strengthen inner accountability and increase effectiveness of external accountability. A number of measures to strengthen accountability have been undertaken in Pakistan, including the following.

5.6.1. Accountability Culture

The record of Pakistani's political elite in enforcing accountability is unenviable considering that political governments have been sacked for alleged corruption and mismanagement on several occasions. However, each succeeding elected government conducted itself in the same manner. Further, each successive government, be it democratic or military, established different accountability mechanisms. But such efforts have been sporadic and usually tailored to the desire of freshly formed governments to acquire popularity and credibility as champions of clean government.

There are specific institutions forming part of the accountability system such as the public accounts committees (PAC)^{xxvi} of the legislature, the legislature itself, the Ombudsman, the National Accountability Bureau and courts of law. There, is of course, an internal accountability system in the administrative hierarchy. Every official is accountable to report to their superior. This chain starts from the rules clerk to the Assembly. However, accountability mechanisms have not been able to deliver effectively. The rules and procedures of bureaucracies providing services are not simple or transparent, thus leading to corruption and maladministration. Judicial control on corruption and maladministration is not effective. Channels for citizen's complaints are available in some form, but these channels suffer from the inherent defect of bias in favour of the bureaucracy.

At present, there is an absence of modern management accountability techniques. Weak accountability controls stem from inadequate separation of duties and functions, inadequate supervision of staff, absence of surprise checks, no rotation of staff, weak asset and inventory management, reliance on improperly maintained manual records. Enforcement of internal controls is lax and selective due to the absence of result oriented job descriptions linked to institutional outputs and culture pattern.

5.6.2. Politicization of the Civil Service Decision-Making Process

Another factor which calls for special attention and priority to strengthening the system of accountability is the fact that senior officials have become increasingly politicized and open to manipulation by powerful political interests. The interference and influence peddling in routine decisions, including appointments, transfers, and promotions of individual government functionaries (even with respect of junior officials e.g. primary school teachers, clerks, and orderlies), as well as decisions concerning the locations for schools and health facilities, has been increasing. During the past years of democratic rule (i.e. from 1988 – 1999), a shift seems to have taken place, i.e. relationships between bureaucrats and politicians have gone from being "adversarial to being collusive". Political interference has substantially

increased and government officials find it tempting to yield to pressures in the absence of an effective accountability.

5.7. Recommendations on Improving Accountability and Performance

Measures to improve accountability and performance are imperative for the survival of the country. Enhancing public service performance in the management of public resources, transparency in its operations, and accountability to the public will go a long way toward tackling the country's chronic governance problems.

In the following pages, a number of suggestions are made as to how to enhance efficiency and accountability of senior officials in Pakistan. Most of the proposed measures may also be more or less applicable in other developing countries.

(a) Mission Statement and Efficiency:

The lack of clarity of mission, goals and strategy of government organizations leads to massive inefficiency.

Recommendation:

- Every secretary of Division must revise the division's mission statement, define and redefine the goals and objectives of the division with annual targets in line with the growing expectations of the Government of Pakistan (GOP) and the public.

(b) Administrative and Functional Restructuring:

The demands posed on governments in the 21st century have changed, but the abilities of senior officials are outmoded to meet them. Institutional mechanisms to keep the governmental organization under continuous review are badly needed. Due to inadequate monitoring and control, the federal government has become heavily tiered, static, outdated and dysfunctional, which hinders the efficiency and effectiveness of senior officials.

Recommendations:

- An organizational setup is to be introduced within the divisions, e.g. setting up of an efficiency unit for continuous monitoring and inspections. This unit would monitor and conduct inspections on behalf of the senior officials, remove impediments and report regularly to senior officials.
- For functional restructuring, every Secretary may have one of the Joint Secretaries allocated the work of a person whose job description may include:
 - Assist the secretary to eliminate delays in finalization of cases.
 - Expedite Inter – ministerial Communications.
 - Take care of non policy related issues.
 - Attend to complaints and delays for cases disposal.
 - Check, Inspect and monitor case movement.
 - Help speedy disposal of cases on priority basis.

(c) Inefficiency of the Government of Pakistan as an Enabler:

Senior officials play a vital role in ensuring that the federal government is more receptive to the needs of the public and that it delivers services efficiently.

Recommendations:

- A commission, or a body or a consultative committee should be constituted or strengthened and institutionalised having major interest groups as members, in addition to senior officials chaired by the federal secretary of each division.
- Senior officers must strive hard to introduce various surveys for client's needs and grievances.
- Simplify and consolidate laws, key rules and procedures.
- Introduce effective mechanisms to redress complaints.
- Encourage the development of alternate mechanism to redress complaints, e.g. Citizens Advice Centres with the support of the NGO's sector.
- Introduce an effective transparent culture of openness and empowerment of the citizen as a client.
- Gender empowerment by providing opportunities to women and minorities.
- Surveys on the needs of the poor.

(d) Inefficiency and poor accountability of the Government of Pakistan as a Regulator:

The civil service reforms commission report of 1997 committee on Downsizing the Federal government advocated "changes in the character of the government from that of provider to that of a regulator and enabler". For effective, transparent and even handed regulations, the Government of Pakistan's regulatory role was either inadequate e.g. quality control, or stifling rules for new business and licensing.

Recommendations:

- There is a need for effective regulation which will help accountability and enhance efficiency of senior officials.
- New skills are required for regulators and regulatory functions to encourage development.
- Activate public procurement Regulatory Authority.
- Introduce automation, transparency and equitable regulations.
- Bring positive attitudinal change in senior official's behaviour.

(e) Inadequate office automation and technology:**Recommendations:**

- Many of the improvements in service delivery could be made possible by providing technological resources to senior officials in the form of information highways – provision of electronic mail, internet - databank and other information. Such a development would equip senior officials to take knowledge based policy and implementation decisions. This brings in the need to invest in human resource development of senior officials along with their support staff.
- There are several other potential areas of senior officials' workplace where computers can be used for planning, administration record keeping, monitoring and evaluation. Two major challenges in introducing information technology are the issues of privacy and transparency and that of cost.

(f) Inter/Ministerial and Intra/Ministerial Coordination:

Inadequate or lack of coordination becomes a stumbling block for senior officials to achieve high levels of efficiency and performance. This weakness has led to faulty decisions, delays, inaction, inefficiency and sour public image.

Recommendations:

- Senior officials must enforce policy measures for better inter-ministerial coordination and communication. Capacity building for senior officials in the fields of coordination, communication, ethics, team building and decision making are crucial to enhancing efficiency and effectiveness.
- Some Action Training may be considered for senior officials in the above areas to improve departmental efficiency at horizontal as well as hierarchical levels.

(g) Inadequate Performance Evaluation and Management Review:

Absence or inadequate performance evaluation of the Division's senior officials at the Secretary Level, leads to inefficiency, ineffectiveness and lax accountability of the job incumbent.

Recommendations:

- A periodic management review by a third party or through Management Services Division professionals^{xxvii} is greatly needed. It may be conducted to define performance standards for each division based on mutually agreed standards by senior officials and other government officials. The performance of the division and the job incumbent must be reviewed each year to delete or add new indicators.

(h) Red Tape and Inefficiency:

There is a tendency on the part of senior officers to accept whatever has been sent by the section officer four tiers lower in the bureaucracy. Hence, at times, senior officials accept the work several layers below their own knowledge and status. Thus processing takes a long time and this adds to red tape and inefficiency.

Recommendations:

- It is recommended that more delegation or devolving is required. The above process delays action and produces unmanageable files for senior officials who are already busy with other matters.

(i) Generalist versus Specialist:

High value is placed on the generalist selected civil service group. The administrative tradition of Pakistan since independence indicates that the top ranks of the civil service are occupied by generalists. In several occasions, generalists review technical files leading to wrong policy and implementation decisions which create harmful and expensive results.

Recommendations:

- A workable compromise is required to involve technical heads to advise and assist the senior generalist officials.
- Senior positions must be opened to all occupational, professional and business groups to add balance to the generalist tradition.

(j) Training and Development

Human Resource Development and Management are not in consonance with today's needs. The lack of appropriate skills breeds incompetence and develops a culture

based on low work ethics, poor decision making and dodging accountability leading to poor performance, inefficiency and poor effectiveness.

Recommendations:

- An in-house training should be institutionalised. Rollout training in key areas should be imparted in such areas as information technology, management skills, customer service, delivery of services, financial accounting, human relations, team building, policy analysis, decision making, impact assessment and others.
- Follow through the plans of institutional strengthening of key training institutions including that of the proposed National School of Public Policy.
- The training institute's curriculum needs to be revamped for continuous retraining.
- Introduce capacity building programs for senior most executives (grade 21 – 22).
- The training courses must be structured from the very beginning of the public career of officials.
- Training programmes for staff need to be strengthened by including basic knowledge, practical experience and ongoing training from national and international sources coupled with motivation and incentive mechanisms to learn and move forward with dignity.
- Develop a comparative grading system for trainees so as to motivate and inculcate a competitive spirit.

5.7.2. Measures to improve accountability

(a) Financial Accountability and Inefficiency:

The Ministries and divisions do not have any empirically quantifiable performance indicators on which the efficiency and accountability of the Government of Pakistan could be measured. The office of the Auditor General has recently introduced performance audit for large size projects of the Federal government. Due to weaknesses in the single entry accounting system, the realistic picture of government assets and liabilities cannot be measured. Hence secretaries and other top level officials (who are principal accounting officers) have no in-depth knowledge of the extent of misappropriation. The Public Accounts Committee (PAC) also considers cases of misappropriation after several years, due to inefficiency, lack or delay in data availability, lack of expertise of support staff, or corruption and several similar reasons. In order to rectify this malaise a few recommendation are given below.

Recommendations:

- There should be a move towards commercial accounting indicating assets and liabilities in order to improve the financial accountability of the government. The computerization and automation of such data would help to improve efficiency and effectiveness of senior officials. There is a need for preparing mutually acceptable (Federal Minister, Secretary and other senior officials) performance indicators in order to measures efficiency, effectiveness and accountability. The performance may be measured against the indicators and revised annually by the Federal Minister of each department.
- In order to enhance the accountability of senior officials, the cases of misappropriation should be sent to Public Accounts Committee^{xxviii} (PAC)

- immediately after the episode. The Principal Accounting officials (federal secretary & other senior officials) should be asked to appear before PAC to defend the alleged misappropriations.
- Accountability of senior officials could be enhanced by transparency mechanism. There is a need to devise rules and procedures for freedom of access to information. Currently senior officials are known to withhold information under the grab of secrecy.
 - Make public procedural related information accessible. This will help minimize the discretionary powers used negatively by senior officials.

(b) Politicization of Services – an Accountability Issue:

The politicization of public services has now become the main cause for over-staffing and inefficiency in the public sector. As I explained earlier, one of the remedies for this problem is to abolish the Government's power to make ad hoc appointments. Those appointed must respond to the politicians who got them appointed. This is bound to increase inefficiency and corruption because people appointed by such methods would be protected by their political patrons as long as their patrons are in power^{xxix}. The political neutrality of civil servants is a myth in the Pakistan scenario.

Recommendations:

- Some sort of constitutional guarantees and other rules and regulations are to be formulated to make senior officials secure.
- All appointments should be made on the basis of merit: This will help reduce collusion of senior officials and politicians.
- Strengthen Federal Public Service Commission functionally.
- The promotion to senior official's position may be done on the basis of promotional exams conducted by a neutral Public Service Commission.
- Civil servants remuneration are to be correlated with factors such as pay and discretionary powers, inflation, Cost Price index and others relevant factors..
- Provide quality government accommodation, schooling and health care system.

(c) Personnel Management and Accountability:

There is an absence of modern personnel techniques which could help accountability issues to improve efficiency and accountability. The complete absence of result oriented job descriptions, flawed performance evaluation, politicization of superiors and other factors contribute to lax accountability and inefficiency.

Recommendations:

- Introduce automation for all personnel data.
- The result oriented job descriptions are to be written in line with the organizational performance objectives^{xxx}.
- Rewards on good postings to be linked to work excellence.
- Improve personal Performance Evaluation format.
- Devise follow up system.

(d) Performance Evaluation

The performance evaluation of senior officials, the most important step, towards an accountable institutional culture is subjective as it does not measure performance but only record some personality & others subjective factors.

Recommendations:

- A new format to be developed based on entire performance, difficulty of tasks, extent of responsibility, right use of power and authority, ethics and integrity and other quantifiable data.

(e) Postings and transfers:

At present there is no tenure system for senior jobs. The problem is exacerbated when generalists are transferred to specialized jobs. This breeds incompetence, inefficiency and poor decision making, consequently low esteem.

Recommendations:

- Some tangible form of career pattern to be charted to groom senior officials.
- Reliance on generalists at the senior levels must be discouraged.
- Enforce code of conduct regarding influencing transfer, posting and promotion decisions.
- All the decisions must be transparent so as to make the accountability chain stronger for all senior officials.
- Strengthen federal and provincial public service commission for senior official's appointments for assessment of suitability jobs. The security of the jobs of chairman and members of the commission is vital to provide assurance to the senior officials who will ensure better accountability and performance assessment.

(f) Ethics, Corruption & Accountability:

Ethics, corruption and accountability are the biggest issues in Pakistan's society. The bureaucracy from top to lower levels is generally alleged to be corrupt and incompetent. Corruption (speed money, efficiency fee) takes several different forms of bending rules and regulations. Some of these are due to arbitrary use of discretionary powers of senior officials, misuse of regulatory authority and collusion of institutional head with the client thereby passing the corruption booty down the hierarchy. Despite the fact that several types of efforts and mechanisms were devised for the reduction of corruption, the enhancement of accountability for curbing corruption almost failed in Pakistan.

Recommendations:

- Conduct baseline survey for the type and extent of corruption by senior officials.
- Review and improve ethics framework for entire public sector with a wide participation of government, civil society, media and private sector.
- Restructure management, cascading management authority, responsibility with senior officials.
- Simplify and change non standardized and non transparent processes. Replace them with business like processes to meet customer needs and reduce opportunities for corruption.
- Introduce automation of government processes.

- Introduce transparent culture of openness and empowerment of a citizen as a client.
- Introduce effective complaints redress mechanisms.
- Encourage the development of alternative complaints redress mechanism e.g. Citizens Advice Centers with support of NGOs sector.
- Establish a modern transparent procurement system. Activate Public Procurement Regulatory Authority.
- Expedite transition to performance programme budgeting.
- Increase transparency of budget.
- Promote the revision of rules and regulations and encourage strict enforcement^{xxxix}.
- Establishment of an independent body (no-vested interests), tenured and constitutionally protected anticorruption fair minded agency.
- The decision making needs to be transparent and encourage public hearing on T.V or radio by government, Trade and Business organization, NGO and stakeholders. Such arrangements will promote mechanisms of accountability.
- The political leadership, military and senior officials of government services and judiciary must plan together to develop country's ethical standards.
- Arrange action oriented capacity participative training in ethics and accountability^{xxxix}.
- Develop data base for senior officials on their assets and how they maintain their current standards.
- Senior officials to declare conflict of interest between their business interests and their official responsibilities.
- Make senior officials responsible for the integrity of staff at all levels.
- Develop appropriate procedures, strategies and sanctions for misconduct and take prompt action.

There are several principles of managing ethics developed by various organizations and countries to improve the unethical scenario of existing rampant corruption^{xxxix}. It should be noted that the absence or inadequacy of controls is a major factor in the spread of inefficiency, injustice and corruption.

5.8. Concluding Remarks

In the science of administration, whether public or private, the term efficiency means least expenditure of manpower and material, but the author takes this concept a step further and suggests that effectiveness, economy and ethics along with efficiency (4Es) should focus on the improvement of performance rather than the enhancement of efficiency alone. Giving equal importance to the 4Es would enhance the performance level of government – the ultimate purpose of delivering services to poor and non-poor segments of the society. However this is neither simple nor self evident.

There is ample evidence that at present Pakistan's senior officials are not encouraged to pursue efficiency, equity, economy, effectiveness and professional ethics. This contributes to poor public sector performance and accountability, leading to unacceptable low social indicators which fall short of other comparable developing countries. Some of the causes of poor delivery of services include inefficiency, weak accountability, inadequate skills, corruption and management deficit.

Dealing with management deficit requires innovative solutions. The key challenge in Pakistan is (as well as in other developing countries) to develop managerial capacities in the civil service in order to function effectively and reliably. Reforms committees and reports made by various commissions suggested various remedies. Some changes have been made, but with very little impact on the management deficit. Changes would occur if the recommendations set out by reform committees would be implemented.

Senior officials in the public sector have to play a variety of critical roles to enable a country to alleviate poverty, secure a place in the global market, sustain economic growth, manage change and lead the country with vision and foresight. To achieve success, they have to portray an image of excellence by achieving extraordinary performance, efficiency, effectiveness and integrity.

Moreover, a holistic approach has to be adopted to bring about change, covering conceptual, organizational, economic, social, cultural, behavioural, political, legal and judicial domains. Performance cannot be improved meaningfully in isolation. Much has to be also done in changing the environment in which bureaucracy operates. It is important to recognize synergy and mutual reinforcement between efforts to improve efficiency and strengthening accountability. Better accountability enforcement would lead to greater efficiency. Likewise, greater efficiency will make compliance with the accountability process easier.

There is a need to bring about behavioural changes in senior officials by securing a positive improvement in interpersonal relations with citizens (a practice of fairness, transparency, even handed treatment, efficiency and economy). The change in human behaviour would bring out a desirable impact on the public which in turn would improve efficiency and accountability, trust in the government and change the public image of the public sector officials.

Finally, it is important to remind the readers that senior officials do not operate in isolation. There is a need to rationalize administrative structures, delegate powers, restructure service groups, introduce specialists and change the authoritarian style of the bureaucracy to service oriented management. There is also a need to bring out procedural change by simplification of processes, abolish red tape, introduce performance standards and develop an efficiency culture.

Footnotes to Chapter V

¹The market value model of government pursued the shrinkage of the state and devaluation of public service, the "market model" aggressively promoted on unproved assumptions of the shrinking of the state that whatever government did the private sector not interfered by government could accomplish more efficiently see Carol Harlow, "Public Administration and globalization: International and Supra national institutions see p.1 Owen E. Hughes, "Public Management and Administration: An introduction, 2nd ed. (New York: St. Martins Press, 1998. PP. – 242. Also see Strengthening of the trend in United Nations, "Report on the World Social situation E/200, /100", (New York: United Nations, 2001).

David Osborne and Peter Plastrik "Banishing Bureaucracy - The five strategies for reinventing government" (Reading MA: Addison – Wesley books, 1992).

Also see Van Creveld, M, The rise and decline of the state (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999). See R. Wade, "globalization and its limits", in S. Beerger and R.Dove(eds) National Diversity and global capitalism (Ithaca, N Y: Cornell International Review of administrative sciences Public Administration and globalization: International and supranational organizations) University Press, 1996) . See Michael S. de Vries, "The attack on the state: a comparison of the arguments, (London: sage publications, vol. 67, November 3, September 2001.

¹ Ideologically, the preferred means to development was national, centralized, state led economic planning. The primary instrument was social model strengthening government machinery, which offered to new state an alternative model of political economy.

¹ In developing countries, the fundamental public policy issues of poverty, education, security and health will continue to dominate the public agenda.

¹ Common Wealth of Canada "Governance for the xx 1st century lessons and new Directions in Public Service reform" (London: Common Wealth Secretariat, April 1998). Pp. – 2

¹ Turbulence is some unusual upheaval a new development which alters the course of events. See Peter Drucker "Managing in turbulent times". (London: Pan Books Ltd., 1981). Drucker attributes turbulence to variety of factors, which include inflation, technological explosion, economic integration, political disintegration emergence of a new fast changing society, population dynamics. Also see, peter F. Drucker, "Managing in turbulent times". (U.K: William Heinemann Ltd., 1980).

¹ S Schiavo – Campo & P.S.A. S.C., "To serve and to preserve: Improving Public Administration in a Competitive World, (Philippines: Asian Development Bank, 2001) p. – 2

¹ See for further discussion "On a political map, the boundaries between countries are as clear as ever. But on the competitive map, a map showing the real flows of financial and industrial activity, those borders have largely disappeared K. Ohmae, "The borderless World: Power and strategy in the interlinked world economy, (London: Harper & Collins, 1990). P. – 18

¹ See for similar discussion R.P. Mohanty, "Skilling the Corporations for the 21st century", South Asia Journal of Management, (Vol. 5 # 28 – 1988). Joseph stiglitz "Globalization & its Discontents". (New York: Penguin Putnam Inc. 2002).UNDP believes that the driving force behind globalization include technological innovations, economic and political shifts and cultural changes – UNDP, "Human Development Report" (New York: United Nations, 1999)

¹ Schiavo Opcit p. – 3

¹ See World Bank Policy Research Report, "globalization, growth& poverty". (New York: World Bank and Oxford University Press, 2002).

¹ Schiavo Opcit p. – 3

¹ Online Government Statistical Data on Pakistan.

1. State Bank of Pakistan: www.sbp.gov.pk
2. PIDE: www.pide.org.pk
3. Security and Exchange Commission of Pakistan: www.secp.gov.pk
4. Statistics Division, Government of Pakistan (officials website) including Federal Bureau of Statistics (FBS), Population Census Organization (PCO), and Agricultural Census Organization (ACO): www.statpak.gov.pk
5. Statistics Division (GOP Portal): www.pakistan.gov.pk/statistics-division/index.isp
6. Central Board of Revenue: www.cbr.gov.pk
7. Ministry of Finance: www.finance.gov.pk
8. Ministry of Commerce: www.commerce.gov.pk

¹ Pakistan needs a sustained growth of 5.5% – 6.0% over five years to alleviate poverty. See "Government of Pakistan, "Economic Survey (Islamabad: government Printing Press, June 2003) P. XIV. Poverty declined in countries that achieved rapid growth and increased in countries that experienced stagnation or contraction. Overall Pakistan's real income increased by a 231% between 1970 – 1993. The country's progress on the plane of human development at the same time did not correspond to this boom. See for latest global poverty index at <http://www.worldbank.org/poverty/data/trens/income.html>. also see world bank group, "The challenge: Reducing poverty at <http://www.worldbank.org/progress/reducingpoverty.html> last visited June 10.

¹ As a part GOP reconstruction strategy, (year 2001), the reconstruction of local government was given the priority as a majority of issues of daily concerns of the public for service delivery are encountered at

that level. Major highlights of devolution interalia includes, administration decentralization for efficient improvement of service delivery, direct elections of Union Councils seats, abolition of Division tier, elimination of executive magisterial system & replacement with separation of Judiciary from executive, financial decentralization, introduction of National Reconstruction Information management system (NARIMS), capacity building and several other structural & procedural changes. See government of Pakistan, "White paper – October 1999 – 2002" (Islamabad: November 2002) pp. 143 – 153. Also see NRB, "guide lines for citizen's Community Boards", (Islamabad: NRB, 2001) Also see Omar Azfar & etal "Decentralization, governance, and public services: The impact of institutional arrangements", center for institutional Reform and the informal sector: College Park Maryland. <http://www.inform.umd.edu/EdRes/Colleges/Bsos/Depts/IRIS/docs/wp.255.pdf>

Nick Manning, Dough Porter & etal Devolution in Pakistan – preparing for service delivery improvements. A working paper prepared for the forum on inter governmental relations & service delivery in Pakistan – 27 – 29 June 2003 (unpublished document, 2003).

National Reconstruction Bureau (NRB) "Local government plan 200", (Islamabad: NRB, 2000) government of Pakistan, "Pakistan 2010 study: An Agenda for more effective governance, (Islamabad; 1998).

See Charlton, Jackie, Robert Ebel, Hamid Mukhtar & etal, "Pakistan Devolution a note in support of the Development Policy Review". (World Bank, Washington DC: 2002).

¹ Luther Gulick. "Papers on the Science of Administration", (New York: Institute Of Public Administration, 1937).

¹ Tony L. Doherty and Terry Horne, "Managing Public Services – Implementing Changes – a thoughtful approach to the practice of management." (London: Rout ledge – Taylor & Francis group, 2002) p. – 339 Also see Peter E. Drucker, "Management, Tasks, Responsibilities, Practices", (London: Heinemann, 1974). P. – 45

¹ Peter F. Drucker, *ibid* p. 45.

¹ Department for International Development, "Governance and poverty strategy", (London: Department of international development 2000 b).

¹ Schiavo *opcit* p. 10.

¹ Government of Pakistan, "Rules of Business – 1973 as amended upto 11 – 22 – 2002." (Islamabad: Government Printing Press, Year 2002.) p. 33 – 72.

¹ Peter Drucker, *opcit* p. 45.

¹ Peter Drucker, *ibid* p. 45.

¹ See Sand ford Borins, "High level Seminar on Performance Measurement" (Cambridge: The common wealth Association for Public Administration and Management, Malaysian Common wealth studies centre and the common walth secretariat. July 1998)

See Halachmi, A. "Performance Measurement, Accountability and improved performance", public performance and Management Review. 25(4) 2002; 370-4.

Also see, Michael Porter, *Competitive Advantage: Creating and Sustaining Superior performance* (New York: The free Press, 1985).

¹ Sandford *ibid*.

¹ Schiavo *opcit* p. 655 Also see Arie Halachmi, "Public Performance data and private business decisions", in *International Review of Administrative Sciences – A Journal of Comparative Public Administration*". (Brussels: Sage publications Vol. 70, Number 1) March 2004. pp. 5 – 15. see p. 21/23

¹ Schiavo *opcit*

¹ Since independence in 1947, several commissions were formed to bring about civil service reform to alleviate the short comings of Pakistan civil service which was increasingly becoming in capable of performing efficiently, effectively, ethically and economically. A brief synopsis of various commissions & report are mentioned below:-

Rowland Egger Report, 1953: This report laid emphasis on decentralization and devolution as well as establishment of O&M units to study the government machinery.

Gladieux Report, 1955: This reports generally recommended a balance between excessive and inadequate control by the Government integration of the Ministries and delegation of authority.

G. Ahmed Reports of 1956 & 1961: These reports recommended the section officer Scheme, establishment of Statistical units and clear delineation of policy and implementation functions.

Shoaib Committee Report 1962

Small administrative units should be retained at the centre to deal with provincial subjects, but every possible device should be adopted to ensure that the functions of these units do not extend to the executive and operational fields, which should remain the exclusive domain of the Provincial Governments. Certain specific functions and projects along with relevant institutions and staff of the Central government may be transferred to the Provinces.

Cornelius commission 1959-62: These were very comprehensive reports, on pay and service structure, but were partially implemented.

D. K. Power Report in 1969: was on the subject of reorganization of public service.

Khurshid Hasan Mir Report 1972: This was a very important report which formed the part of the Administrative reforms of 1973. The service structures were unified and "Common training" was introduced. These reforms were blowing shocks to the bureaucracy and brought a great change.

Justice Anwar ul Haq Report 1979: Dealt with the reorganization of the civil service and ancillary matters.

Justice Durab Patel Commission report 1989, which could not be submitted due to the change in government.

Economy Commission (1991-93): This high powered commission was constituted in July 91, under the chairmanship of Senator A. Qayum Khan, who was replaced by Senator Zafar ul- Haq in Feb, 1992. The Commission examined to optimize establishment expenses in the Government organization and identification of redundant tiers, examined the span of control, identify the organizations which have outlived their utility and determine scope of economy in development and non development expenditure.

Chattha Commission 1996: In order to review the entire approach to the system of public management, the Government constituted another high powered commission under the chairmanship of Mr. Hamid Nasir Chattha MNA which suggested measures to improve the efficiency of the federal government. The Federal Secretariat also needs rational allocation and it should be a small setup. This Commission proposed to reduce the number of divisions from 48 to 32. Certain bodies were recommended to be Provincial zed or privatized because they have out lived their utility.

Caretaker Government (96-97): Caretaker Government, keeping in view the financial crises, decided to further curtail the size of the Government. Proposed to further reduce the number of the number of the Ministries from 29 in 1996 to 26 and Division from 48 to 31.

Pasha Report 1997: Report of the committee was on Downsizing of the Federal Government. A Public Sector with increasing centralization of functions, which are best handed over to lower levels of government. Allocation of functions to the Federal Government more in line with the Constitution of Pakistan as embodied in the Federal Legislative and Concurrent Lists. Strong coordination between different levels of the Government. Provincial operational functions should be passed on to the Provinces progressively, and Local functions are best performed locally.

Fakhr-e-Imam Commission Report 1999: The term of reference for this Commission was too restrictive. Through restructuring, including the question like provision of timely and quality service to the citizens and transforming bureaucracy to a corporate culture were the term of reference. Questions like comprehensive re-engineering of the Government machinery into an output-oriented Service organization were also addressed and suggested devolution from Federal to Provincial Governments.

The World Bank Report entitled "Pakistan – A Framework for Civil Service Reforms in Pakistan" was prepared in December, 1998 suggesting for restructuring of civil service.

The NRB Draft Report on Restructuring of Civil Service 20001. The report was prepared in consultation with provincial governments and the federal ministries. Presentation was made to the President in October, 2002. Currently, Establishment Division and NRB are jointly considering the recommendations.

None of above reports except Khurshid Hasan Mir Report could be fully implemented because of the entrenched vested interests and lack of political will.

¹ NSPP main goal is to enrich the current system of in service training and to institute other complementary measures that help in improving the quality of policy-making and public service. Thus the mission statement includes, "To improve the quality and effectiveness of public policies and public sector management in Pakistan, interalia, by improving the quality of in service and preserves training of civil servants, producing qualified and suitable professionals in the field of public sectors, organizing research and policy advice services for policy makers and through these actions attracting the best minds in the country into public services."

See unpublished document Tariq Banuri, Ali Dehlavi & Abdul Hafeez "Policy matters – A vision for the National School of Public Policy" (Boston: Stockholm Environment Institute Boston Center 6 February 2003).

¹ See World Bank, "Pakistan: A framework for Civil Service Reform in Pakistan", (Washington D.C: World Bank, December 15, 1998) p. 5.

¹ Management services division, "Rules of Business" opcit.

¹ In Pakistan's parliamentary democracy, the parliament hold the executive accountable for its financial management through Public Accounts Committee (PAC) which in turn takes input by the Auditor General in the form of audit reports on accounts and expenditure incurred. PAC thus plays a role of a "watchdog" of public exchequer and ensuring financial discipline and good governance see for details government of Pakistan, "Rules of Business". Opcit.

¹ Justice Durab Patel, "Chairman of the Services Reform Commission" National Commission to suggest measures to improve the efficiency of the federal government of Pakistan, Islamabad. GOP October, 1996 pg. – 19.

¹ Almost all civil reforms committees (referred in end note # 27) recommendation included writing of job description as an essential mechanism for improving efficiency and accountability.

¹ See for further discussion Government of Pakistan, "National Anti Corruption Strategy" (Islamabad: Pakistan, 2002).

¹ This is being done by National Reconstruction Bureau, Islamabad Pakistan.

See for detail, http://www.nrb.gov.pr/capacity_building/index.html last visited 4/14/2004.

Also see Paragon Regional Governance Programme, "general training module on public service ethics and accountability", (Islamabad: UNDP, 2001) pp. 65.

¹ See for further information, OECD, "Principals for Managing ethics in the public service recommendation of the OECD Council, (1998). <http://www.oecd.org/puma/ethics/pubs/pb4.pdf>

APEX statement of Principles. Internet: http://www.apex.gc.ca/about_e.html#4 Auditor General Report of the Auditor General of Canada, Ch. 1: Ethics and Fraud Awareness in Government. (Ottawa: Government of Canada, May 1995) <http://www.aoag-bvg.gc.ca/domino/reports.nsf/html/9501ce.html>

Brim, Orville and Wheeler, "Stanton Socialization after Childhood: Two essays". (New York: John Wiley and Sons 1996) also see Cliquet, R. "Causes of Changes in the Age Structure: An Overview", in United Nations commission for Europe and United Nations Population Fund, Structures: demographic and economic Consequences and Implications, Geneva: United Nations (1992) pp. 2-3.

Foot, David K. with Stoffman, Daniel Boom Bust and Echo. Toronto: Macfarlane Walter and Ross (1996).

Glor, Eleanor D. "Culture and Value Changes in the Public Service: The Implications", Optimum, The Journal of Public Sector Management (1994/95) 25(3): 9-15.

Glor, Eleanor D. Policy Innovation in the Saskatchewan Public Sector, (Toronto: Captus Press 1997 1971-82).

Glor, Eleanor D. "Some Thoughts on How the Canadian Government Built a Culture Emphasizing Integrity, Transparency and Accountability", Paper delivered to International Conference on New Frontiers for Strengthening Administrative Integrity, transparency and Accountability: Strategic and Institutional Perspectives, (Cairo, Egypt: 19-22 September 1999).

Government of Canada, "Conflict of Interest and Post-employment Code for Public Office Holders". (Ottawa: Office of the Ethics Counselor 1994) <http://strategis.ic.gc.ca/SSG/oe00002e.html>

Government of Canada, "A Strong Foundation Report of the Task Force on Public Service Values and Ethics". (Ottawa: Supply and Services Canada 1997) <http://www.ccmd-ccg.gc.ca/pdfs/tait.pdf>

Part Three

Challenges and Trends in Human Resources Management

Chapter VI

Recruitment and Selection of Public Workers: An International Compendium of Modern Trends and Practices

Robert J. Lavigna and Steven W. Hays

6.1. Introduction

Ultimately, the ability of government to provide services effectively and efficiently depends upon a competent cadre of civil servants. Good government requires good people. This has always been true, but its importance to the international community has probably never been more critical than it is today. Seldom, if ever, have the world's governments confronted a more daunting set of challenges that affect every nation, regardless of geographic location, political system, social structure or level of development. Powerful forces -- globalization, economic competition that cuts across national borders, social and political upheavals, technological change, threats of terrorism, and a rapidly-changing labor market -- place enormous burdens on governments. The success of any government to respond effectively to these challenges is dictated largely by its ability to recruit and retain a talented workforce. Nations that fail to compete successfully in the global war for talent are likely to suffer dire consequences, while those that excel will be well positioned to succeed.

Not surprisingly, most of the international community is faced with a common set of human resource management (HRM) dilemmas. In the developed world, common problems are:

- The aging of the indigenous civil service, posing the immediate threat of high turnover and a lack of qualified replacements;
- A growing vacuum among "the leadership bench" – the next generation of policymakers and top civil servants who will assume critical roles in directing their governments' efforts to negotiate the troubled waters of the 21st Century;
- The changing definition of *career*, which means that employee loyalty to the organization is tenuous at best, and which discourages workers from joining government service for the long haul (Green 2002);
- Rapid change (e.g., in technology and economic conditions) that requires a highly fluid *skill mix* in the workforce;
- Strong competition from the private sector for the best and the brightest;
- Budget limitations that reduce compensation and financial incentives, thereby placing government at a disadvantage vis-à-vis business and industry; and
- A negative public image ("government bashing"), which translates into the widespread perception that government is no longer the employer of choice (if it ever was) (Reichenberg 2002).

Compounding these problems are such recent developments as privatization and the outsourcing of many government jobs (a trend that reduces job security and blurs the line between public service and private enterprise), and an erosion of the benefit packages and job security that once were the most effective recruitment tools for

government. Adding to this dynamic mix are the widespread demands for “accountability” which often are translated into *managerialism* – a management focus that harkens back to an earlier era (Classical Management, Scientific Management, or Taylorism) where control functions are heavily emphasized, thereby diminishing some of the intrinsic satisfaction that public service is supposed to provide (Kearney and Hays 1995). Simply stated, today’s pressures for greater efficiency in government often make government service less appealing to the very workers whose contributions are needed most. Of course, less-developed countries face these same challenges, plus even more demanding social, economic and technological barriers.

In sum, it is not hyperbole to suggest that many nations are facing a recruitment crisis. At the time when governments need to be most adept at luring talent to public service, their ability to do so has rarely been so constrained and complicated by economic, social, and organizational pressures.

This brief chapter provides an overview of the types of recruitment and selection initiatives already in place in many nations that can help the world’s governments attract and retain talent. Relying heavily upon examples from the United States and Western Europe, but also integrating experiences from a variety of both developed and less developed countries (LDCs), we describe a series of recruitment and selection “best practices.”

6.2. Precursors to Successful Recruitment and Selection

One of the most important truisms in HRM is that the personnel process is a *system*. Ideally, this means that components should be interrelated and integrated. Thus, it is essential to consider HRM as part of the broader cultural and political environments that influence (or even control) staffing decisions. Any nation’s success in recruiting talented and committed people to public service depends not only on many facets of the HRM system, but also on the political, social and economic context.

Without legitimate and transparent political institutions, for example, the public personnel system is likely to be controlled by privileged groups and castes (see, e.g., Anderson 1987). Talent might be “recruited” in this setting, but often through political or familial associations or other contacts. Similarly, countries that are unable to pay their civil servants a competitive wage, or employ outdated HRM policies, clearly have problems attracting applicants in the contemporary labor market. The simple point is that recruitment and selection can’t and won’t generally be successful unless certain preconditions exist. No matter how innovative and aggressive a public agency might be in attracting applicants – and no matter how many HRM best practices it implements – success will be elusive unless the fundamental conditions are right. With this very pragmatic reality in mind, here are a few of the most critical precursors to recruiting a motivated and competent civil service.

6.2.1. Reversing the Erosion of the Public Service Ethic

One obstacle faced by virtually every nation is that trust and faith in government is at or near an all-time low. Whereas public organizations were once able to recruit civic-minded people merely because they were motivated by a desire to contribute to the greater good in some way, this attitude is now in short supply. This dilemma is usually phrased in terms of the “public image” of government, although what that really reflects is the extent that a public service *ethic* prevails in a society. Obviously,

the dimensions of this problem vary tremendously across the international landscape, but they have surfaced to some extent almost everywhere. The Canadian government, for instance, was so troubled by a perceived decline in the public service ethic that it launched "an unprecedented effort to foster understanding and appreciation for the challenges and achievements of the public service" (Kernaghan 2000).

To explore this dilemma more thoroughly, researchers have examined why job applicants seek work in government (Ito 2002), and how pride in one's job influences worker performance (Bourgault and Gusella 2001). Studies in countries such as Australia (Williams 2001), Belgium (Bouckaert and Victor 2001), and Mexico (Sibeck and Stage 2001) suggest that the dilemma is widespread, and discourages interest in government service.

The "solution" to the erosion of the public service ethic clearly transcends HRM. Without the cooperation of many stakeholders, especially politicians and other officials, the public service's tarnished image will be difficult to repair. Those who campaign against bureaucracy, and/or use facile arguments to blame public agencies for society's ills are sowing bitter seeds that government must ultimately reap. It is critical this trend be reversed.

Likewise, there is a need for *civic education* in the public schools. Each generation needs to be taught (and reminded of) the legitimate and critical role that public workers play in their lives, and the obligations and responsibilities that go with the title "civil servant."

Despite the Herculean challenge of reinvigorating the public service ethic, the research to date does provide a few signposts for improvement. Some factors that typically discourage interest in public jobs include slow and bureaucratic recruitment processes, narrow job descriptions, the perception that seniority prevails over merit, and excessive rules and regulations (Langan 2002). As discussed below, the growing trend to inject *flexibility* into HRM procedures offers hope.

6.2.2. HRM as Partner to Line Management

The second critical precursor to an effective recruitment and selection program is the extent that HR is a service function. As almost everyone acknowledges, personnel has long been perceived (and even defined) in terms of *control*, rather than *service* to the broader organization. HR is often viewed as the problem, not the solution – an obstacle to be circumvented, not an ally of line managers. This perception has been repeatedly reported in dozens of national settings, including Italy (Reina 2001), the entire English-speaking world (Hood 2000), and many LDCs such as Thailand (Simananta and Aramkul 2002), and Trinidad-Tobago (Marchack 2002).

Perhaps the most promising development to reverse this situation has been the extent that outdated notions of HR's role are being shed. With the advent of "new public management" (often called reinvention and/or "New Public Administration" in the United States), many nations have transformed their personnel functions. Key changes have occurred as HR functions have been *decentralized* to operating units, line managers have been empowered to make many HR decisions that once were reserved to a central authority, and widespread initiatives have been undertaken to "de-bureaucratize" HRM by eliminating unnecessary rules and regulations.

In the best cases, *flexibility* has replaced procedural inertia, and *responsiveness* has supplanted control as the HR's primary objective. While this trend is by no means universal, it is strongly evident in Europe, North America, and a growing number of LDCs. Where this new model of HR service delivery is implemented, recruitment and selection can be improved.

6.2.3. Civic Culture and Tradition

Anyone writing from a Western perspective can easily fall into the trap of ascribing Max Weber's notions of public management to the entire world. In the West, we often talk in terms of "modern bureaucracy," emphasizing such qualities as advanced and stable political institutions, bureaucratic neutrality and accountability, some degree of separation between politics and administration (in theory, at least), public sector careers, specialization and objectivity in job assignments, and "merit" (however defined). Our preoccupation with Western models also leads us to assume that secularism, rationality, competition, an achievement orientation, and individualism also predominate elsewhere. Nothing could be further from the truth. These concepts largely stem from Western culture, and many simply do not apply outside that context.

Space limitations preclude a thorough discussion of this pitfall, but a few sentences are necessary to explain why Western solutions cannot be prescribed for every cultural setting. In brief, most LDCs developed from a colonial tradition in which their administrative institutions were imposed by Western powers. Although colonial rule installed powerful administrative systems in the Third World, "... it failed to export democratic political institutions" (Haque 1996, 319). The all-too-common result is that the bureaucracy left behind has emerged as the dominant force in many LDCs, even though democracy has not taken hold. Throughout much of Asia and Africa, for example, government power is most evident in bureaucracy, not in the relatively weak and unstable political institutions. "Unlike western nations, where the power of modern bureaucracy is counterbalanced by advanced political institutions, in most Third World countries the expansive power of the civilian and military bureaucracies is often unbalanced in relation to their weak political institutions" (Haque 1996, 320). Indeed, bureaucracy (often as a complement to military dictatorships) substitutes for popular government in West Africa, much of Latin America, the Middle East, and Asia (Dwivedi and Nef 1982).

In the absence of a tradition of liberal democracy, Western managerial ideals are woefully out of place in these nations. Third World countries often exhibit a completely different set of cultural values, including ritualism, a caste structure, the extended family, seniority-based authority, and collective responsibility. It is therefore no surprise that neutral, merit-based forms of recruitment and selection have been slow to take hold in LDCs. Frequently, traditional criteria such as family, ethnicity, or caste trump qualities like merit, ability and achievement (Haque 1996, 322). Nepotism and friendship also influence most HRM decisions, thus preventing concepts like merit systems and recruitment based on credentials and competition from taking hold (Hopkins 1991).

However, this discussion is not meant to suggest that modern HRM strategies are unworkable in most LDCs. Indeed, a large number of these countries operate some type of "merit system" because they are required as a condition of international aid and assistance programs (e.g., the International Monetary Fund requires this). The

point, however, is that these approaches to HRM are often incompatible with the indigenous value structures and customs that prevail in LDCs. This simple fact helps explain why the notion of “reform” often gets sidetracked in Third World countries, and why bold prescriptions about modernizing administrative tasks occasionally fall on deaf ears outside of the industrialized nations.

There is one more political-cultural consideration that may be a barrier to HRM innovation, even in highly developed countries. In some parliamentary systems, power is divided among many political parties. In this pluralistic situation, HRM systems occasionally parcel government jobs based on party representation. Israel’s “hyper-fragmentation” of political authority is said to minimize objective criteria in selection (Amado 2001). In effect, this is just another example of how a nation’s cultural setting inevitably influences HRM practices. To expect otherwise would be naïve, but reformers often seem to overlook the obvious in their fervor to spread managerial innovations.

6.2.4. Managerial Systems:

In addition to the systemic issues discussed above, sound recruitment and selection practices also depend on complementary HRM systems. For example, an adequate employee records system is needed to track applicant status and progress. More importantly, a human resource planning system should guide and drive the recruiting system. In the absence of solid HR planning, openings occur as “surprises” rather than as predicted events for which the organization is prepared. Other important HRM components are a competitive compensation system, a reliable (and not too restrictive) set of job descriptions, a workable classification scheme (broadly defined pay bands are currently the rage), employee development opportunities to promote worker growth and stem attrition, succession planning, and a reasonable amount of job security. Without any one of these complementary features, even the most carefully-crafted recruitment program may fail to attract and retain talent.

6.3. Emerging Approaches to Recruitment and Selection

The news is not all bad, however, despite the many conditions necessary for a modern and effective recruitment and selection program. Clearly, the challenge is to fashion a workable recruitment strategy even though some pieces of the puzzle are probably missing. Fortunately, it *is* possible to attract and select new talent into most public organizations. Governments searching for particularly hard-to-find skills (e.g., nurses and information technologists are especially problematic in the United States) may encounter severe difficulties, while many other posts can be easily filled with the applicant pool readily at hand.

Simply filling positions is one issue, but to *optimize* recruitment results – to attract “the best and the brightest” – requires a more coordinated and proactive approach. Since no one organization has developed a “perfect” staffing program, there is no specific model that can meet all needs. Instead, every public agency can benefit from incremental changes in how it identifies and recruits, screens and hires civil servants. Public organizations can choose from among a rich list of recruitment techniques that might strengthen their competitiveness in the labor market. Governments have a wide array of options ranging from the basic to highly sophisticated. These techniques are described below under three broad (and overlapping) categories: procedural changes, process innovations, and technological applications.

6.3.1. Procedural Changes

These are changes that can be implemented more easily than process changes (next section). Both simple and more complex procedural adjustments can improve and expedite recruitment of public servants. Most procedural “innovations” are intended to *simplify* and *demystify* the application process to prospective workers. In other words, governments are attempting to make their entry procedures more user-friendly and transparent. Other procedural changes are designed to enhance government’s attractiveness to applicants and its allure to current employees. Employee retention is, in fact, a recruitment strategy because higher retention rates translate into lower recruitment needs. Examples of both of these types of changes are:

- Eliminating arbitrary rules and regulations that restrict the choices of hiring managers and supervisors. One primary example from the United States is the recent elimination of arbitrary limits on the number of candidates from which hiring managers can select (e.g., *rule of three*, *rule of five*, etc.). Previously, in the federal government and some states and local governments, only the top three or five finishers on an entrance exam could be considered for appointment. This archaic rule has either been abolished altogether in many locations, or supplanted with a more generous “rule of 20” or some other alternative. A similar technique is to introduce flexibility in posting requirements that previously delayed appointments. For instance, if a job must be publicly posted for thirty days or more, many qualified applicants unable or unwilling to wait will seek employment elsewhere. Research in Canada has shown that the “timeliness of appointment” is a major consideration for new workers (Ito 2002), so any measure that speeds the process will probably be worthwhile.
- Another restrictive practice is a *residency requirement* that obligates workers to live in the jurisdiction where they are employed. In fact, some public agencies in the United States are discouraged (and in some cases forbidden) from even *recruiting* candidates from outside the jurisdiction. Obviously, the elimination of such restrictions is a simple way to expand applicant pools.

6.3.2. Adopting flexible and appealing hiring procedures

Government has not always extended a welcoming and helpful hand to job applicants. Instead, applying for a public position can be equated with a visit to the dentist (except the pain can persist longer). In addition to encountering many procedural barriers, candidates were (and still are, in some cases) once required to follow strict guidelines on when and where tests could be taken, how often interviews were conducted, and other irrational regulations (e.g., omitting one seemingly irrelevant item on an application form disqualifies the candidate). Progressive governments have eliminated these artificial barriers by making the application process more inviting (i.e., training interviewers to not only evaluate candidates, but also to market jobs); providing more hospitable physical settings; and offering flexibility in the dates, times, and locations of tests and interviews.

6.3.3. Screening applicants quickly

Too often, government has a well-earned reputation for asking applicants to endure long and tortuous examination procedures. To change this perception (and reality),

some jurisdictions now require applicants merely to submit a *résumé*. Qualified candidates are then promptly interviewed by telephone (Lavigna 2002). A variation on this theme is where agencies ask applicants to complete *self-assessments* for certain positions (e.g., information management jobs). An even more streamlined approach is to *automatically* certify applicants as eligible for appointment if they meet certain conditions such as holding a professional license or credential (Lavigna 2002). Some employers even permit *immediate* hiring of applicants whose college grades are sufficiently high (Hays and Sola 2004).

6.3.4. Validating entry requirements and examinations

One of the thorniest problems in HRM is validating testing instruments and other pre-entry requirements. Often, once exposed to empirical scrutiny, screening devices are found to be faulty predictors of job performance. For this reason, it is essential that any test protocol be validated for job-relevancy and discriminatory impact. The pressure to devise valid exams has led to the growing adoption of performance-based tests (e.g., a building supervisor applicant might be required to read a set of blueprints and list the order in which subcontractors would need to work on a construction site). Other strategies highly regarded in the HRM literature and by practitioners are *assessment centers* for higher-level workers; the use of *biodata* (a proven technique that examines past behavior as a predictor of future performance); and *unassembled exams* (the objective review of an application or *résumé*, followed by an interview) (Hays and Sowa 2004).

Unassembled exams have lower validity than other approaches such as written exams. Therefore, the *job interview* process becomes dramatically more important. For this reason, much attention has focused on improving interview reliability by training interviewers, using *group interviews* (i.e., several members of the applicant's prospective work group participate in the interview), and expanding the use of *structured interviews*. A minimal requirement is that interviewers use a patterned interview format which ensures that every applicant is asked an identical set of questions, and that their responses are systematically recorded and evaluated. Another trend is to de-emphasize experience and/or education as job requirements. Many candidates are simply over-qualified educationally, thereby contributing to credentialism. This is the trend to require additional qualifications – higher academic degrees and more certifications – even if they are not required by the job. This can artificially limit the applicant pool and can hinder efforts to diversify workforces. Moreover, using years of experience as a minimum requirement is increasingly viewed as a very poor way to screen applicants, and one that unnecessarily excludes candidates who might be excellent performers (Sullivan 2002).

6.3.5. Instituting worker-friendly personnel policies

The Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) has identified several logical means to make public organizations more desirable employers. Germany has been repeatedly cited as a hotbed of worker-friendly personnel policies. These include the wide use of flexible work hours (also a common feature in the United States, Great Britain, Canada, and elsewhere); flat hierarchies that offer workers more opportunities to participate in decision-making; telecommuting; family-friendly procedures (e.g., time off for either husband or wife to care for children or other relatives); and good working conditions (Reichenberg 2002). Comparable approaches are being put into place in relatively unpleasant work settings in the United States, such as for child abuse investigators. These workers,

who deal with difficult situations and often find little intrinsic joy in their labors, are “rewarded” by supportive leadership; cooperative management styles; and non-monetary incentives such as recognition, small awards and plaques, open communications, and group activities (Center for the Study of Social Policy 2002).

6.3.6. Creating more flexible job descriptions

Research both in the United States and elsewhere has repeatedly demonstrated that narrow job descriptions and restrictive career ladders discourage potential employees. The promise of *job rotation* or other tactics to enhance professional development, coupled with a clear and progressive career ladder, greatly boosts government’s competitiveness in the labor marketplace. Likewise, the opportunity to compete for salary increases (i.e., pay for performance) is likely to appeal to today’s applicant far more than the seniority system that still dominates compensation and advancement in some public personnel systems. Similarly, workers derive greater intrinsic satisfaction when they have autonomy to complete work assignments; face a challenging yet manageable workload; are required to follow only minimal “standard operating procedures” (SOPs); and rarely have to endure long, boring staff meetings. One needs only to read the Dilbert cartoons popular in the United States to understand how and why such measures can aid both employee recruitment and retention.

6.3.7. Improvements to the Recruitment and Selection Process

Process changes are fundamental improvements in the way HRM services are delivered. As noted above, public sector recruitment has a notorious reputation for being slow, unresponsive, bureaucratic, and *passive*. Too often, public agencies have assumed that qualified applicants would clamor for job openings. These agencies therefore are seldom engaged in aggressive outreach programs or other ways to attract superior job candidates. In many cases, this reactive approach results from the centralized and control-oriented way that HR services are delivered. This often means that applicants enter government through a *single point of entry* where a jurisdiction’s entire recruitment function is handled by one agency. Often, HRM in this setting enforces many rigid rules that discourage and dishearten potential employees. Insights into some of these rules and regulations were provided in the preceding section on procedural change, since one of the most positive developments in contemporary HRM is reducing the reliance on control activities.

Accordingly, improved recruitment and selection processes is the second major reform theme. The most significant component of this trend is the *decentralization of HR services* to operating units. Additionally, many less dramatic changes have surfaced in the ways that public organizations marshal their human resources and entice new recruits to the halls of government.

The decentralization movement – “New Public Management” is known in many quarters as devolution, often characterized by the decentralization of HR responsibility. Giving operating agencies and managers the flexibility to handle most HR decision making accelerates the speed, flexibility, and responsiveness of recruitment. Among the many features of this movement are *multiple points of entry* (applicants are screened by agencies or other sub-units, rather than being required to wander through a maze of centrally-prescribed regulations); and *delegated testing authority* (which allows subunits to conduct their own examinations). Moreover, operating and managers have more control over *job descriptions; public*

announcement of openings; recruiting; and terms of appointment (e.g., the salary level and/or rank that can be offered without central approval).

6.3.8. Decentralization internationally

The international scorecard on HR decentralization is somewhat surprising. For a profession that has a reputation for resisting change, it is very revealing to catalogue the transformations taking place as HR functions are delegated in more and more locations. In some countries, such as New Zealand, the decentralization of public sector HR is almost absolute, and also (predictably) includes the virtual elimination of employee protections. Less zealous (but still noteworthy) cases of decentralization have occurred in the United Kingdom, Australia, Switzerland, and Sweden (Shim 2001, 324). The OECD rates several countries – the Netherlands, Denmark, Canada, and the United States – as having adopted a “moderate” amount of decentralization. According to the OECD, only a few national governments (e.g., France and Japan) have opted to retain centralized and highly protective systems of public HRM (Shim 2001; OECD 2000).

Where decentralization is being pursued with less enthusiasm, several nations are trying to nevertheless make their recruitment processes more effective and modern. This is especially prevalent in Southern Europe; Korea; Poland (Shim 2000, 342); Hungary (Jenei and Zupko 2001); Albania (The COMPASS Project 2001); and in parts of Sub-Saharan Africa, including Uganda and Nigeria (Sezi 1997). Interesting developments include the dissolution of civil service in Sweden. In this country, public workers do not enjoy tenure, and outside candidates are encouraged to apply for all vacancies. In the Netherlands, a Senior Public Service has been created to reduce attrition among senior-level workers whose job security has eroded. Pay-for-performance systems in Austria, Germany, Norway, Poland, Portugal, and other countries are designed to make public agencies more competitive with their private sector counterparts.

6.3.9. Aggressive outreach efforts

Decentralization alone won't attract qualified applicants. Increasingly, public agencies are using strategies that have long been exploited by business and industry. Obvious examples include the growing use of government recruiters (who pursue aggressive outreach strategies at job fairs, on college campuses, in local communities, etc.); aggressive advertising in print and electronic media; distribution of marketing and recruitment material (e.g., brochures) that promote public service careers; use of toll-free automated telephone systems to publicize job openings; and much more aggressive efforts to stay in touch with job applicants during the screening process. This last approach – often part of an *applicant tracking system* – ensures that no one “falls through the cracks” and/or misinterprets a lack of communication as a sign that the employer is no longer interested. Simply stated, public agencies are casting a wider net for job applicants, and then cultivating them as they move through the selection process. This strategy is strengthened by hiring full-time recruiters, directly communicating with multiple organizations that are potential source of job candidates, systematically distributing job postings to academic institutions, and using outside search agencies (“headhunters”) to recruit high-profile applicants for important vacancies (Lavigna 2002).

6.3.10. Current employees as recruiters

Due to concerns about propriety and the supposed neutrality of the civil service, public agencies have only recently involved their own employees in the search for new talent. The tactic proven to be most effective is *employee referrals* in which current workers are asked to recommend qualified candidates. Ironically, this is the favored recruitment strategy in many sectors of private industry, but is only now surfacing in government. In some cases, *referral bonuses* (or "*bounties*") are paid to employees who help recruit successful candidates in high-need skill areas (e.g., engineers or information management workers). In general, these systems pay a modest amount when the referred applicant is hired, and then a more significant amount (perhaps US \$1000) when that person finishes a probationary period. A related strategy is *retention bonuses* that are paid to current workers who promise to stay in the organization for a designated period of time. For example, nurses – who are very marketable in the United States – might receive a US \$10,000 bonus for signing a three-year extension with a public hospital.

As emphasized above, retention helps recruitment by reducing the number of vacancies to fill, and also signaling that the organization is a good place to work. This principle has guided additional innovations that are now widely embraced by forward-thinking public agencies in many countries. For example, using *temporary workers* not only saves money, but also gives the hiring organization an opportunity to assess a worker's talents before he/she is hired into a permanent position. *Internships* are another variation on this theme. In one United States social service agency, paid interns are placed in the most challenging jobs (welfare eligibility worker, or child abuse caseworker) for two to three years. Because most attrition from these unpleasant occupational settings occurs early (the belief is that if a worker stays three years, he or she will make a career of the job), internships represent not only job "try-outs," but lengthy probationary periods in which only the most committed workers emerge. A final strategy is to aggressively use *mentors* to ease the entry of new workers, help socialize them to the organization's norms and expectations, and provide guidance and support. Research has repeatedly demonstrated that mentoring cuts down on attrition and improves the morale of newly-hired workers (Hays and Sowa 2004). Thus, a large number of relatively low-cost techniques can not only improve recruitment efforts, but also trim attrition and enhance job satisfaction.

6.3.11. Use of Technology

Virtually all recruitment strategies can be enriched by different types of information technology (IT). In fact, many scholars believe that technology will be *the* most notable HRM trend of the next few decades (Hendrickson 2003). There is essentially a movement from traditional HRM to *virtual HRM*, characterized by developing a chapterless environment that relies on electronic interactions, using intranets, the World Wide Web, and software packages that improve HR processes (Elliot and Tevavichulada 1999).

The continuing effort to make hiring faster and more user-friendly has fueled the widespread application of computer technology. Many large public organizations use computer bulletin boards and electronic mail to publicize job vacancies. This system of *on-line job posting* is very helpful to internal candidates, but is also becoming increasingly accessible to outside candidates as large percentages of the world's population go on-line (the number of Web users has surpassed 200,000,000, and is

growing rapidly). From the applicant's perspective, technology provides more timely information on vacancies and the hiring organization itself, as well as the opportunity to apply on-line (from anywhere at any time) and even test on-line in some cases.

For managers, IT helps them identify and track qualified candidates for different positions. Through automation, managers can have on-line access to applicants' test scores, qualifications, and contact information. This provides a faster and more efficient way to screen and contact prospective employees. Some governments are striving to create *paperless application systems* in which all applications and updates are on-line, thereby eliminating the need for applicants to schedule appointments, incur travel expenses, and/or deal with the other frustrations of the staffing process. A variation on this theme – the *résumé database* – is also creating a stir in public sector recruiting. It involves creating national and international databases of professional credentials that can be used to pre-screen thousands of applications simultaneously. These systems have enjoyed explosive growth in the private sector, and are projected to become the primary method of recruiting in the industrialized world (Marchak 2002).

These specific IT applications to HRM systems abound across the globe. For example, computers are used to track applicants and administer examinations in Thailand (Simananta and Aramkul 2002), as well as in much of Western Europe (Reinermann 1997). Computer-assisted testing (CAT) is widely used in the United States, and is making inroads in other countries such as Great Britain and Canada (Hamman and Desai 1995). In one advanced CAT system, the applicant first answers questions of moderate difficulty. If those items are answered correctly, the computer presents more difficult ones; if the initial questions are "missed," easier ones are provided. The point where the applicant "proceeds from knowing generally less difficult items to not knowing more difficult ones is that individual's score" (Hamman and Desai 1995, 100). Not only do CATs enhance test validity, but they also allow organizations to process large numbers of applicants quickly and painlessly. When linked with other databases (such as online application forms or résumés), CAT provides managers with an almost instant capability to access eligibility lists and other applicant tracking data.

Similar applications exist in state and local agencies in the United States. Automated systems are used to match résumés with skill sets for particular jobs (Selden and Jacobson 2003). Technology is also being used to enhance employee development programs, as shown in an online evaluation system in the state of Michigan that creates a computer-assisted dialogue between supervisors and subordinates about training needs and promotional potential (Center for the Study of Social Policy 2002). Given market forces and the inexorable march of technology, these trends can only accelerate and expand internationally. Hastening this process will be the increasing numbers and types of software packages. Software programs are already available to administer online examinations, track applicants, match résumés with skill sets, expedite background checks, and shepherd job candidates through a paperless staffing process. Even if the entire world is not ready for a fully automated approach to HR, the technology is already available.

6.4. The Future?

This chapter presents a broad overview of some recruitment and selection strategies emerging across the world. Exciting changes are taking place, and traditional ways to deliver personnel services are clearly on the decline. Organizations that do not take

advantage of new approaches and techniques will fall increasingly behind business and industry, where market forces virtually require that employers keep pace with the march of "progress."

Despite the real and potential advantages of new strategies and technologies, a few words of caution are necessary. First, the watchword of the new HR era is *flexibility*, but this can be costly, literally and figuratively (Farnham 1997). Notably, public personnel systems that are decentralized and deregulated can fall victim to manipulation and exploitation. The headlong rush toward HRM systems that mimic the private sector model is also risky if we ignore the potential downside of this trend. Government and the private sector are not the same, and rushing to adopt private sector approaches without recognizing fundamental differences is a high-risk strategy.

As governments strive for increased responsiveness and flexibility, safeguarding the public service from inappropriate influences may become more difficult. At a minimum, professional public administrators need to be alert to the risks associated with reform. Although there is a critical need to ensure that governments can attract and retain talent, maintaining the neutrality of the public service should be a non-negotiable value.

Another potential threat is posed by the enormous impact of IT on HRM. Although technology offers a wonderful opportunity to improve and expedite HR operations, it also reduces the "human factor" (West and Berman 2001). Technology adds efficiency, but also depersonalizes functions that were built on human interaction and individual judgment. Whether or not this is good or bad is debatable. We pose this question merely as another consideration to factor into the international discussion of HR's transition from a traditional to a virtual tool of line managers.

Ultimately, public organizations *must* adopt at least some of the recruitment and selection strategies described simply because to do otherwise would be self-defeating. The crises that plague public services in almost all nations are too daunting to permit complacency. The primary challenge for HR professionals is to select the reforms most suitable to their own settings, and to adapt them to local needs. There is no shortage of good ideas, and we hope there will be no shortage of will and creativity in the further implementation of HRM reform. The stakes are far too high for government not to change.

References

- Amado, Rivka (2001). "Checks, Balances, and Appointments in the Public Service: Israeli Experience in Comparative Perspective." *Public Administration Review* 61 (5): 569-584.
- Anderson, L. (1987). "The State in the Middle East and North Africa." *Comparative Politics* 20 (1): 1-18.
- Bouckaert, Geert and Leo Victor (2001). "Pride and Performance in the Civil Service: The Flemish Case." *International Review of Administrative Sciences* 67 (1): 65-76.
- Bourgault, Jacques and Mary Gusella (2001). "Performance, Pride and Recognition in the Canadian Federal Civil Service." *International Review of Administrative Sciences* 67 (1): 29-47.
- Center for the Study of Social Policy (2002). *Human Resource Management INNOVATION*. Washington, D.C.: Center for the Study of Social Policy.
- Dwivedi, O.P. and John Nef (1982). "Crises and Communities in Development Theory and Administration." *Public Administration and Development* 2 (1): 59-77.
- Elliott, Robert and S. Tevavichulada (1999). "Computer Literacy and Human Resource Management: A Public/Private Sector Comparison." *Public Personnel Management* 28 (2): 259-274.
- Farnham, David (1997). "Employment Flexibilities in West European Public Services: An International Symposium." *Review of Public Personnel Administration* 17 (3): 5-98.
- Green, Marnie (2002). "Beware and Prepare: The Government Workforce of the Future." *International Recruitment and Selection Strategies*. Washington, D.C.: IPMA-HR.
- Hamman, J. and U. Desai (1995). "Current Issues and Challenges in Recruitment and Selection." In Steven Hays and Richard Kearney (Editors). *Public Personnel Administration: Problems and Prospects*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 89-104.
- Haque, M. Shamsul (1996). "The Contextless Nature of Public Administration in Third World Countries." *International Review of Administrative Sciences* 62 (3): 315-329.
- Hays, Steven and Jessica Sowa (2004). "Staffing the Bureaucracy: Recruitment and Selection in Government." In Stephen Condrey (Editor) *Handbook of Human Resource Management in Government*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, forthcoming.
- Hendrickson, A.R. (2003). "Human Resource Information Systems: Backbone Technology of Contemporary Human Resources." *Journal of Labor Research* 24 (3): 381-394.
- Hood, (2000).
- Hopkins, J.W. (1991). "Evolution and Revolution: Enduring Patterns and Transformation of Latin American Bureaucracy." In A. Farazmand (Editor) *Handbook of Comparative and Developmental Public Administration*. New York: Marcel Dekker, 697-707.
- Ito, Jack (2002). "Career Mobility and Branding in the Civil Service: An Empirical Study." *International Recruitment and Selection Strategies*. Washington, D.C.: IPMA-HR.
- Jenei, Gyorgy and Gabor Zupko (2001). "Public Sector Performance in a New Democratic State: The Hungarian Case." *International Review of Administrative Sciences* 67 (1): 77-98.
- Kearney, Richard and Steven Hays (1998). "Reinventing Government: The New Public Management and Public Personnel Systems: A Critical Assessment of

- Dubious Deductions and Hidden Agendas." **Review of Public Personnel Administration** 18 (4): 38-54.
- Kernaghan, Kenneth (2000). **Rediscovering Public Service: Recognizing the Value of an Essential Institution**. Toronto: Institute of Public Administration of Canada.
- Langan, Shelley (2002). "Finding the Needle in the Haystack: The Challenge of Recruiting and Retaining Sharp Employees." **International Recruitment and Selection Strategies**. Washington, D.C.: IPMA-HR.
- Lavigna, Robert (2002). "Timely Hiring in Public Sector Organizations." **International Recruitment and Selection Strategies**. Washington, D.C.: IPMA-HR.
- Marchack, Sandra (2002). "Alternative Recruitment Strategies: Case Study on Contract Employment in the Public Service of Trinidad and Tobago." **International Recruitment and Selection Strategies**. Washington, D.C.: IPMA-HR.
- O.E.C.D. (2000). **Recent Developments and Future Challenges in Human Resource Management in OECD Member Countries**.
- Reichenberg, Neil (2002). "Branding the Government As An Employer of Choice." **International Recruitment and Selection Strategies**. Washington, D.C.: IPMA-HR.
- Reina, Rocco (2001). "The Personnel Management in the Italian Public Administration." **Tempus Programme at IPA**, Bratislava (June 23-29).
- Reinermann, Heinrich (1997). "The Utilization of Information Technology in German Public Administration." **International Review of Administrative Sciences** 63 (2): 207-224.
- Selden, Sally and W. Jacobson (2003). "Human Resource Management." In **Paths to Performance in State and Local Government**. Syracuse, NY: Maxwell School of Public Affairs.
- Sezi, Prisca (1997). "Reaffirming the Values of Professionalism in Public Administration: The Ugandan Experience." **International Review of Administrative Sciences** 63 (3): 377-382.
- Shim, Deok-Seob (2001). "Recent Human Resources Developments in OECD Member Countries." **Public Personnel Management** 30 (3): 323-347.
- Sibeck, Gary and H. Daniel Stage (2001). "Aspects of Comparative Management in Selected Mexican and Peruvian Firms." **International Journal of Organization Theory and Behavior** 4 (1-2): 91-102.
- Simananta, Sima and Aim-on Aramkul (2002). "Decentralization of Recruitment in Thai Civil Service." **International Recruitment and Selection Strategies**. Washington, D.C.: IPMA-HR.
- Sullivan, John (2002). "Experience—'It Ain't What It Used to Be.'" **International Recruitment and Selection Strategies**. Washington, D.C.: IPMA-HR.
- The COMPASS Project (2001). **Modern Human Resource Management in Albania**. (Netherlands: Community and Public Administration Support Project of the Government of the Netherlands in Albania).
- West, John and Evan Berman (2001). "From Traditional to Virtual HRM: Is the Transition Occurring In Local Government?" **Review of Public Personnel Administration** 21 (1): 38-64.
- Williams, Helen (2001). "Perceptions and Performance: The Australian Public Service Experience." **International Review of Administrative Sciences** 67 (1): 49-64.

Chapter VII

Diversity and Public Sector Performance

Randhir Auluck

7.1. Introduction

Any discussion of public sector human resources management would be incomplete without consideration of the impact of diversity issues. 'Diversity' is a complex and emotive subject and covers a vast territory of issues.

Creating conditions and practices that enable and encourage all employees to produce their best is a challenge for all organisations. Creating conditions and promoting practices that enable and encourage all employees to want to produce their best is a challenge for all managers. Advising, supporting and facilitating these conditions and practices (and communicating good practice) is a challenge for and the responsibility of all HR practitioners. There is widespread recognition that HR practice plays a vital role in bringing people in and bringing people on in organisations. There is widespread recognition of the part HR plays in ensuring that the right people are in the right place doing the right thing. This role is even more imperative than it has ever been (Thomson & Mabey 1994). Bringing out the best in all employees presumes the existence of certain organisational conditions: safety, motivation, shared vision, support, development, and scope for expression of identity (freedom/permission to be and work differently and in ways that play to your strengths). 'Managing diversity' serves as an overarching label for this type of practice.

Over the past few years, efforts to get 'diversity' onto the strategic agenda of all UK government departments have been reinvigorated. This has led to public service organisations (both at central and local level) investing in an array of 'equality' and 'diversity' initiatives, some new, some repackaged and some old, trusted favourites. However, this mullet-pronged approach is still a heavily procedural response to what remains essentially the challenge of culture change.

This chapter aims to draw out the specific links between human resources practice and diversity management. It will attempt to map out the main issues and challenges of diversity for public sector organisations. This chapter will specifically provide an overview of the UK Government's approach to diversity management and will describe some of the initiatives that have been put into place to support the implementation of the diversity agenda.

7.2. Assumptions and General Comments

Different countries, sectors and organisations have different interpretations of the concept of diversity and different approaches to the priorities for action (UNDESA/IIAS 2001). It would be of limited value to try to make direct comparisons of 'progress' across different countries.

There are likely to be differences between self-perception and external views of the state of play. There might be a tendency for organisations to over-play positive developments and under-play some of the struggles. The issue of 'accuracy in

reporting' is both important and problematic, and it can be reduced to 'a matter of interpretation'. The tendency in the public sector for numbers, tables and targets can be helpful to a point but can also obscure real experiences and problems that lie behind the statistical and numerical data.

There is also a difference between espoused policies and practices. It is not just a matter of 'what' is implemented but also 'how' it is implemented and 'who' is leading the initiative. HR practitioners, managers or diversity specialists may well want to recommend the introduction of certain diversity practices. The extent to which these will be adopted is likely to depend on a number of factors. These include the proposer's position and status within the organisation, the quality and strength of their relationship with strategic management especially the Permanent Secretary or CEO, their influencing skills, the weight of supporting evidence for that practice, a convincing argument for the position advocated, and so on.

7.3. The Concept of Diversity Management

Diversity is a complex subject. It has many dimensions and can be analysed at the national, country level and institutional level (UNDESA/IIAS 2001). Although many useful different definitions are on offer (Maxwell 2004; Ospina 2001) attempts to pinpoint one single, common definitional framework for diversity and diversity management is difficult (Maxwell, 2004 p.183). Further, despite claims that it is integrated into organisations, in practice it is still at risk of being misunderstood and misrepresented.

It is interesting to note that the rationale for diversity management has been reframed over time. Whereas in the past, the explanation for the need to pursue diversity management was grounded in the 'moral imperative' ('it is the right thing to do') and the legal imperative ('there is a legal obligation') it is now strongly underpinned by the 'business imperative' ('it makes good business sense'). Rutherford and Ollereanshaw (2002) conducted a survey of 140 organisations across the public and private sector with aim of finding out what types of diversity practices organisations were adopting. The study also looked at which organisations were making equality and diversity business priorities and what links they saw between this and their overall business performance.

The study showed that the 'business case' was the most often cited driver (71%) for diversity and equality initiatives and 80% of organisations said there was a link between good diversity practice and overall business performance. If nothing else, this suggests that the current language of diversity management is permeating through to organisations. The 'business case' is now the common reason presented for action on diversity training programmes.

The literature on managing diversity emphasizes the potential organizational benefits. According to Maxwell (2004), Ospina (2001) and others this includes:

- improved recruitment and retention
- reduced staff turnover and absence costs
- greater creativity and flexibility
- enhanced customer service

Mant (1995) describes the three types of individual needs and expectations that have emerged as part of the psychological contract for worker in developed economies. These are:

- the need for equity and justice
- the desire for security and relative certainty
- The need for fulfillment, satisfaction and progression.

Using this analysis to support the argument for effective diversity management, Maxwell (2004) suggests that the first of these explicitly relate to equality in general while the latter two implicitly relate to managing diversity in that security, fulfillment and satisfaction are founded on self-identity (Maxwell 2004 p.185)

7.4. Diversity, Human Resource Potential and the Civil Service

The integral relationship between good employment practices, effective human resources practice and diversity management is encapsulated in the following policy statement:

"The Civil Service needs to make better use of its most important resource – the staff – by providing the prospect of a career with a good employer, offering challenge and reward; by developing their skills to meet the managerial, technical and competitive challenges they face; and by ensuring equality of opportunity for all members of staff, irrespective of background, gender, race and disability." Continuity and Change, UK Government White Paper July 1994

The diversity agenda within the UK is grounded in over three decades of ideas about and attempts to promote equal opportunities. Equality legislation has been in place since the mid-1970s. In recent years, European Union equality and Human rights directives and recommendations have added additional weight to existing UK equality legislation and practice. In addition, these legal imperatives have been matched by a strong political commitment to equality and diversity issues within the public sector. Promoting equality and managing diversity management are now an integral part of the current UK Civil Service Reform agenda. Specifically, the Civil Service has been mandated to make a *dramatic improvement* to diversity within the Service, both in terms of employment practice and service delivery.

The Modernising Government White Paper spells out the Government's vision very clearly. The Government wants to create a public service that reflects the diversity of the society it serves and takes full advantage of available talent:

"A truly effective diverse organisation is one in which the differences of individuals bring are valued and used. Currently we tend to minimise differences and to expect everyone to fit into the established ways of working. We should not expect them to. We should be flexible to allow everyone to make the best contribution they can. This has to be reflected in our ways of working, our personnel practices, the way managers manage".
Modernising Government White Paper 1999

Specific diversity management initiatives within the UK Civil Service include the following.

(a) Diversity Surveys

At the end of 2000, the Civil Service conducted an attitude survey of almost 16,500 staff from across the Service. This focused on equal opportunities and diversity issues and was intended to serve as an indicator of whether the Service was developing a culture that truly values and makes the best of the diversity of talent. The results show that civil servants have broadly positive views about the Service's approach to equality and diversity and they compare favourably with results from similar surveys in other sectors. The report also notes that people feel that diversity is not valued in the fullest sense - whilst difference are respected, they are not really made use of. It is interesting to note that certain groups of staff report significantly less favourable experiences, especially disabled staff and staff from ethnic minority backgrounds. Another issue of note is the small but significant proportion of staff who reported that they have been bullied, harassed or discriminated against in the past year. Again, certain groups of staff reported this experience in higher numbers than others.

On the issue of work/life balance, the survey reports indications that government departments and agencies are making available flexible working patterns to enable staff to better balance home and work life. However, findings suggest that part-timers and staff who are primary carers feel that they face more barriers to getting on in their career. The Cabinet Office is sponsoring a flexi-working pilot, and a number of government departments already have provision for more flexible working.

(b) Equality in Performance Review Research

In 1999, thirteen departments, in conjunction with the UK Cabinet Office and the Council of Civil Service Unions (CCSU) commissioned research into the outcomes of performance appraisals to investigate whether and how the outcomes differed for different groups of staff. Basically, this showed a pattern of ethnic minority staff and disabled staff receiving lower than average performance ratings than white and able-bodied staff respectively, and of women receiving higher ratings than equivalent men (at the lower grades). Further research to understand the underlying causes for these imbalances was commissioned.

In June 2000, six government departments and the Council of Civil service Unions jointly sponsored this second stage of the research. This study is regarded as being considerably more comprehensive than any undertaken previously, either in the Civil service or elsewhere. The second phase of this study suggests that the performance management systems are in themselves robust and not the underlying cause for the discrepancies identified. Rather, the study suggests that the discrepancies in ratings are more likely to be related to the way in which people are managed and developed, and related to managers' beliefs and perceptions about what constitutes 'effectiveness'. The study identifies a number of strategies to deal with any perceived discrepancies including independent quality assurance, building management capability, equality proofing systems and procedures, and continued monitoring of progress and outcomes.

(c) Tackling Under-Representation

Tackling under-representation and target setting forms a visible feature of the current programme of action. The employment of women, ethnic minorities and

disabled people in the Civil service compares favourably with other employers both public and private sector. However all groups are under-represented at senior levels.

By way of response, the Civil Service has set up specific targets for tackling this concern. The Service has set targets to double the number of people from ethnic minority backgrounds, women and employees with disabilities within the Senior Civil Service (the top 3000 jobs). The aim is that by 2004/5, 3% of top posts will be filled by people with a disability, compared with 1.5% in 1998. The figure in October 2002 was 2.0%. On gender, the target is that by 2004/5, 35% of senior posts will be filled by women, as compared with a baseline of 17.8% in 1998. In October 2002, the figure was 25.8%. Finally, the target for people from ethnic minority backgrounds is 3.2% set against a figure of 1.6% in 1998. In October 2002, 2.8% of people in the senior grades were from ethnic minority backgrounds (Source: www.civil-service.gov.uk/statistics).

Other initiatives aimed at making the civil service more representative include outreach work with universities (especially the non-traditional, new universities) and community groups. There have been specific concerns about the numbers of black and Asian graduates entering the fast-stream. In response, the Cabinet Office sponsors an annual Civil Service Ethnic Minority Careers Fair to encourage more applications to the Service from under-represented groups. The Cabinet Office also sponsors a development programme to help ethnic minority graduates handle the fast-stream selection procedures. Furthermore, various community organisations receive sponsorship to raise the profile of the Civil Service and promote the Service as an open, inclusive and progressive employer. For example, the Cabinet Office sponsors www.Blackbritain.co.uk. This is a web-site for Black communities, which features recruitment details for jobs across all government departments.

The Cabinet Office is sponsoring a development programme called Pathways. This is aimed at providing ethnic minority staff with an opportunity to realise their potential and to prepare them for the Senior Civil Service. This is a two-year scheme combining training sessions and mentoring support. In terms of examples of action on gender issues, the Civil Service works in close partnership with Opportunity Now. This is an organisation that works with employers to realise the full potential of women at all levels and in all sectors of the workforce. Also, plans are underway to pilot a Job Share database to help the 60,000 people who have alternative work patterns and want to change jobs within the Civil Service. In addition, the Civil Service launched a programme called Elevator Partnerships. This is an informal mentoring scheme in which some of the most senior women in the Civil Service are paired up with more junior women for a year. The junior women are those who are seen as having potential for progression but who may have been overlooked for various reasons such as by being part-timers, having had career breaks or being specialists.

Moving on to the work on disability issues within the Civil Service. There is a general acknowledgement that progress on disability matters has been slower than that for women and ethnic minorities. The Cabinet Office is steering a number of interventions aimed at addressing this shortfall. This includes the following:

- Reviewing the Bursary Scheme for talented civil servants with a disability.
- Ongoing 'Workable in the Civil Service' programme designed to find work placements throughout the Civil Service for disabled graduates and undergraduates.

- Sponsorship of the recruitment newsletter 'Ready Willing and Able' and website www.readywillingable.net to raise awareness of career opportunities within the Civil Service for disabled people.
- Production of a Recruitment Guide describing best practice in recruiting disabled people.
- Production of a Reasonable Adjustments best practice guide for Civil Service departments.
- Development of a Code of Practice for Monitoring Disabled Staff to gather accurate data on the number of disabled staff currently working within the Civil Service.

In addition, two reports published in June 2001, 'Civil Service Diversity Survey' and 'Equality in Performance Review' highlighted particular concerns about the career deficit experienced by disabled people. Also, the paper, 'Disabled Staff in the Civil Service: Addressing the Career Deficit Challenge' noted that there is a significant career deficit in the Senior Civil Service but also at lower grades. A career deficit refers to a consistent under achieving in grading terms compared with non-disabled colleagues.

Most organisations seek to address similar career deficits by increasing the recruitment of underrepresented groups. This report argues that disability is different from other areas of equality in that the vast majority of disabled people in work become disabled during their working life. The report states that the career deficit experienced by disabled people is therefore best improved by more effective attendance management procedures which are aimed to retain, develop and improve opportunities for disabled people working in the Civil Service. The retention and career development of disabled Civil Servants will depend very much upon their level of satisfaction with regard to how their employer treats them. Low levels of satisfaction will lead to increased absenteeism and poor productivity that both contribute to increased ill-health retirement. Improved satisfaction will help disabled employees take greater responsibility for their own career development.

The report identifies a number of mechanisms available to improve the representation of disabled people in the Civil Service including:

- Project led recruitment as developed by Centrica and the Employers' Forum on Disability (this mainly involves pre job interview training).
- Secondments into higher-grade positions of disabled people (this might be attained by appointing suitable candidates who were 'pipped at the post' by a better candidate but could be appointed on trial basis).
- Head hunting of high-flying disabled people through executive search agencies (less easy than it sounds because effective networks are not in place).

(d) Departmental Diversity Action Plans

All government departments are required to have Diversity Action Plans that identify their diversity commitments. Most now do have diversity action plans - however basic - against which they are required to report back to the Cabinet Secretary via the Cabinet Office. The latter provides a central steer to departments on diversity implementation disseminates good practice and is responsible monitoring and gathering data on progress from the various government departments. Most departments now have a specific diversity and equality policy. Some also have

separate but related policies on harassment and bullying given that this was an issue of particular concern as identified through the Diversity Survey.

(e) Diversity Advocates

Diversity has been given a higher political profile. For example, in the UK Government there are Ministers with designated responsibility for Equal Opportunities, Women, Disabled People and Race Equality. Furthermore, the current Cabinet Secretary and Head of the Civil Service take an active interest in the implementation of the diversity agenda within the civil service. Formally, he makes six-monthly reports to the Prime Minister on progress being made on the Government's diversity commitments.

In terms of accountability at the administrative level, each Permanent Secretary is personally responsible for ensuring his or her department delivers fully on its diversity commitments. In addition, a number of new specialist posts and roles have been created in an attempt to help departments focus their ideas and channel their actions to deliver on the freshly laid out diversity management agenda. For example, various senior civil servants have now been given designated roles as Diversity Sponsors and Diversity Champions to spearhead the diversity work within and across departments.

(f) Diversity Objective-Setting in Forward Job Plans

All Civil Service managers (and in some departments this applies to all staff) are now required to have a specific diversity objective within their Annual Forward Job Plan. This requirement has presented a challenge for some parts of the Civil Service and the Cabinet Office is monitoring the approach being taken by different departments. Some Civil Service managers report that this presents yet an extra burden and are not adequately prepared to guide their staff on this requirement. Some departments have attempted to provide basic guidelines on what constitute 'good diversity objective-setting' and have provided briefing sessions. The assumption is that over time, line managers and staff will become more skilful at this and be able to set sharper, more relevant and more meaningful diversity objectives.

(g) Diversity Training Support

Diversity Awareness training for all managers is now mandatory. Specifically, all Civil Service departments were required to train their managers in diversity by November 2001. In order to monitor the progress being made in this area, the Cabinet Office has undertaken a Review of Departmental Diversity Training programmes. This shows that not all departments met the target.

The review also suggests that Civil Service departments are at different points of departure, targeting different audiences, delivering different content and using different delivery mechanisms. Some departments have seen diversity awareness training as part of the bigger change agenda. Some have integrated diversity training into existing development programmes. Some have provided tailor-made diversity training events. Some have only targeted middle managers, other all managers. Duration of training events ranges from half a day to five days. Many have used external consultants for the delivery; some have used internal training specialists. Delivery mechanisms used include distance learning materials, training videos, e-learning via the Intranet, interactive theatre and tutor-led sessions. On the

issue of expenditure, responses ranged from 'Don't Know' to £60-70 per person through to £120-150 per person.

(h) Networks and Support Groups

The Civil Service sponsors a number of diversity networks and support groups. This includes, for example, a civil service-wide network to provide a forum for dialogue on race equality issues across the civil service. It is also intended that this will act as a channel between senior managers and ethnic minority staff. The network - the Civil Service Race Equality Network (CS-REN) - is a new umbrella organisation set up by departmental race equality groups from across the civil service. The Cabinet Secretary and Head of the Civil Service have made himself Champion of this network which gives it much needed strategic links.

7.5. Other Diversity and Equality Initiatives

The Civil Service has introduced a range of additional diversity and equality initiatives. The following is only an indicative list (this is in addition to the various individual departmental initiatives):

- Work Life Balance initiatives.
- Opening-up more posts to direct recruitment at senior levels.
- An Interchange initiative to provide secondments for people from diverse background from other sectors.
- Peer Reviews of diversity programmes
- Diversity Benchmarking

Generally, whilst there is a high level of interest in diversity benchmarking, the actual level of uptake and extent of application is quite low. Furthermore, many of those working the diversity field within the Civil Service are unclear about which are the most appropriate models to use, and there is some concern about affordability and sustainability.

7.5.1. Racial Equality Standard

The UK Commission for Racial Equality has produced a benchmarking framework for promoting racial equality, Racial Equality Means Quality (Commission for Racial Equality 1995). The underlying premise of this framework is that quality management can be applied as a tool for encouraging racial equality to permeate throughout the organisation and all aspects of employment practice and service delivery (Speeden and Clarke 2000). Speeden and Clarke argue that racial discrimination tends to be seen as an issue for 'inner city' authorities and considered as 'unimportant' in areas where the 'ethnic minority' population is small. However, they argue that it is in such communities where discriminatory views remain uncontested and tend not to be discussed as part of the policy process (Speeden and Clarke 2000 p.95).

This framework represents serves as an acknowledgement that legal enforcement as a means of delivering anti-discrimination policy can be limited. Implementation of initiatives can be problematic as in the case of REMQ. It is based on the assumption that the organisations being encouraged to apply this framework have the capacity

and capability to make it work. The survey 'Measuring Up', published by the CRE (Clarke and Speeden 2000), showed that the overall take-up rate of the Race Equality standard was 57% of local authorities. The adoption of the standard was directly related to the presence of a significant minority ethnic population with a local authority area. The survey showed that a number of local authorities felt that it would be difficult to justify expenditure on expensive data-collection and monitoring procedures in areas where the ethnic minority population was small. The Measuring Up survey finds that there are significant differences between local authorities in terms of the emphasis given to racial equality within their corporate strategy. The survey also finds there is little understanding of the managerial and cultural changes that are necessary to bring about 'mainstreaming' (Speeden and Clarke 2000). There is concern that equality work is insufficiently mainstreamed - that is, integrated with the mainstream activities and processes of the organisation (EOC 1997). Mainstreaming as a principle and practice has become accepted as a tool for promoting equality and diversity

7.5.2. Equal Pay

UK Government figures suggest that an 18% gender pay gap still exists between men and women despite 30 years of equal pay legislation (Personnel Today 13 March 2001). The Equal Pay Task Force, a body set up to review the current situation and make recommendations for equalising pay identified the following barriers to closing the pay gap:

- A lack of awareness and understanding that there is a problem
- Ineffective and inefficient pay legislation
- Employers and unions that recognise there is a problem but do not know how to tackle it
- Secrecy about pay and pay systems
- Social, economic and labour market policies that miss opportunities to address the pay gap. (Source: Just Pay report 2001).

The Task Force made the following key recommendations:

- Raise the levels of awareness which involves action by the Equal Opportunities Commission and representational bodies such as trade unions
- Improve equal pay legislation, introducing a requirement on employers to conduct pay reviews and streamlining tribunal procedures
- Improve guidance for employers and unions and a government requirement for pay reviews in the public sector
- Open up discussion about pay, with reporting of pay reviews in employers' annual reports
- Invite the government to assess how policies such as the National Minimum Wage, the National Childcare Strategy and the National Skills agenda could help narrow the pay gap.

7.6. Diversity and Service Delivery

Diversity management can be seen as having an outward and an inward focus. Both need to take into account access issues and total service/employment experience issues. The inward focus concerns itself with employment and institutional issues, as

discussed in the previous section. The outward focus concerned with service delivery and facilitating greater social cohesion and integration within communities. Equality and diversity issues cut across all aspects of public service provision. This includes education, housing, employment, transport, leisure and recreation, the criminal justice system, the welfare system, issues of citizenship, and so on. Public service policy makers and those involved in delivery clearly need to have some appreciation of the ways in which issues of 'inclusion' and 'exclusion' are manifest across different service sectors if public service practice is to be truly 'joined-up' and meaningful. This needs to be underpinned by an understanding of the profiles of various communities, their settlement patterns, age profiles, language needs, cultural and religious practices, and so on, and any barriers they face in terms of access to and/or experience of specific public services.

To illustrate the complexity of this challenge, ethnic minority communities make up a significant proportion of the UK population and face specific challenges in terms of access to employment opportunities (Cabinet Office 2003). The report "Ethnic Minorities and the Labour Market" (Cabinet Office 2003) concludes that despite 40 years of anti-discrimination legislation, racial discrimination in the labour market still persists:

"In recent decades Britain has become a much more ethnically-diverse country. Some ethnic minority groups have done increasingly well, not only in the education system but also in the labour market. These changes have brought widespread benefits to the nation's culture, economy and society. Nevertheless, despite the marked progress made by some, too many members of ethnic minority communities are still being left behind. Even those individuals who achieve academic success do not necessarily reap the rewards in the workplace that their qualifications merit." (Foreword by the Prime Minister, Cabinet Office 2003 p.2)

Ethnic minorities currently make up 8% of the UK population but they tend to be clustered in Britain's major cities. Over 75% of ethnic minorities live in Greater London, the West Midlands, Yorkshire and Humber side, and the North West and Merseyside. Ethnic minorities have a younger age profile than the population as a whole and will account for half the growth in the working-age population over the next decade. Further, ethnic minority communities have differential access to education, housing and employment, and discrimination remains a feature of their experience.

Britain's ethnic minority communities are reported to have consistently experienced unemployment rates twice those of Whites (Leslie et al. 1998). Kirkton and Greene (2000) highlight that the picture is even more complex and argue that "labour market opportunities are mediated and constrained by gender, race, age, disability and sexual orientation, albeit in qualitatively different ways" (2000 p38).

On the issue of ethnic minority population and employment, the situation is made complex by the fact that currently there are wide variations in the labour market achievements of different ethnic minority groups. Indians and Chinese are, on average, doing well and often out-performing all other groups in schools and the labour market. However, members of other groups such as Pakistanis, Bangladeshis and Black Caribbean's experience, on average, significantly higher unemployment and lower earnings than other groups. The report suggest that this poses not only economic costs but also potential threats to social cohesion and that improving

performance in schools and in the labour market is a major priority for Government (Cabinet Office 2003 p.4).

The report expresses specific concern that all ethnic minority groups - even those achieving relative success such as the Indians and Chinese - are not doing as well as they should be given their education and other characteristics. Various reasons for this are given including the fact that ethnic minority groups can be concentrated in areas of deprivation which bring problems of poor public transport and isolation. However, the report also points to strong evidence that discrimination also plays a significant role. "Whilst equal opportunities legislation has had some success in combating overt discrimination and harassment, indirect discrimination, where policies or practices have the inadvertent result of systematically disadvantaging ethnic minorities, remains a problem" (p.7).

In terms of action to address these challenges, the report argues for a fresh approach that goes beyond traditional anti-discrimination policies to address the many factors that are barriers to success in jobs and careers, including targeted action on schools, jobs, housing and employment. For example, in terms of better understanding the experience of ethnic minorities and employment, factors such as employment levels, unemployment levels, occupational attainment/progression within the workplace, earning levels and levels of self-employment would need to be examined.

The report argues that economic integration is a vital part of broader social and civic integration and is likely to bring about a return in both economically and in terms of stronger social cohesion. The report's overall message is that Government policies and service delivery need to take account of these issues but recognise that there are differences between these communities in terms of their needs, experiences and problems:

"...it follows that Government can no longer apply the same policies across the board. Instead we need a much more fine-grained approach with interventions tailored to meeting the different needs of particular groups" (PM, Cabinet Office 2003 p.3).

As an attempt to better understand the needs and expectations of the various communities it serves, the UK Crown Prosecution Service (CPS) conducted a series of 'dialogue' events in 2001 involving policy makers and representatives of different agencies and voluntary sector groups working with local communities. The events focused on various diversity issues concerning disability, race, and domestic violence and identified recommendations for the future action by the CPS. This included developing support systems for disabled people, changing the way in which racist incidents are dealt with, and continuing community engagement. This serves as an example of inclusive, consultation based policy-making and service delivery.

7.7. Diversity Management: essential ingredients

The Rutherford and Ollenearnshaw (2002) report states that it is not length of time of implementation of diversity policies that produces successful outcomes. Rather, it is the extent of their integration in 'business' strategy.

The study identified a four-stage process of integration:

- Explicitly considering equality and diversity in overall objective-setting and business planning
- Using existing business processes for integration
- Measurement
- Accountability

Further, the study identified a number of factors that support the successful integration of diversity and equality in organisations. These include:

- Leadership - identified as a key factor in terms of policy initiation and implementation
- Corporate values - as a means of integrating diversity
- Role of the diversity function - issue of status and seniority of these roles
- Ongoing support - such as training as a means of spreading ownership, commitment and responsibility for diversity
- Full-scale integration and sustained action rather than piecemeal measures

The '*Advisory Panel on Equal Opportunities in the Senior Civil Service*' report confirms that the 'corporate values', culture and ethos of the Civil service remain a key obstacle to change. Despite various initiatives progress has been slow because "*such initiatives have tended not to be an integral part of mainstream management and personnel practice*" (p.2). Mainstreaming is about making sure that at every stage in the life of a policy or programme the potential impact on different groups of the population is actively considered and taken into account where necessary.

Also, the 1998 report "*Succeeding in the Civil service - a Question of Culture*" commissioned by the UK Cabinet Office set out to review the enablers and barriers to entry into the senior ranks of the Civil Service. This report states that of those surveyed only 25% feel that promotions are entirely based on merit and this figure falls to 10% for ethnic minority respondents. The study also suggests that there is still a strong perception that networking and patronage are too influential as factors in development and the current culture encourages those who are different to conform to the 'norms' in order to get on.

More generally, in order for diversity management practices to be effective they need to be set in the context of a number of basic 'good' organisational practices. To illustrate, the Watson Wyatt Human Capital Index (HCI) study states that there are specific 'human capital practices' that are related to performance and shareholder value (Watson Wyatt 2002). The study identifies 36 so-called 'human capital variables' (practices and policies) associated with better performance, which they report claims are globally consistent. These are grouped into six dimensions:

1. Clear Rewards and Accountability: practices such as paying above the market and effective performance management aligned to business goals, "Promoting the most competent people, terminating unacceptable workers , having an effective appraisal system, and improving poor performers are examples of successful performance alignment" (Watson Waytt 2002 p.10)
2. Recruiting and Retention Excellence: practices such as an effective recruiting process, a positive employer brand, focus on key skills retention and creating a secure environment.
3. Collegial, Flexible Workplace: such as employee input into how work gets done, higher trust in senior management, the total employee experience in the

workplace, and a lack of workplace hierarchy - "The total employee experience in the workplace is closely linked to the degree of involvement employees have in how their work gets done and the degree of flexibility they have in organising how they want to work" (Watson Wyatt 2002 p.14)

4. Communications Integrity: practices such as effective use of employee surveys, sharing strategy and financial data with employees and employee input into decision-making
5. Prudent Use of Resources: potentially draining practices include developmental training for career advancement, 360-degree feedback programmes, excessive paternalism and 'unintelligent' use of temporary employees.
6. Focused HR Technology: practices such as using technology to improve service and accuracy or to cut costs.

HR Function Effectiveness has also been identified as an important factor. This includes it being highly efficient, closely aligned with business needs, focused on strategic issues, measuring accurately the value to the business of what it is doing and prioritizing efforts accordingly. All of these dimensions, aimed at promoting better performance and a better return for shareholders, constitute sensible approaches that could also support diversity management principles and practice.

Further, diversity management is more likely to be effective responsibility for it is shared and not just seen as the 'chore' of the Human Resources or specialist diversity function. In this context, the UK Cabinet Office usefully identifies areas of responsibility for managers, individuals and the HR function (Cabinet Office 2003b p.5). For example, the Human Resources function is responsible developing and reviewing the Department's equality and diversity Action Plan, providing equality and diversity training and co-coordinating other activities such as childcare provision and the staff diversity networks and providing guidance to managers and individuals on diversity matters.

In summary, diversity management is good people management. Effective people management can lead to improved performance and better service delivery. Diversity management is not a single programme or a one-off intervention. If it is to be effectively implemented it needs to be developed as an integrated, ongoing set of management and organisational practices. This includes:

- A clear organisational diversity strategy
- Strong vision supported by a clear values statement
- Visible & consistent commitment from political leadership and senior managers
- Mainstreaming diversity into all policies & procedures
- A robust HR framework and practices
- Encouraging and facilitating a culture of learning

References

Cabinet Office (2003) Ethnic Minorities and the Labour Market: final report, March, Cabinet Office: London

Cabinet Office (2003b) The Race Equality Scheme for the Cabinet Office, June, Cabinet Office: London

Clarke, J. & Speeden, S. (2000) Measuring Up: report of a study of the adoption and implementation of the Commission for Racial Equality's Standard for Local Government.

Equal Opportunities Commission (1997) Mainstreaming Gender Equality in Local Government, EOC: Manchester

Kirkton, G. & Greene, A.M. (2000) The Dynamics of Managing Diversity: a critical approach, Butterworth-Heinemann: London

Leslie, D. et al. (eds) (1998) An Investigation of Racial Discrimination, Manchester University Press: Manchester pp.80-107.

Mant, A. (1995) "Changing Work Roles", in S. Tyson, (ed) Strategic Prospects for HRM, IPD: London pp.30-55

Martell, K. & Carroll, S.J. (1995) "Which Executive Human Resource Management Practices for the Top Management Team are Associated with Higher Firm Performance?", Human Resource Management, Winter, vol.34 no.4 pp.497-512

Maxwell, G.A. (2004) "Minority Report: taking the initiative in managing diversity at BBC Scotland", Employee Relations, vol.26 no.2 pp.182-202

Ospina, S. (2001) "Managing Diversity: a conceptual framework for public organizations", in UNDESA/IIAS Managing Diversity in the Civil Service, IOS: Amsterdam

Speeden, S. & Clarke, J. (2000) "Racial Equality as Quality: the standard in local government", Local Governance, vol.26 no.2 pp.95-100

Rutherford, S. & Ollereanshaw, S. (2002) The Business of Diversity: how organisations in the public and private sectors are integrating equality and diversity to enhance business performance, Schneider-Ross: Andover

Watson Wyatt (2002) Human Capital Index: European Survey report 2002, www.WatsonWyatt.com

Other Reference Material

Cox, T. (1993) Cultural Diversity in Organisations: theory research and practice, Berrett-Koehler: San Francisco, CA

McDougall, M. (1996) "Equal Opportunities versus Managing Diversity : another challenge for public sector management?", *The International Journal of Public Sector Management*, vol.9 no.5/6 pp.62-72

Netto, G. (2000) *Partners in Name Only?: the involvement of black/minority ethnic voluntary organisations in co-ordinated approaches to tackling racial harassment*, *Public Policy and Administration*, vol.15 no.3 Autumn pp.75-91

Pilkington, A. (2001) "Beyond Racial Dualism : racial disadvantage and ethnic diversity in the labour market", in M. Noon & E. Ogbonna (eds) *Equality, Diversity and Disadvantage in Employment*, Palgrave:Basingstoke, pp.172-89

Roosevelt Thomas, R. (1999) "Diversity Measurement; some measurement criteria", *Employment Relations Today*, vol.25 no.4 pp.49-62

Thomson, R. & Mabey, C. (1994) *Developing Human Resources*, Butterworth-Heinemann: Oxford

UNDESA-IIAS (2001) *Managing Diversity in the Civil Service*, IOS: Amsterdam

Chapter VIII

The Impact of HIV/AIDS on Public Sector Human Resources in Africa

Odette Ramsingh and Ogochukwu I. Nzewi*

8.1. Introduction

There continues to be global concern for the apparent relentless scourge of HIV/AIDS. In the last two decades the unleashing of the HIV/AIDS pandemic in Africa became yet another development challenge to a continent already plagued with a plethora of challenges going into the twenty first century. The peculiar political and socio-economic landscape of Africa with its tribal based wars, dictatorships and poverty makes this all the more challenging.

Africa is struggling to cope with the devastating impact of this pandemic on the functioning of its societies. There is an impending crisis projected in the macro economy of Africa. The AIDS/HIV pandemic also places heavy costs on business through increased medical aid claims, life and disability insurance, increased absenteeism due to ill health, funeral attendance or the need to care for the sick family members, loss of skilled workers and the increased cost of recruiting and training replacement workers, reduced job performance due to disability, etc¹⁶. It also impacts negatively on international competitiveness, deters domestic and foreign investment and is a potential threat to security in the region.

Southern Africa has been at the epicentre of the HIV/AIDS pandemic. By the end of 2002 it was estimated that HIV/AIDS had already claimed more than 1 million lives in a dozen or so countries in this part of Africa. This pandemic together with the food crisis in southern Africa is further deepening poverty and malnutrition.

However, it must be noted that within these visible shortcomings, there have been stirrings of engagement for change. Growing awareness and recognition of the need to tackle the pandemic is becoming more prominent. Countries such as Uganda and Senegal are held up as countries that may have turned the tide against this scourge.

This chapter looks at a management and practical way of repositioning the public service for the HIV/AIDS challenge. It offers, if you must, a management approach to identify and deal with the challenge in an inward and outward looking manner. I have approached the chapter from a human resource angle, based on the analysis of literature. It does not challenge the HIV/AIDS programmes and health plans of countries, except to the extent that those programs take a direct human resources

* Odette R. Ramsingh, B.A., LLB, MBA, is a senior manager in the South African Public Service and is currently reading for her PhD (Public Affairs) at the University of Pretoria.
Ogochukwu I. Nzenwi, B.A. MPA is an assistant lecturer at the University of Pretoria and is currently reading for her PhD (Public Affairs) at the University of Pretoria.

¹⁶ UNAIDS: Turning a crisis into an opportunity: Strategies for Scaling Up the National Response to the HIV/AIDS Pandemic in Lesotho. 2003 p 206

thrust. This does not mean that policies and legislation that provide foundation for the mitigation of the HR risk will not be looked at.

The management of HIV/AIDS in the work place, whether in the public or private sectors, is essentially a human resource management activity. It affects human resource practitioners through their responsibilities of establishing and maintaining HIV/AIDS programmes / strategies and also impacts on the human resource management responsibilities of line function managers in the execution of their day to day managerial tasks.

It is important to mention at this introductory stage, that this chapter will greatly focus on the South African public service. As co-author of this chapter, I am a senior manager within the South African public service and interact very closely with it. While this bias is acknowledged, it should not be misconstrued that this chapter is premised on an official position, or on my official service capacity. This position as a public servant gives me the opportunity to be at the coalface of a challenging time, to be able to influence policy of our time and to look back and say I too walked that path.

The reason, however, for focusing on South Africa is certainly not implausible as South Africa is regarded as a leader in Africa's economic and political development. Other African countries will be brought in as platforms for comparative scrutiny of the South African interventions in terms of HIV/AIDS in the continent. Such comparisons will also be instrumental in understanding the challenges, drawing the lessons learnt and developing a regional strategy.

The chapter will plot a course for the HR approach by examining demographic backgrounds and various national responses to HIV/AIDS, especially as it relates to legislation, which gives lawful grounds for policies and programs. It will also examine the general work place strategies in terms of HIV/AIDS and particular public service HR strategies, and where these exist, the assessment of implementation.

The chapter's response to the key questions raised should assist in addressing:

- Challenges and the various ways to confront the loss of human resources in the public sector
- Address lessons learnt from the continent
- Identify possible strategies which may help countries and the public sector to face such a daunting problem

Ultimately, there should be a deeper understanding of the situation, learning must have taken place, and there should be a structuring of debate where attitudes and perceptions are continuously tested and changed.

In terms of the availability of statistical data on HR impact of HIV/AIDS in the public service in Africa, there seems to be little available and reliable data. This may directly or indirectly be linked to the still existing stigma and discrimination in the work place. Whatever the case, statistics will be provided as a reflection on issues and not necessarily for analytical purposes.

Data on HIV/AIDS initiatives in the work place in African countries tends not to be readily available. The lack of monitoring and evaluation of programmes and

strategies further did not allow an informed critique of such programmes and strategies.

8.2. The HIV/AIDS Challenge

The devastation that disease alone has caused on Africa is underrated. For instance, Malaria is seen as having impacted on Africa by slowing economic growth by between 1.3% and 2.6% a year.¹⁷ This paper presupposes that the challenge of HIV/AIDS in Africa can only be dealt with if Africa internalizes HIV/AIDS as an infectious disease crisis, especially when it is on record as being the continent with the highest HIV/AIDS infections. In other words the HIV/AIDS problem has to be identified and defined as what it is and not on perceived and unfounded premise. In arguing for this as a foundation for interventions, it is observed that societal labels and views on diseases can affect the actions and outcomes in tackling some diseases.¹⁸ A case in point being the crusade of Thomas Parran, the US Surgeon General under President Roosevelt to demystify syphilis and address it as a public health problem rather than as a moral issue.¹⁹

More than fifty years later, the emergence of HIV/AIDS, and the moral issues it raises have also raised the platform in terms of government engagement with the disease. Some authors argue that as yet some approaches to HIV/AIDS in Africa are poorly structured to the crisis because it has not yet been identified and dealt with as an infectious disease crisis.²⁰ That is to say, the issue of prioritization is vital. This will involve political commitment, normalizing or mainstreaming HIV/AIDS into governance and leadership and government institutions, structures and systems. Subsequent discussions will also deal with responses, which can be construed as indicative of the primacy of HIV/AIDS in governance and leadership consciousness.

This section has attempted to establish the need for reorientation of perceptions and the prioritizing of this pandemic as well as its integration into the very fabrics of nation building as a precursor to this discussion. Examining some micro and macro concerns will approach the challenges of HIV/AIDS in the African public service. First, an examination of Africa's peculiar challenges in confronting the pandemic will be looked at, and then the challenges in the micro environment of work place human resources will follow.

There is little doubt as to the challenges that Africa faces in the present world milieu. This especially true as Africa has suffered more than others from not being integrated into the world economy. Not too long ago the international political and economic balance tended towards a dependency theorist tilt of Keynesian,²¹ views of protectionist theories, harnessed by national subordination of poor countries and exploitation by rich nations. However, with the emergence of new economies of the East (Asian Tigers), models of regional integration for global relevance have begun to emerge. Growth triangles of ASEAN countries²² have created state initiative and private entrepreneurship in countries like Malaysia, Indonesia and Singapore. These eastern trends have further set the pace for the internalization of the need for

¹⁷ Zuma: 2003 cited in IDASA UNDP 2003

¹⁸ Kevin De Cock et al: 2002, *The Lancet* p. 67

¹⁹ Ibid

²⁰ op cit

²¹ Andress 2002:4; Amsden 2003:33

²² Ravenhill John. 2001. *APEC and the construction of Pacific Regionalism*. United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press.

"collective self reliance".²³ These developments only go to mirror the image of the decrepitude of the African scenario. For instance 34 of the world's least developed countries are in Africa, the aggravation of poverty continues with about 300 million Africans living on less than US\$1 a day.²⁴

While there is a need for a global response to Africa's crisis developments such as wars, and the devastation of disease, it is premised in this discourse that despite global support and interventions, a total commitment to fighting Africa's problems can be best broached by Africans themselves. This is because, Africans are in the unique position to philosophically and ideally face problems given their own peculiar social and political environment. The HIV/AIDS crisis will therefore require an approach, where prioritization and ownership of the HIV/AIDS pandemic becomes a reality in Africa. This will however, not take away the genuine economic, social/cultural and political challenges that will always pose a barrier to progress in combating the HIV/AIDS pandemic. Some of these are unpackaged subsequently.

8.3. Good Governance and Political imperatives

The beginning of the twenty first century brought African leaders into a new alliance for change. Conceived and gestated over a period of three years, the OAU metamorphosed into the AU at the Durban Summit of 2002. In a quest to be part of a rapidly globalizing world, the African Union moved from a political organization aimed at independence of member states (in terms of it's forerunner), to an organization aimed at the socio economic integration and development of Africa for political unity.

The issue of leadership in Africa is still a volatile and unpredictable one. Whereas growth and development is largely a factor of the political will of leaders to engage with core development drives, African leadership is still grappling with dictatorships, coups and attempted coups and inconsistencies. The NEPAD initiative is premised on an approach of good governance, regional integration and development as the bridge to entering the world economy as a significant and equal player.²⁵ One major route to achieving this goal of good governance for Africa will be the African Peer Review Mechanism (APRM), which is Africa's "own instrument for sharing experiences, promoting mutual learning and fostering adoption of good governance and successful development practices."²⁶ The UNDP Zimbabwe Human Development report ²⁷defined good governance as ensuring *"that political, social and economic priorities are based on broad consensus in society and that the voice of the poorest and the most vulnerable are heard in decision-making over the allocation of resources"*.

The Human Development Report of SADC provides five separate dimensions as basis to good governance, i.e. political, institutional, economic, and social dimensions, as well as gender.²⁸ It is also plausible that to achieve success in upholding these precepts there is a need for a healthy life, good information and educational systems

²³ Laszlo Ervin, Krtzman Joel and Bhattacharya AK. 1981. RCDC (regional cooperation among developing countries: the new imperative of development in the 1980s. New York: Pergamon Press. p 16

²⁴ NEPAD 2002. Annual report : towards Claiming the 21st century. p25

²⁵ Ibid, p 3

²⁶ po cit p 11

²⁷ cited in Idasa/UNDP. 2003. Aids and governance in Southern Africa: emerging theories and perspectives. IDASA/UNDP. p 2

²⁸ ibid

and the access of all peoples to national resources. In the light of this, Africa's epidemiological terrain in terms of HIV/AIDS shows that the devastation of AIDS, both future and present should be factored into issues of governance and development. This is so because despite having 10% of the world's population, epidemiological demographic shows that in 2001 Africa accounted for over two-thirds of the world's people living with HIV/AIDS.²⁹

It is therefore curiously interesting that a new thrust in giving context and meaning to "good governance" was unveiled by the Institute for Democracy in South Africa (IDASA) at the Southern African regional governance and AIDS forum. This new model indicated that HIV/AIDS analyses and responses should be located with the realm of good governance.³⁰ This archetype gives new meaning to the definition of and indicators for good governance, in which HIV/AIDS is viewed as being within the ambit of what is considered good governance. It is also a relevant pointer to the importance of national prioritization.

Sensitizing African political and business leaders on the need for prioritization of HIV/AIDS issues seems to be a tedious endeavour. National response to the pandemic still remains vague and ambiguous, especially in terms of legislation and policy. This will be discussed subsequently. In Nigeria for instance, political parties did not endorse HIV/AIDS as no party reflected HIV/AIDS related issues in their manifestos or the urgency of tackling the matter.³¹ This can be a considerable setback in national response when considering the sustainability of HIV/AIDS interventions. In South Africa's private sector, there seems to be a new trend in measured at shifting the burden of HIV/AIDS economic implications.³² While this should not be misconstrued as lack of leadership commitment, it reflects some of the underlying concerns that political and business leaderships face in dealing with the virus and the reluctance for full engagement with the disease.

To elaborate further, the slow pace of national interventions especially in the area of legislation casts a shadow on the level of commitment of leadership and national governments to engage with the pandemic, when laws that should be a guide to policies and programmes are not in place. For instance UNAIDS reports that about 40% of countries including half the countries in sub-Saharan Africa have not yet adopted anti-discriminatory legislation to protect people living with HIV/AIDS.

8.3.1. Mainstreaming HIV/AIDS

Mainstreaming will involve adopting HIV/AIDS related issues into the strategic, operational or programmatic planning or policies of all sector structures and institutions in the short, medium and long term as well as in the day to day running of organisations and sectors. Mainstreaming HIV/AIDS will also entail a multi-sectoral approach to the pandemic. Already some countries like Nigeria (HIV/AIDS Emergency Action Plan: 2001)³³ Uganda (National AIDS Strategic Framework:

²⁹ Kevin De Cock et al 2002. Shadow on the Continent: public health and HIV/AIDS in Africa in the 21st century in the Lancet. Vol 360.p 68

³⁰ Idasa/ UNDP op cit p 1

³¹ Jerome Onome Mafeni and. Oluwole A. Fajemisin 2003 HIV/AIDS in Nigeria, situation response and prospects: key issues . Policy Project, Nigeria p 4

³² Sydney Rosen and Jonathan Simon 2003, Shifting the burden: the private sector's response to the AIDS epidemic in Africa. 81 (2) p131.

³³ Federal Republic of Nigeria: National Action Committee on AIDS 2001; HIV/AIDS emergency Action Plan as cited in Jerome Onome Mafeni and. Oluwole A. Fajemisin 2003

1998)³⁴, Malawi (National AIDS Strategic Framework for HIV/AIDS: 2000-2004),³⁵ have policies, which aim at adopting a multi-sectoral approach with partnerships across the board from civil society, religious organisations, businesses and non-governmental organisations. However, the weaknesses in monitoring and evaluation of the implementation of these policies and the dearth in reliable data and research on the nature and impacts of these interventions have resulted in inadequate assessment of how mainstreamed HIV/AIDS is in the public and private sectors.

8.3.2. Co-ordination of national responses

There are needful questions, which pose a challenge to this concept of mainstreaming that must be answered for effectively mainstreaming HIV/AIDS into all sectors. What will be the relationships between the various sectors? How best can these partnerships be managed and what will be the best management approach? What will be the institutional and human capacities needed to manage the technical skills and planning tools needed for such an approach? What will be the implementation structures for multi sectoral policies? In other words, how will government co-ordinate this multisectoral web of interactions?

The Ugandan HIV/AIDS partnership³⁶ has a multisectoral model hinged at the co-ordination of the various sector programmes with a broad representation of all possible stakeholders from the international community to PLWHA organisations, the private sector, international and national NGOs and faith based organisations to the public sector. To manage this technical working co-ordination entity effectively the partnership structured itself into a partnership committee, a set of self co-ordinating committees, a partnership forum and a partnership fund.

However, the challenge of co-ordination and implementation in terms of the structural challenges are still rife. For instance in Nigeria the national co-ordinating body the National Action Committee on AIDS (NACA), is situated in the Presidency,³⁷ while in Malawi, the National AIDS Control Programme (NACP) operates from the Ministry of Health and Population.³⁸ In Nigeria the non-definition of roles between the Federal Health Ministry and the NACAP brings up structural challenges in implementation. For instance, confusion in roles in Nigeria has resulted in a stale mate in passing the bill for a statutory body to co-ordinate the country's response due to multiple and duplicated bills from the NACA and the Federal Ministry of Health. However, whether, the institutional placement of the Malawian NACP makes for better administration of the multisectoral approach cannot be determined as there are no identifiable impact and effectiveness indicators and clear monitoring and evaluation mechanisms.

³⁴ Uganda: National HIV/AIDS strategic framework 1998.

³⁵ Government of Malawi: The National Strategic Framework for HIV/AIDS 2000- 2004.

³⁶ Uganda: Terms of Reference for the Ugandan HIV/AIDS Partnership 2002. p 1

³⁷ Jerome Onome Mafeni and Oluwole A. Fajemisin 2003 HIV/AIDS in Nigeria, situation response and prospects: key issues. Policy Project, Nigeria p 12

³⁸ Government of Malawi: The National Strategic Framework for HIV/AIDS 2000- 2004.

8.3.3. Sustainability and Financial infrastructure

Financing in Uganda, Malawi and Nigeria is still largely based on donors and bilateral and multilateral development partners. In Malawi for instance it is estimated that 95% of funding for HIV/AIDS is largely from donors.³⁹ It will be largely unrealistic to expect the government to fund the heavy costs associated with HIV/AIDS interventions. However, internal financing arrangements and agreements have also to be explored. Difficulties in appropriating HIV/AIDS activities in budgetary submissions make this all the more challenging.

Other challenges to tackling HIV/AIDS and its impact in the public service holistically will have to do with the general poor infrastructural levels in the countries, issues of poor public health care systems, especially when approached as an infectious disease emergency which will require a public health model of VCT, PMTCT, and prophylaxis. The near chaotic state of primary health care in Africa put enormous pressure on the response capacity and capabilities of African countries. This makes core HIV/AIDS clinical interventions like free and accessible Sexually Transmitted Disease (STD) treatments, voluntary counseling and testing a basic struggle. Institution capacity to tackle the epidemic is also a serious consideration as is the absence of clear monitoring and evaluation mechanisms for policies.

8.4. The Human Resource Challenge

HIV/AIDS is a development problem. The estimations of the impact of the pandemic in terms of its toll on human capital are adverse. The uniqueness of HIV/AIDS in terms of its main mode of transmission makes it more volatile than other diseases like Malaria and even the deadly Ebola virus. This deadly silent mode of transmission through sex as well as its long spanned incubation also exposes more people to the disease over time. For instance, it is estimated that in most affected countries, half of all 15 year olds alive will eventually die of the disease, even if infection rates go down in the next few years.⁴⁰

The impact of HIV/AIDS from a human resource perspective has both policy as well as capacity challenges. Appropriate human resource strategies must be developed by human resource management components whilst human resource capacity in crucial areas of service delivery will have to be maintained.

The rising threat of HIV/AIDS on Africa's work force has been one of concern to government and employers of labor. In South Africa for instance it is estimated that about 5.3 million South Africans were HIV positive by the end of 2002, and increase from the comparable estimate of 4.74 million in 2001.⁴¹ ILO fact sheets⁴² surmises that in Malawi between the years 1990 and 2000, deaths among public service workers increased ten fold, as a result, unfilled vacancies in national ministries of education, health, agriculture and water development stand at over 50%. There have been ideally a number of descriptive and explorative studies that have been done which give us a fair estimation on statistics on the socio-economic impact of HIV/AIDS in the work force due to ill health and death. There is no doubt as to the magnitude of the problem that faces Africa in terms of the pandemic, however, the

³⁹ *ibid*

⁴⁰ Abdoulie Janneh 2001 How UNDP sees AIDS in Africa, in AIDS/AFRICA July/ August 2001 Issue 398

⁴¹ AIDS policy research center: 2002

⁴² www.ilo.org/public

problem that faces Africa will be the issue of how to engage with the pandemic, to mitigate the risks involved. A few issues deserve particular attention.

8.4.1. The Public Service

All over the world, the public service is perceived as the biggest employer of labor. Africa's peculiar political and economic landscape lends to this fact. With little foreign direct investment, weak infrastructural and capital base to support big and small businesses, the private sector remains the secondary employer of labor. South Africa's public service employs about 1,037 million public servants in approximately 140 government departments at national and provincial level.⁴³

The public service is hinged on its position as the backbone of state administration. It is responsible for the implementation of the legislative, judicial and executive mandates of government. Globalization has catalyzed the adoption of changes and reform strategies, which are prevalent in parts of the developing world, like the neo-liberal paradigm of the New Public Management.⁴⁴ Moving and embracing a rapidly globalizing world for Africa will entail the capacitating of public officials through the acquisition of skills and knowledge.

In a recent Commonwealth technical workshop on reducing the impact of HIV/AIDS on human resources in the public sector in Nairobi in 2002, Michael Gillibrand of the Commonwealth Secretariat's Governance and Institutional Development Division (GIDD) stated that, " Almost all the current HIV/AIDS programs concentrate on public health aspects of the pandemic, with little or no attention paid to the implication of the loss of national human resources, in particular to the capacities of the public sector to deliver essential services. ⁴⁵The implication of this is the threat to the sustainability of essential public services. This loss of capacity may also impact negatively on Africa in achieving the United Nation's millennium development goals, such as poverty eradication, improvement in maternal health and reduction in child mortality. These are targets, which have been already identified as a challenge according to NEPAD due to other factors such as poverty.⁴⁶

8.4.2. Infection rates in the public service: perceptions of facts

According to a report by the Department of Social Development and the Center for the Study of AIDS, University of Pretoria, it is estimated that just over 10% of South African public servants may currently be living with HIV/AIDS. Rates of infection among managerial and supervisory staff are projected to reach 10% by 2005. In terms of the report it is possible that up to 25% of public servants may have died of HIV/AIDS by 2012.⁴⁷

The infection rates in the public service should be seen in the context of the population that it serves. Various figures have been published regarding the infection rate in South Africa. Debate continues on the accuracy of these figures. In order to illustrate the seriousness of the infection rate in South Africa, however, the following figures are quoted from a report by the AIDS Policy Research Center at the University of California San Francisco, published in June 2002:

⁴³ *Department of Public Service and Administration, South African Public Service: 2004*

⁴⁴ Common 1998:440

⁴⁵ *Guyana Chronicle June 12 2002*

⁴⁶ *NEPAD annual report 2002 24*

⁴⁷ *Population, HIV/AIDS and Development: A resource document, p 59*

- "UNAIDS estimated that at the end of 2001, HIV prevalence among adults ages 15 to 49 was 20.1 percent. Commissioned by the Nelson Mandela Foundation and conducted by South Africa's Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC), the survey found 11.4 percent of South Africans were living with HIV/AIDS at the end of 2002.
- The South African Health Department estimated that 5.3 million South Africans were HIV-positive at the end of 2002, an increase from the comparable 2001 estimate of 4.74 million.
- The 2002 HSRC national survey estimated that 4.5 million South Africans were living with HIV/AIDS at the end of 2002.
- Researchers from the University of Cape Town's Centre for Actuarial Research put this figure at 6.6 million."⁴⁸

It is clear therefore that South Africa like most of sub-Saharan Africa is faced with a huge challenge in dealing with the impact of HIV/AIDS. The main burden in dealing with the impact of HIV/AIDS will fall on the South African Public Service. In order for the Public Service to be successful, the impact of the pandemic on its own employees will have to be managed.

8.4.3. Some service delivery challenges

The domain of the public service encompasses the administration of policies and the delivery of services. It is generally understood that the demand for services is never commensurate with the available resources, hence the development and implementation of policies aimed at bringing quality service delivery to the most number of people at the least cost possible. This mandate demands a high level of technical and management skills. Add this to the dynamism of the world as well as the rapid rate of globalization, which has brought in its wake considerable paradigm shifts that surround the study, and practice of public administration.

Most relevant are reforms that center on policy and service delivery, hinged especially to the growing pressure on governments for a more efficient human resource base and service delivery outcomes. As a result, development in the public service domain has given rise to numerous reforms associated with the generic administration functions and service delivery strategies. The problem here however, is that the overall toll of HIV/AIDS on the work force will bring more burden on the capacities and finances of states than ever before. Some core service delivery areas that may hold detrimental potentials to overall development are summarized.

(a) Housing

Providing housing to the population remains one of the main challenges facing the public service. Planning for the secure housing of young people displaced from their families as a result of HIV/AIDS is essential. The impact of HIV/AIDS in the housing sector may specifically be evident in a reduction of laborers and artisans.

⁴⁸ HIV/AIDS in South Africa, 2002, p.5

(b) Education

The Education sector is in the unique position of providing training to all public servants, and even the private sector and is often the largest employer in government.⁴⁹ This ability to maintain bureaucratic support and administrative structures will be affected as employees get ill and die. The pandemic will most certainly have an impact on teachers and therefore also on the manner in which schools are able to function and the quality of the education. HIV/AIDS will also have an impact on the lives of learners and their ability to learn.

The main challenges facing the Education sector are as follows:

- Ensuring that school children remain uninfected as they grow up.
- Protecting the quality and quantity of education in the face of teacher mortality, absenteeism and supply shortages.⁵⁰

(c) Health

As with other departments, the Department of Health will have to deal with the fundamental question of how to maintain the quality of health services, cope with increasing demands placed by HIV/AIDS and simultaneously deal with the loss of staff. The Department is already experiencing greater demands due to HIV/AIDS. The challenge is to meet these demands whilst not compromising services provided to people with other illnesses and needs.⁵¹

(d) Criminal Justice

A major challenge will be to ensure that visible policing is maintained. Crime rates may increase and the pressure on the criminal justice system will have to be managed in the face of staff losses to the pandemic.

(e) Agriculture

The Agriculture sector is faced with a number of challenges emanating from human resource losses to the pandemic:

- The ability to maintain adequate food supplies for all sectors of the population.
- The provision of food support for home-based care projects and child-headed households.
- The protections of agricultural labor and land rights.⁵²

8.4.4. Human Resource Policy Challenge

The impact of reductions in the economically active population of African countries will have to be managed by employers. HIV/AIDS in the workplace can only be appropriately managed if human resource management strategies and capacity are put in place. From a human resource management perspective it is important that

⁴⁹ National Academy of public Administration/USAID 2003

⁵⁰ Population, HIV/AIDS and Development: A resource document, p 70

⁵¹ Population, HIV/AIDS and Development: A resource document, p 71

⁵² Population, HIV/AIDS and Development: A resource document, p 73

AIDS education and prevention programmes must receive solid and sustained support and become more rigorous and strategic. Active and ongoing management support is therefore required.

In highly unionized public services it would be beneficial from a Human Resource perspective if partnerships with unions could be forged in order to develop a common vision of how to address the impact of HIV/AIDS on employees.

A core responsibility of human resource practitioners is the development of HIV/AIDS policies and programmes. These policies must be critically evaluated on a regular basis. In order for this to be achieved, sufficient human resource practitioners possessing appropriate skills must be in place.⁵³

Departments / agencies in the public service do not function in isolation. Transfers between departments / agencies are commonplace and departments depend on each other in meeting their service delivery mandates. Human resource strategies focusing on HIV/AIDS can therefore not be managed in isolation. High-level coordination of human resource activities is required if HIV/AIDS strategies are to succeed.

8.4.5. The human resource management dilemma

Research on the impact of HIV/AIDS on the broader processes of government is quite recent.⁵⁴ Despite this, there has been reasonable growth in research on the impact and management of HIV/AIDS in the private sector. It is suggested that based on the multi sectoral model which implies partnerships, some best practices from the private sector in establishing a comprehensive AIDS management program can set the tone for engagement in the public sector.

Despite the concrete differences in goals in the public and private sector, one core commonality is the importance of matching policy outcomes to policy objectives and the human resource capacity needed to achieve this. Research trends on HIV/AIDS impact in the work force focus largely on the economic impacts of the disease in relation to disease progression.⁵⁵ Needless to say, although most scholars focus on the economics of disease progression, the costs of the impact of HIV/AIDS should also be measured in psychological as well as socio-political terms, like the delivery of government services to the people.⁵⁶

Moreover, in the domain of the public service the economic impact of HIV/AIDS is not far removed from costs to service delivery and the management of public institutions. For instance it is presupposed that disease progression and eventual death may greatly undermine the technical and administrative support base needed for optimum implementation, monitoring and evaluation of government policy in Africa. Although these are still mostly presuppositions since there is no concrete research to support these assertions, such hypothetical stance should not be taken lightly. The practical workplace challenges will be described in the following

⁵³ Managing HIV/AIDS in the Workplace, 2002, p. 17

⁵⁴ Mattes in IDASA/UNPD 2003:77

⁵⁵ Whiteside and Sunter 2000: 98; Rosen et al 2000:300

⁵⁶ AIDS /AFRICA: 2001

paragraphs and they are related to the disease progression in HIV/AIDS, which is staged in four phases:

- Infection stage
- The incubation years
- The HIV morbidity years
- Death

The period from infection to illness and death is an important factor to consider in terms of management interventions. It is believed that the incubation period in the West will be of about 10 years, while in Africa it is estimated to be between six to eight years.⁵⁷ With anti retroviral treatment and good nutrition among other factors, life expectancy is expected to increase. With these issues in mind one will dare to suggest that a well administered intervention by management in the work place which targets these stages in disease progression is necessary in developing an HIV/AIDS operational plan along with prevention programs.

Based on these broad areas of disease progression, the impact of HIV/AIDS on the public service will result in the following practical challenges:

(a) Morbidity and absenteeism

Infected employees will utilize more sick leave resulting in disruptions within their work environments. Increases in deaths will lead to increased absenteeism as employees attend funerals for family members, friends and colleagues.

(b) Mortality or retirement

The loss of an employee requires an appropriate replacement to be appointed and trained.

(c) Staff morale

The fear of infection and death with resulting increased suspicion of others as well as resistance to take on additional responsibilities for sick colleagues may have a negative effect on staff morale.

(d) Costs

The public service will feel the impact of increased financial implications in terms of employee benefits.⁵⁸

(e) Providing services in remote areas

Services in remote areas and disadvantaged communities will be vulnerable to absenteeism or deaths among staff due to shortages of skilled staff and resource constraints.

⁵⁷ Whiteside and Sunter 2000:9

⁵⁸ Managing HIV/AIDS in the Workplace, 2002, p. 15

8.5. Response strategies

Strategies will be discussed by first looking at some broad based national interventions based on legislations and policies, with an elaboration of the South African context. Response will then be narrowed down to strategies that impact directly of human resources management. Two areas of focus will be the Employee Assistance Programmes (EPA) and the subject of mentoring.

8.5.1. National Response to HIV /AIDS: Legislative and policy overview

The first policy intervention in Nigeria was adopted in 1997 under the Ministry of Health with a focus largely based on prevention. It, however, took the country four years to initiate an HIV/AIDS Emergency Action Plan (HEAP) in 2001. The action plan had two broad goals: the creation of an enabling environment for HIV/AIDS interventions and an intervention to control the spread, that is to say prevention (National Action Committee on AIDS 2001; HIV/AIDS emergency Action Plan). When Nigeria was still recording its first official HIV/AIDS case in 1986, the Ugandan experience indicates an earlier involvement in the fight against HIV/AIDS in the 1986 inauguration of the National AIDS Control Program (NACP). Later in the 1990s Uganda adopted a multi-sectoral approach with the Uganda AIDS Commission in 1992 and the National HIV/AIDS strategic framework in 1998. Malawi's fight against AIDS began earnestly with the publishing of its national strategic framework for HIV/AIDS in 1999 and the National AIDS control program. Finally, one major challenge that Nigeria faces in its fight against HIV/AIDS is that of late timing. The country's beginning intervention is but a few years old, today there are over 3.5 million Nigerians living with the virus. This is a far cry from Uganda although Malawi's governmental intervention is still recent.

The UNAIDS progress report indicated that about 40 percent of countries, including half of countries in sub-Saharan Africa, have not yet adopted anti-discriminatory legislation to protect people. There is no legislation on HIV/AIDS in Nigeria. Despite ad hoc committees in parliament on HIV/AIDS, no bill has been passed yet. However in 2003, the 1997 policy was reviewed with a more comprehensive and multi sectoral approach to interventions. This policy becomes the framework for developing specific sectoral policies, in terms of prevention, care and support for people living with and affected by HIV/AIDS and HIV/AIDS impact mitigation through treatment programmes and rights and legislations along this line.⁵⁹ The Federal Ministry of Health also signed a tripartite agreement with labor unions and employers of labor to negotiate an HIV/AIDS work place policy, hopefully to be launched in 2004. In 2001, Malawi issued a comprehensive policy in HIV/AIDS in the work place, aimed at protection of rights of workers, detailed guidelines and confidentiality, as well as benefits and dismissal grievances. Although Uganda has succeeded in reducing its prevalence rate to 5%, there is no coherent policy or law that protects PLWA in the work force. Almost twenty years since government's first intervention, PLWAs still suffer discrimination.

In South Africa, the National Minister for Public Service and Administration through the Department of Public Service and Administration is responsible for the formulation of human resource management policy directives, including those dealing with employee assistance programmes. Recognising the impact of HIV/AIDS on South Africa and the Public Service, the Minister initiated an Impact and Action

⁵⁹ Federal Government of Nigeria 2003. The National HIV/AIDS Policy

Project in January 2000, which is aimed at ensuring that the Public Service is able to sustain a quality service in spite of the progression of the AIDS pandemic.

In consultation with stakeholders the Department of Public Service and Administration has developed a policy framework to guide departments on the minimum requirements to effectively manage HIV/AIDS in the workplace and to ensure a co-coordinated Public Service response. To give effect to this policy framework the Minister has amended the Public Service Regulations, 2001, to ensure the proper management of HIV/AIDS in the workplace. The policy framework is aimed at ensuring that the working environment supports effective and efficient service delivery, while as far as reasonably possible, taking employees' personal circumstances, including disability, HIV/AIDS and other health conditions into account.

South Africa like in other African countries, such as Nigeria '(National Action Committee on AIDS: NACA) and Malawi (National AIDS control Programme NACP), has various structures/bodies that have been established to coordinate the response to HIV/AIDS. The South African National AIDS Council is the highest HIV/AIDS advisory body set up to, amongst others, advise government HIV/AIDS/STD policy, advocate the involvement of sectors and organizations in implementing programmes and strategies and to recommend appropriate research. There is also the Interdepartmental Committee on HIV/AIDS. This committee of national department representatives was established in 1998 and meets monthly. Its goals include the development of HIV/AIDS workplace policies and programmes in all departments, advocating for the allocation of financial resources to HIV/AIDS, and capacity building and support amongst departments. Finally, the Provincial HIV/AIDS structures bring together representatives from provincial departments to support the development of integrated HIV/AIDS policies and programmes.⁶⁰

The enactment of laws and legislations creates an enabling environment for HIV/AIDS interventions from all sectors. It is upon these laws that sector relevant policies that govern a whole management approach to HIV/AIDS in the work place can thrive.

8.5.2. The public service response

Given the challenges and the expected impact of HIV/AIDS on the public service, the following approach has been adopted in the South African public service:

- Various government HIV/AIDS structures have been established to manage the response to HIV/AIDS. These structures fulfil different functions aimed at building an effective Public Service HIV/AIDS workplace response.
- National policy setting minimum requirements to be met by Government Departments/Agencies has been formulated and regulated.
- Guidelines have been developed at national level to assist Departments/Agencies to implement in-house programmes and policies to manage the impact of HIV/AIDS.

⁶⁰ Managing HIV/AIDS in the Workplace, 2002, p. 28 – 30

- Individual Departments are putting in place policies and programmes in line with the national norms and standards.

8.5.3. Human resources response strategy

A multi-sectoral approach is presumed to be associated with cross sectional partnerships. There have been successful management programs in the private sector that can be introduced into the public sector as best practices. In Africa, programmes like the Comprehensive AIDS management programme of Debswana Diamond Company in Botswana,⁶¹ and the Shire Bus lines in Malawi⁶² stand out. These interventions included comprehensive work place policy and collective bargaining agreements with employees to enforce key aspects of policy and treatment. Best practices from the private sector can be introduced to the public sector. The comprehensive AIDS management programmes like that of Debswana Diamond Company in Botswana is a point in case.

Rosen and Simon suggest that a model for basic management response strategies in the private sector can be on three major fronts, namely:

- Prevent new infections;
- Avoid or reduce the cost associated with existing and future infections; and
- Provide treatment and support for infected employees to extend their productive working lives and thus postpone the costs of infection.⁶³

Although the authors deal with HIV prevention and treatment programmes in business from the productive investment perspectives for business, this discourse will take it further to use two of these strategic responses as a model for managing the HIV/AIDS human resources challenge in the public sector. The focus will be on strategies based on bullets 1 and 3, above. To motivate this stand point, the second strategy as acknowledged by the authors themselves, is predicted as a possible future option for businesses so it will not be considered in the representation that is to follow. The following table attempts to present the interactions of management engagement using the two strategic responses for the already highlighted stages of disease progression to manage some of its impacts.

⁶¹ National Academy of Public Administration/USAID: 2003

⁶² University of California San Francisco: 2003

⁶³ Rosen et al 2000:300

Disease progression	Impact on human resources	Strategic Response 1&2
Employee is infected	No impact at this stage	1. Prevent new infections: Voluntary counseling and Testing VCT; awareness programmes (e.g. condom distribution, issues on stigma and human rights)
Incubation Years	No significant impact at this stage	1. Prevent new infections: Awareness: nutrition, condom distribution, issues on stigma and human rights.
HIV/AIDS related sickness and morbidity	Absenteeism, low staff morale, reduced performance, attention of human resources on employee assistance programmes	2. Provide treatment and support for sick employees: Employee Assistance Programmes (EAP); treatment
Death	Loss of skill base; low performance, new recruit	

Adapted from Whiteside and Sunter 2000

Stigma and discrimination attached to the disease still hampers effectiveness at the infection stage. Early intervention strategies to prevent infections and possibly extend incubation periods through awareness on safer sex and nutrition are thus sometimes compromised. One of the main objectives of interventions at the morbidity stage is to prolong life, through treatment of opportunistic infections, nutrition. Rosen and Simon argue that interventions to prolong life, amongst other things, reduce the impact on the morale, motivation and concentration of the rest of the workforce having colleagues fall sick.⁶⁴ It also creates more time to develop other strategies like normalizing mentoring, training replacement employees and managing the resultant loss of work force skills.

For the purposes of this chapter attention will be paid to the response based on treatment and support. In particular the Employee Assistance Programme and mentoring to address the loss of skills and institutional memory will be discussed.

⁶⁴ Rosen et al 2000:303

8.6. Employee assistance programmes (EAPs)

Cases of trauma such as HIV/AIDS infection are dealt with in many institutions, both in the public and private sectors, through Employee Assistance Programmes (EAPs). These programmes are supported or informed by HIV/AIDS programmes and policies. According to an article in Life Support, dated 28 January 2002, the terrorist attacks on New York and Washington, resulted in a greatly increased workload and prominent visibility for EAPs. EAP practitioners in the two cities, worked day and night for weeks providing grief support and trauma management services. The article indicated that the incidents of 11 September reinforced the value of having an EAP with strong trauma response capabilities, not only in the case of a major disaster, but also on a daily basis.⁶⁵

8.6.1. Definition of employee assistance programmes

According to the constitution of the Employee Assistance Professional Association of South Africa (EAPA), the EAP is defined as follows:

“A worksite-based programme designed to assist in the identification and resolution of productivity problems associated with employees impaired by personal concerns, including, but not limited to, health, marital, family, financial, alcohol, drug, legal, emotional, stress, or other personal concerns which may adversely affect employee job performance.”

EAPs deliver comprehensive, quality services to three target groups: the organization as a whole, supervisors, worker organization representatives, employees and their family members.

According to the EAPA, the specific core activities of EAPs include the following:

- Consultation and training to appropriate persons in the identification and resolution of job performance issues related to employees personal concerns and difficulties.
- Confidential, appropriate, relevant and timely problem assessment services.
- Appropriate and relevant referrals for diagnosis, treatment and assistance.
- The formation of linkages between the work-site EAP, community resources and individual practitioners who provide such services.
- Follow-up services for employees who utilize the services.

An article by Stanford Mamoshito Malatji in the SA Labour Bulletin of December 2000, indicate that the aim of EAP's is to develop South Africa's productive capacity by preventing the impact of such political, social and economic malaise on the individual, the organization and the economy.⁶⁶

⁶⁵ Life Support, 28 January 2002

⁶⁶ SA Labour Bulletin, December 2000

8.6.2. The need for Employee Assistance Professional Associations (EAP)

The problems experienced by the individual has serious consequences on the organization as it can manifest itself through disruptive behaviours, including increased absenteeism, tardiness, poor productivity and decision-making, damage to equipment, safety violations, increased attitude and behavioural difficulties, poor interpersonal relationships, family alienation, increased stress, and financial problems.

A factor, which has increasingly influenced the well being of employees and the economic viability of organizations, is the impact of HIV/AIDS. HIV/AIDS is a pandemic that has infected and affected all organizations in South Africa. Infected employees are constantly falling ill, which results in increasing numbers of absenteeism and loss of staff in the workplace. Infected and affected employees become non-productive as a result of a number of factors, such as depression, low morale and self-esteem. HIV/AIDS also poses threat to a healthy economic development in South Africa.

Other social factors, which have a negative impact on the economic growth of organizations, are factors such as excessive substance and alcohol consumption and abuse. Research has shown that employees that are substance or alcohol dependent could cost an extra quarter of his or her salary per year in terms of absenteeism, occupational accidents, and loss of productivity. Another factor that has serious economic influence on organizations is sexual and racial harassment in the workplace. Research has indicated that 76% of South African career women have been subjected to some form of sexual harassment in the workplace and most indicated that they would rather resign than make an issue out of it.

EAP's became popular in the United States in the 1950's as a tool for employers to assess employee problems arising from alcohol abuse and to provide a referral system for appropriate counselling and/or treatment. While alcohol-related problems may be the factor that instigated the development of EAP's, the programmes today, focus on assisting employees to deal with personal problems that may have a negative impact on their work performance, such as those mentioned above. It is a tool used by employers to deal in a practical way with employee problems. EAP's can assist the employer in reducing overhead costs through increased attendance and boosting morale and motivation. EAPs serve to improve the general health and well-being of employees, providing employers with a competitive edge in retaining and recruiting suitable employees. Some EAP interventions and strategies are reactive, addressing troubled employees. Other EAP's are proactive, offering education, life-skills training, promotion and awareness to ensure the prevention of problems.

In establishing an EAP policy, the following should serve as guidelines:

- The EAP should focus on proactive intervention involving preventive measures, which seek to eliminate the cause(s) of the problem(s).
- Participation should be voluntary.
- Senior management should openly support the introduction and operation of the EAP.
- The organization should ensure that it is convenient for employees to use the EAP because it is recognized that this is the only way in which optimum uptake can be attained.

- It should be company policy to ensure confidentiality for those using the EAP. Employees should feel comfortable in acknowledging their problems and seeking assistance.
- The EAP should be used both for treating existing employee problems and as an educational tool, such as health promotion to help prevent particular problems arising.

8.6.3. Succession planning

In order to inform human resource planning in a department it is necessary to obtain estimates of how many employees are infected and will become infected, when they will fall ill, what care they will need and when they will die. Making these conclusions is not easy but employers do collect vast amounts of data regarding their employees which can be used as starting point. These include sick leave, early retirements for health reasons, death in service and staff turnover.⁶⁷

Having established the impact on the organization, departments can start planning on how to ensure appropriate succession. In conducting succession planning departments:

- Determine what employee movement needs to occur.
- Focus on the management and development efforts of key employees.
- Links the human resource plan with the strategic and business plan.
- Forecasts the recruitment needs of the future.⁶⁸

8.6.4. Mentoring

A strategy often used in succession planning is mentoring which is in many cases accompanied with the fast-tracking of employees. Mentoring is a tool that organizations can use to nurture and grow their people. It can be an informal practice or a formal program. Protégés observe, question, and explore. Mentors demonstrate, explain and model. The mentor's job is to promote intentional learning, which includes capacity building through methods such as instructing, coaching, providing experiences, modelling and advising.⁶⁹

Having established where crucial succession interventions need to be put in place, departments can initiate mentorship programmes to prepare selected employees and new recruits for their future roles.

8.6.5. Regulating the Human Resource Management Response

The public service consists of various departments or agencies. The need to coordinate a response to HIV/AIDS has already been discussed. In the South African public service the National Minister for Public Service and Administration has issued regulations that provide the framework for departmental responses to HIV/AIDS. In brief, the regulations prescribe the following:

- Identifying and dealing with occupations where employees are at higher risk to be infected.

⁶⁷ Managing HIV/AIDS in the Workplace, 2002, p. 58

⁶⁸ www.developingexecutives.com

⁶⁹ www.emt.org/userfiles/Resources/MentoringProgOperationsManual

- Non-discrimination in the workplace.
- How to deal with HIV-testing.
- Confidentiality and disclosure.
- The establishment of HIV/AIDS programmes including health promotion programmes.
- The establishment of monitoring and evaluation mechanisms.

To assist with the implementation of the South African Public Service Regulations, the Department of Public Service and Administration has developed a Guide which provides practical guidance and information on how departments should respond to the threat of HIV/AIDS in the workplace and as such the Guide complements the Regulations. In essence the Guide is expected to assist departments in planning, developing, implementing and monitoring and evaluating workplace HIV/AIDS policies and programmes. In brief the Guide provides for the following:

- Principles are laid down to guide a workplace response to HIV/AIDS.
- Introducing HIV/AIDS policy and planning.
- Guidance on the establishment of human resources, structures and partnerships to ensure effective HIV/AIDS response.
- The development of HIV/AIDS workplace policies and programmes.
- The development of HIV/AIDS and STI prevention programmes.
- Treatment, care and support to infected and affected employees.
- Capacity building within departments.
- Successful communication strategies.
- Monitoring and evaluation of programmes.

8.7. Lessons Learned From the African Experience

In concluding taking a broad look at some of the core fundamental areas for improvement in adopting a strategy for engagement will be necessary. Africa's approach as already highlighted has to be unique, with a broad based foundation of ownership of this unique crisis. These lessons should be a stepping stone for adopting change management strategies for reorientation in the African experience.

The most important lesson learned from the South African experience is that Government (and therefore the ruling party) must understand the full scope of the problem posed by HIV/AIDS for the Public Service. In the case of South Africa, Government at an early stage started to grapple with the impact of HIV/AIDS in the public service and therefore was in a position to direct the public service's response through national policy and guidelines. In implementing this policy, the following came to the fore as issues that impact on the success of the HIV/AIDS strategy:

8.7.1. Need for a coordinated approach

A decentralized public service as large as that of South Africa requires strong coordination and leadership from national government if a success is to be made of implementing strategies to effectively deal with the impact of HIV/AIDS. As in many areas of Africa, large portions of South Africa are underdeveloped and Government is faced with major challenges in dealing with poverty alleviation, infrastructure development and job creation. To compound this problem, provincial administrations in many instances do not have the skills and resources to meet these challenges.

Within the area of human resource management capacity problems are prevalent in many provincial departments. Employee assistance programmes are not necessarily accorded the same attention as basic personnel administration matters. A strong national framework with guidelines assists such departments in overcoming the capacity problems that may exist.

8.7.2. Need for continuous monitoring and evaluation

The continuous monitoring and evaluation of the implementation of programmes to deal with the impact of HIV/AIDS is important for the following reasons:

- Despite national policy initiatives and guidelines, departments may still be experiencing problems with implementation issues. Monitoring and evaluation will allow strategic intervention where required.
- National as well as departmental policies and programmes may contain deficiencies that will only be identified through thorough monitoring and evaluation.

As part of the monitoring and evaluation of HIV/AIDS programmes, a rapid assessment of HIV/AIDS programmes in the South African Public Service was done during July 2003 for the Interdepartmental Committee on HIV/AIDS. The focus of the assessment was national government departments. The survey found the following:

- Strong departmental awareness programmes were evident accompanied by strong male condom distribution programmes.
- Voluntary counselling and testing programmes as well as care and support programmes were insufficiently established.
- Peer education programmes have been established in less than half of the departments involved.
- Whilst employee assistance programmes have been established in 78% of the departments involved, the proactive involvement and leadership of persons living with HIV/AIDS remains problematic.
- Only 44% of the departments involved reported that they have HIV/AIDS related services available to the family members of their staff whilst 37% report that they are involved with outreach work to the community.
- Only 50% of the departments involve have a dedicated budget allocation for HIV/AIDS programmes.⁷⁰

The findings in respect of national departments suggest that the regulations and guidelines issued by the Minister and Department for Public Service and Administration are being used as a basis for programme development and implementation. The slow progress made with the implementation of the programmes and in achieving full compliance with the Regulations is of concern.

What is more of concern, however, is the fact that the survey did not include provincial departments. The results of monitoring and evaluation exercises involving human resource practices have clearly indicated that provincial response to national policy initiatives have traditionally been a lot slower and more ineffective. Taking

⁷⁰ Rapid Assessment of Departmental HIV/AIDS Programmes, 2003, pp 3 – 5

into consideration the fact that 70% of public servants are employed in the provinces and the slow progress at national level, serious questions could be raised about the readiness of the Public Service to deal with the impact of HIV/AIDS.

The Public Service Commission has activated a project to investigate the implementation of HIV/AIDS programmes and employee assistance programmes across the Public Service. The results of this project should provide more definitive answers to these questions and also allow a more in depth critique of the national policy initiatives that have been put in place.

During a Public Service HIV/AIDS Indaba participants identified the following as the major challenges that had to be overcome to ensure effective implementation of HIV/AIDS programmes:

- There must be a higher level of buy-in from management.
- HIV/AIDS co-ordinators and committees should be more committed.
- There should be increased budget allocation to HIV/AIDS programmes.
- Stronger awareness and interest should be created in Human Resource divisions.⁷¹

The results of the project of the Public Service Commission should indicate what additional challenges must be addressed.

8.7.3. Linking of HIV/AIDS workplace programmes with HIV/AIDS and STI prevention programmes

An effective strategy to deal with the impact of HIV/AIDS in the workplace is to extend workplace programmes beyond merely planning for succession and providing employee assistance. The South African experience has shown that HIV/AIDS prevention campaigns are an important if not compulsory element in establishing an effective HIV/AIDS strategy.

8.7.4 Budgeting for the impact of HIV/AIDS

Many challenges are facing managers in dealing with the costs of HIV/AIDS. Posts have to be created for coordinators, programmes have to be funded and the indirect costs of HIV/AIDS have to be provided for. If not appropriately accommodated in the formal budget, HIV/AIDS initiatives may simply not receive the attention it deserves. This was clearly illustrated by the snap survey conducted at national departments in the South African public service.

8.7.5. Getting management on board

An unfortunate tendency amongst management is to ignore human resource management issues and to rather only focus on line function activities. In order to effectively deal with HIV/AIDS in the workplace, the buy-in of top management into the objectives and requirements of programmes is an absolute requirement.

⁷¹ Public Service HIV/AIDS Indaba Report, 2003, p 22

8.8. Recommendations

The strategy that I will propose in this Chapter emanate to a large extent from the lessons that have already been learned. The Guidelines developed for the South African public service serves as a further point of departure. Circumstances at the political and administrative levels differ from country and the extent and format in which the proposed strategy could be applied will therefore also differ.

(a) Establishing a governing framework for a response to HIV/AIDS

The need for a coordinated approach to deal with the impact of HIV/AIDS has been discussed at length in the Chapter. In establishing a governing framework the following should be given attention.

(i) A number of international guidelines have been developed to guide the response of governments to HIV/AIDS. These include:

- The UNAIDS HIV/AIDS and Human Rights International Guidelines (1998).
- The SADC Code of Good Practice on HIV/AIDS and Employment (1997).
- The ILO Code of Practice on HIV/AIDS and the World of Work (2001).

(ii) Laws of the country involved

Each country should possess a legal framework that guides the HIV/AIDS response of employers in the country. In South Africa, for example, HIV/AIDS strategies are informed by the Constitution, 1996, Labour Legislation, Equity Legislation and Legislation regulating medical schemes. In many instances guidelines and policies are issued to supplement these Laws. In the South African context for example, a Code of Good Practice on Key Aspects of HIV/AIDS and Employment was attached to both the Labour and Equity Legislation.

(iii) Public Service Legislation and policy

The South African legislative and policy framework was discussed at length in this Chapter. Establishing such a framework that obligates individual departments to act is of utmost importance. It plays a further important role of ensuring that minimum standards are laid down and abided by.

(iv) Supplementing legislation with guidelines and best practice

Individual departments may not have capacity to implement the frameworks laid down by regulations and other forms of national policy. Providing guidelines that supplement national legislation and policy therefore plays an important role in accommodating capacity problems. In addition it ensures that departmental specific responses to HIV/AIDS are not unnecessarily delayed. Governments in need of a framework for such guidelines could contact the South African Ministry for Public Service and Administration. The Guidelines are also available electronically at the following web address: www.dpsa.gov.za.

(b) Establishing a workplace HIV/AIDS policy

Establishing a policy on HIV/AIDS provides a sound framework within which all responses can be situated. In developing such a policy relevant information must be taken into consideration such as:

- Minimum standards laid down by law.
- Leading practices.
- Technical expertise for legal advice.⁷²

The workplace policy should provide for matters such as:

- Non-discrimination.
- HIV testing.
- Confidentiality.
- Workplace Health and Safety.
- Workplace programmes focusing on education and awareness, prevention programmes and programmes to promote openness, acceptance and care for affected employees.
- Roles and responsibilities should be clearly indicated.
- Applying a monitoring and evaluation strategy.⁷³

(c) Conducting impact assessments

In order to inform human resource planning in a department it is necessary to obtain estimates of how many employees are infected and will become infected, when they will fall ill, what care they will need and when they will die. Making these conclusions is not easy but employers do collect vast amounts of data regarding their employees, which can be used as starting point. These include sick leave, early retirements for health reasons, deaths in service and staff turnover.⁷⁴

(d) Planning and budgeting

Departments need to determine at an early stage what resources are required (human and financial) to implement their HIV/AIDS programmes. Detailed costing should be done of the implications of the programmes and be included in departments' medium and long term strategic planning and budgeting processes. Both direct costs (awareness campaigns, increased benefits, and increased recruitment) and indirect costs (reduction in productivity, absenteeism, and workplace moral) should be taken into consideration.

(e) HIV/AIDS monitoring and evaluation

Thee benefits of monitoring and evaluation HIV/AIDS programmes have been discussed in detail in this chapter. Clear indicators must be formulated that will allow effective monitoring and evaluation. These indicators include time-frames, targets and goals.

⁷² Managing HIV/AIDS in the Workplace, 2002, p. 50

⁷³ Managing HIV/AIDS in the Workplace, 2002, p. 52

⁷⁴ Managing HIV/AIDS in the Workplace, 2002, p. 58

8.9. Concluding remarks

Having traced the plethora of challenges that confront Africa, and having mapped out certain possible routes to engaging with the pandemic, it must be stressed that while none of these targets for engagement are new, what is emphatic in the approach of this chapter is to bring forward the issues of African ownership for the solution of its challenges and its peculiar environment. It should be acknowledged at this juncture that although the African continent has made strides towards tighter regional integration and self help, she is a long way from the beginnings of change.

In proposing a human resource response, this chapter focused closely on the Employee Assistance Programme (EAP) due to its unique reflection of the spirit of Africanness (Ubuntu), working together for change.

Africans should not forget therefore their early thriving communities based on traditional values of brotherhood and enduring cultures incomparable to any in the world. This is one approach that will reduce stigma, as well as create a sense of ownership especially as Africa moves from the era of the infected to the affected. This is not to say that core strategic thinking in curbing the tide of deaths and infections will not need a comprehensive approach, one that involves all sectors and all tangents of the disease. Moreover, while recognizing strategies that will mitigate the impact of HIV/AIDS in the workplace, a holistic picture for engagement indicates that poverty and food shortages, gender based discrimination imbedded in various African indigenous cultures, as well as limited access to basic education are still some of the core challenges that will need ongoing interventions in Africa.

Finally, the philosophical undertone of this conclusion is intended to place value along side solutions. This means that while the search for solutions continues, where possible those African traditional values that define the African fighting spirit should be encouraged to rise above the fear and trepidation in any challenge. It is hoped that this chapter has served to stimulate African minds to the need to fully put our resources and our sense of oneness to deal with this pandemic.

References

Books

Laszlo Evin, Krtzman Joel and Bhattacharya AK, 1981. *RCDC (regional cooperation among developing countries: the new imperative of development in the 1980's*. New York: Pergamon Press.

Ravenhill John. 2001. *APEC and the construction of Pacific Regionalism*. United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press.

Whiteside Alan and Sunter Clem 2000. *Aids the challenge for South Africa*. Cape Town: Human and Rousseau (Pty) Ltd and Tafelberg Publishers Ltd.

Government Publications

Federal Government of Nigeria 2003. The National HIV/AIDS Policy.

Federal Republic of Nigeria: National Action Committee on AIDS 2001, HIV/AIDS emergency Action Plan.

Garbus, L 2002 *HIV/AIDS in South Africa*, AIDS Policy Research Center, University of California San Francisco

Grant, KB, Strode, A and Smart R. 2002. *Managing HIV/AIDS in the Workplace*, South Africa: Department of Public Service and Administration

Government of Malawi 2000. The National Strategic Framework for HIV/AIDS 2000-2004

Government of Uganda. 1998. National HIV/AIDS strategic framework.

Government of Uganda. 2002. *Terms of Reference for Ugandan HIV/AIDS Partnership*.

Personnel Policies and Procedures. 2002. *The Law in Perspective Graphite HRM Ltd*

Republic of South Africa. 1999. *Standards for Employee Assistance Programmes in South Africa*. Standards Committee of EAPA-SA

Websites

<http://www.gov.za/yearbook/2004/landpeople.htm>

Reports

IDASA/UNDP. 2003. *Aids and governance in Southern Africa: Emerging theories and perspectives*. IDASA/UNDP regional governance and AIDS forum April 2-4 2003.

Jerome Onome Mafeni and Oluwole A Fajemisin. 2003. *HIV/AIDS in Nigeria, situation response and prospects: Key issues*. Nigeria: Policy Project.

Krigge N; Ntule, NH, Shikweni, F; Demana D; Allen, D. 2003. *Rapid Assessment of Departmental HIV/AIDS Programmes*.

National Academy of Public Administration/USAID. 2003. *Mitigating HIV/AIDS impacts on the Civil Service and Teachers in sub-Saharan Africa, issue overview and Strategy layout*.

NEPAD. 2002. *Annual report: Towards claiming the 21st century*. South Africa: NEPAD

Republic of South Africa. 2003. *Population HIV/AIDS and Development: A resource document*, Department of Social Development.

Republic of South Africa. 2004. *Report on the Public Service AIDS Indaba III*, January Department of Public Service and Administration.

Sophy Monico Tanga et al. 2001 Uganda HIV/AIDS related discrimination and stigmatization and denial. UNAIDS best practice collection.

University of California San Francisco 2003 *Country AIDS Policy Analysis Project*.

Scholastica S Kimaryo et al. 2003 *Turning a crisis into an opportunity: Strategies for Scaling Up the National Response to the HIV/AIDS Pandemic in Lesotho*. A publication of the partnership of the Government of Lesotho and the Expanded Theme Group on HIV/AIDS.

Articles

Abdoulie Janneh. 2001. 'How UNDP sees AIDS in Africa', in AIDS/AFRICA July/August 2001 Issue 398

Common Richard. 1998. 'Convergence and transfer: a review of globalisation of New Public Management' in *International Journal of Public Sector Management*. 11:6; pp 440-450

Global trends in Employee Assistance Programmes in Life Support, 28 January 2002

Kevin De Cock et al. 2002 'Shadow on the Continent: public health and HIV/AIDS in Africa in the 21st century' in *the Lancet*. Vol 360. p 68

Stanford Mamoshito Malathi. 2000. 'Employee Assistance Programmes: Building South Africa's productive capacity' in *SA Labour Bulletin* Volume 24 Number 6 of December 2000

Sydney Rosen and Johathan Simon. 2003. 'Shifting the burden: Private sector's response to the AIDS epidemic in Africa' in *Bulletin of the World Health Organisation* 81(2) p 131.

Government Regulations

Republic of South Africa. 2001. *Public Service Regulations* Part VI.E and F

Newspaper Articles: *Guyana Chronicle* June 12 20
